Storia e Futuro

RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE

n. 57 giugno 2023

History

历史

Future

未来

Storia e Futuro

RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE

n. 57 giugno 2023

Bologna
University Press

Storia e Futuro
Rivista di storia e storiografia online

n. 57, giugno 2023

ISSN: 2283-8937
DOI: 10.30682/sef5723
ISBN online: 979-12-5477-359-8
Registrato con il numero 7163 presso il Tribunale di Bologna in data 3/10/2001

Copertina: *moneta con iscrizione Chong Ning Tong Bao*, 1102-06, The MET, OA API, public-domain.

Progetto grafico e impaginazione: Design People (Bologna)

Publisher
Fondazione Bologna University Press
Via Saragozza, 10
40123 Bologna (Italy)
tel.: +39 051 232882
fax: +39 051 221019

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

SAGGI - ed. by Michael Shiyung Liu

LABORATORIO

PERCORSI

DIDATTICA

SCAFFALE

SAGGI

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGIES TRANSFORMED CHINA

La scienza e le tecnologie che hanno trasformato la Cina

Michael Shiyung Liu

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723a

Abstract

This special issue intends to investigate the transformation and adjustments of technological application and modernization in contemporary China from historical angles. This issue is primarily concerned with the disruption caused by the impacts of western science to traditional Chinese society and culture. Finally, this special issue aims to rebut the western-centric experience and form a global view of the history of science and technology with new approaches.

Questo numero monografico si propone di indagare, da un punto di vista storico, le interazioni tra la progressiva diffusione della tecnologia applicata e il processo di modernizzazione della Cina contemporanea. In particolare, si vogliono analizzare le perturbazioni causate dagli impatti della scienza occidentale sulla società e sulla cultura tradizionali cinesi. Infine, il tentativo è quello di confutare la prospettiva occidentalo-centrica per provare a costruire, utilizzando nuovi approcci, una visione globale della storia della scienza e della tecnologia.

Keywords: science and technology, modernization, modernity, medicine, traditional medicine, China.
Scienza e tecnologia, modernizzazione, modernità, medicina, medicina tradizionale, Cina.

Michael Shiyung Liu is Distinguished Professor in Shanghai Jiao Tong University and an affiliate of the Asian Studies Center, University of Pittsburgh, USA. He formerly worked in Academia Sinica, Taiwan. He publishes on the history of modern medicine in East Asia, Japanese colonial medicine, and East Asian environmental history. He wrote Prescribing Colonization: The Role of Medical Practice and Policy in Japan-Ruled Taiwan. His latest work on modern medicine in East Asian societies (in Chinese) will be published by the end of 2023. E-mail: liumike@sjtu.edu.cn.

Michael Shiyung Liu *è Distinguished Professor presso l'Università Jiao Tong di Shanghai e affiliato al Centro di Studi Asiatici dell'Università di Pittsburgh, USA. In precedenza ha lavorato presso l'Academia Sinica di Taiwan. Le sue pubblicazioni riguardano la storia della medicina moderna in Asia orientale, la medicina coloniale giapponese e la storia ambientale dell'Asia orientale. È autore di Prescribing Colonization: The Role of Medical Practice and Policy in Japan-Ruled Taiwan. Il suo ultimo lavoro sulla medicina moderna nelle società dell'Asia orientale (in cinese) sarà pubblicato entro la fine del 2023. E-mail: liumike@sjtu.edu.cn.*

It is known from history that the development of science and technology is part of modernization schemes to many non-western countries. Especially to the Chinese since late Qing periods of the 19th century, the history of modernization is in essence a history of scientific and technological progress. To generations of Chinese under the ideas of modernization, scientific discoveries and technological inventions have brought about new civilizations, modern industries, and the rise and fall of national fates. Countries like China before mid-20th century that have been late with industrialization can, on the one hand, use the results already available in the West and, on the other, being creative to engage scientific knowledge and technological innovations with their traditional legacies.

In the field of science and technology, the process of modernization intensified institutional reform, restructure governmentality, rationally allocate public resources, and enhance educational capability. However, at early stages of catch-up modernization in China, the main problem is to master foreign practices and its successful solution, as a rule, creates a basis for transfer to a ripe western-like society, smoothly applied new knowledge, and participates on equal terms in international technology exchange. In this issue, four contributors offer academic debates on Chinese modernization of traditional Chinese medicine, communication technologies, and maritime services of meteorology from historical perspectives. The authors from both sides of the Taiwan Strait, under a lively academic atmosphere, where curiosity-driven exploration is illuminated various forms of modernity in Chinese schemes of modernization. They again leave many questions along with answers to respond a century-long issues: What was modernization and modernity to modern China?

Modernization and modernity in this special issue

Science has no boundaries. China's endeavors in science and technology need to be more integrated with those of the world, and the world needs a China that is vibrant and able to deliver more in science and technology. Just as collisions generate sparks, exchange and communication enrich imagination and creativity. The above process was often called "modernization" or *xiandaihua* in Chinese (Guo Yanmei 2001, 22-23). Moreover, to encourage the learning and application of science and technologies among the general public, socio-political leaders need to embrace a scientific culture by promoting scientific rationality while cherishing Chinese cultural heritage. To the promoters, enlightened by science, the rich and profound Chinese culture is bound to shine more gloriously. That is modernity or *xiandaixing* in Chinese (Huang Xingtao 2005, 128-136), a respective result of modernization.

The uses and definitions of modernization and modernity constantly illuminated how Chinese was optimistic to the introduction of science and technologies for centuries. However, in western academic circles, modernization, is seen to be a concept derived mostly from, the classical texts of sociology, especially the works of Marx Weber (Whimster, Weber 1980, 361-362). To Chinese definition of modernization, they expect certain steps which together can produce wealth and fortune. Steps which can make everything ready, ranging from goods and resources; to the progress in making labor ready and rapid to serve the centralized political power (Finlayson 2005, 2). Like the Chinese in 20th century, the European used to believe that modernization emerged as a physical process, which left its effect on Western Europe. Early historians also believed that modernization significantly moved outward to bring in other parts of the world, in late 19th and early 20th centuries (Lihehan 2009, 10).

Importantly, these modernization processes did not happen in a uniform manner; in terms of geographical space and social relations, in the framework of a specific social group. This implies that the effect of modernization during the two centuries was not even. Wenxin Xu's article "Scoping Coast Meteorological Service in Chinese Maritime Service" clearly reveals that modernization of maritime services, meteorology in her case-study experienced different rates and kinds of modernization, around the same time when an advanced western technology was inserted to traditional China.

Xu vividly portrayed the introduction of meteorology to fulfill the mission of maritime services, a western institution was specially built by Qing government for its modernization scheme. From the 1840s onwards, with the signing of a series of diplomatic treaties, the Qing Dynasty opened up the coastal and river ports for trade one after another, and as a result, people and ships from Western countries began to enter China on a large scale. However, with a large north-south span, a long coastline, foggy springs, frequent typhoons in summer and autumn, and cold air in winter, China's coastal areas are among the most complex in the world in terms of navigational conditions. To ensure safe navigation, how to deal with weather disasters at sea was one of the main concerns of the time. The most notable of these was the meteorological network established by Chinese Maritime Customs Service (CMCS), linking China's coasts and the world. The network was characterized by both scientific and practical benefits, as it not only accumulated data from East Asia for the development of meteorological science, but also greatly safeguarded the safety of navigation and the smooth running of trade. In sum, Xu states that through the interaction and cooperation of the various institutions around surrounding areas, Chinese Customs had demonstrated its vast organizational and cooperative capabilities, thus gradually established a meteorological service system with both scientific and practical benefits. During this process, the Customs accumulated a large amount of meteorological data, which not only greatly guaranteed the safety of navigation, but also provided great help for the study of historical meteorology in East Asia. The system formed a complex network: from weather data to weather information to human society, thus linking nature, science, technology and human society. In the process, we can see the Customs as a government agency, its diversity, and its work with scientific institutions to promote the cause of navigation and meteorology in the middle and late 19th century to the early 20th century.

Wenxin Xu successfully revels the process of modernization, implied the positive impacts of introducing western advanced technologies and related science. To think deeper indeed, the complicated relationship between modernization and modernity should be taken into further consideration. Marshall Berman has considered modernity as branch of experience which is special to each person, or awareness that occurred due to a confrontation with the maelstrom caused by modernization. There is a special state or quality at the personal or social level triggered by modernization; that modernity sees of the people who witnessed or went through sharp uprisings. The state of modernity for Berman is of its particular traits. According to him, modern life has its own specific environment, with very different features that strongly belong to itself and not similar to those of the traditional ways of life (Linehan 2009, 11). On the other hand, Matthews Steven argues that the emergence of the modernity was not independent but it was mainly based on history (Mariwan Nasradeen Hasan Barzinji 2013, 47). In his research notes on changing history and impacts of communication in China, Enchao Yong cleverly colored the transformation of communication form in long Chinese history with several unique features of Chinese society and its cultural-politics.

Unlike others who may treat "communication" as an unidentified nor clear concept, Yong immediately defines that communication is about space and time, sending messages across space, consuming time and impacting the human society. He continuously states that communication in China had its unique tradition, differed from the well-known Europa story. Corrodingly to its vast territory, dense population, and socio-political diversity, communication was crucial to link villages, towns and cities while the location of the emperor centered. To its political goals, communication would help the emperor reach every single corner within the Empire. Messengers on foot or driving chariots or riding horses could only deliver the orders step by step. The Empire could endure? It was common and reasonable that the Empire would construct sophisticated communication network to maintain its ruling, while officers would like to take advantages of the same network to deliver their own letters, thus damaged the efficiency of the network, eventually draw the network and the Empire to collapse. Indeed, the rise and fall of ancient Chinese Em-

pires were closely linked with communication network. Every dynasty developed their own pattern of communication methods, and tried to maintain an Empire last forever.
After reviewed the long history of communication in China, Yong indicates that the arrival of British gunboat brought new communication pattens and technologies to China in 1840. Shortly after the Jack flag rose in Hongkong in 1841, the Royal Mail opened up under it to serve the Empire's troops, merchants, and adventures. Soon the western communication system, first Postal Service, then telegraph penetrated into China with the advance of western missionaries, merchants and sailors. After losing some critical battles to British and France, the Chinese government, Qing Empire, gradually realized the advantages of modern communication technology. From 1871 to 1906, Chinese constructed telegraph lines linking major cities, even cross the border connected Russian and Korean. However, tradition did not just perish in front of modern technology of communication. As the new political body of democracy was established in 1912, new technologies of telegram, phone, and newspaper would eventually benefit everyone in one way or another. Modern communication has therefore ignited the most dramatic event in Chinese modern history, the May Fourth Movements 1919. Because the communication network was already open to everyone, and the government had no way to stop the spread of the news. The ripple of the Movement soon spread to the whole country, igniting weaves of political and cultural reforms. In such a short time so many cities joint the aftermath strike shocked the government. As Yong insists that the long game of right to communicate was never stopped till today. New communication technologies constantly appeared. He strongly concludes that as the Chinese government enjoyed the development of modern communication technologies but also tried to restrict the ordinary people's communication range, modern China keeps witnessing tangles between communication freedom and utilization restrictions as the Chinese in thousand years ago.

Scientization and Science to traditional China

Yong's conclusion in fact implies a very interesting coincidence as the title of Bruno Latour's book *We Have Never Been Modern* (Latour 1993) reveals. If we consider Latour is a postmodernist (Golinski 2010, 50-68), it can be said that modernism is connected to modernization and modernity and its development is based on the two; this relation is variable and complicated (Gentile 2003, 44). Generally speaking, one can identity certain internal benefits to modernism considering that both modernization and modernity were globally known, at the late 19th century. Modernity pursues modernism like a response to aspects of life; this made modernism reach an international level. The modernism can be regarded as a response to the sharp shifts molded by modernization and modernity. In brief, modernism recorded the meaning of estrangement of modern humanity, anger, the split of the traditional structure of statement, and official list enclosed the emptying out of both time and space (Mariwan Nasradeen Hasan Barzinji 2013, 49). The feeling of being disorientated is expressed in traditional Chinese medicine; which is an outlet to express medical expressions about the chaos during Chinese Anti-Japanese War (1937-1945).
Kuo-Li Pi's "Traditional Chinese Medicine in Modern Warfare (1937-1945)" discusses the works and actions related to Chinese medicine during the war, explores a long-overlooked topic: the relationship between Chinese medicine, war and country. As Pi indicates, the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese war has led the Chinese medicine community to start thinking about the connection between traditional knowledge and the country's survival as well as the treatment of wounded patients during times of war. The compilation of his analysis allowed readers to discover that Chinese medicine physicians at that time constantly reflected upon its knowledge of surgery, first aid, and drugs from ancient medicine, hoping to play a practical role in wartime. Many past studies investigated the long Sino-Japanese conflicts from late 19th century to 1945 formerly laid particular stress on military and diplomatic aspects (Jansen et al.

1979, 73-89, 191-227). Although there are regional differences (e.g., enemy and the puppet regime zone or Home Front), relevant cultural and historical studies have also been gradually initiated in recent years. Pi likewise intends to explore issues that were seldom investigated in the past studies on history of Chinese medicine using mainly the newspapers, booklets, and private correspondences concerning Chinese medicine during the wartime to identify possible relationship among Chinese medicine, war, and nation. Before the start of the Sino-Japanese War (1937-1945), Chinese and Western medicine practitioners were locked in a battle over the administrative control of medical and health care. Tina Johnson states "These public health efforts shifted in the late 1930s to focus on military medicine and epidemic prevention during the Sino-Japanese War (1937-45) and the Chinese Civil War (1945-49)... rather than thwarting the fledgling public health movement in China, the Second Sino-Japanese War spread it southward and westward" (Lo, Stanley-Baker 2011, 659-668). Although Chinese medicine lacked an acknowledged status and voice in the national health system, the outbreak of the war led to a serious shortage of medical personnel and a lack of pharmaceuticals due to blockades. As the study notes show that the national emergency gave Chinese medicine a new opportunity to develop and to participate in the discussion on national health affairs.

Kou-li Pi's research on Chinese medicine in wartime China rises a very important question in his conclusion. Is it possible to "modernize" Chinese medicine? Or could Chinese medicine be merged with modern healthcare systems? To respond such question, a lengthy road to integrate Chinese medicine or *Kampo* in Japanese should be carefully studied. In fact, prior to the term "TCM (traditional Chinese medicine)" is made to exclusively represent a medical knowledge and practice in traditional China, the similar medicine was widely used in East Asian countries. The term TCM nowadays is an innovation after the 1950s. Kim Tylor's *Chinese Medicine in Early Communist China, 1945-1963: A Medicine of Revolution* is the first book focus on the political functions and activities on CCP's support to Chinese medicine. She asserts that the party policies were very influential in framing the institutions and practices of Chinese medicine, made "TCM" entirely a creature of the Communist state and its shifting priorities. Tylor finally concludes that PRC's "manipulation" outweighed any consideration of Chinese medicine's "actual therapeutic value" in achieving the current level of state support (Tylor 2005, 151). In 2008, Elisabeth Hsu publishes an introductory article "The History of Chinese Medicine in the People's Republic of China and Its Globalization", in *EASTS*. Her argument highlights how Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM, *zhongyi*), as invented in the 1950s during a period of nationalism in PRC regime. Like Tylor, Hsu also treats TCM as a communist project and an "invented tradition". Modified Tylor's periodization, Hsu classifies the late 1950s was period of the standardization of Chinese medicine and some meditation practices in TCM colleges and hygiene schools, hospitals and clinics (Hsu 2008, 466, 470). However, these studies did not touch various efforts to "scientify" Chinese medicine.

As topics like modernization, scientifically transformation (*kexuehua* 科學化), systematism (*xitonghua* 系統化) and standardization (Lo, Stanley-Baker 2022, 624-741) all become popular interests to English-speaking historians of Chinese medicine. The study of the role of Chinese medicine during the wartime is kept within a relatively circle of Chinese scholars. Two obstacles could cause the situation. Firstly, in her book, Kim Tylor has revealed the main difficulty to study Chinese medicine in wartime China. All the research materials in her book demonstrate considerable vacillation and struggle among the powerful interests in play, and the policy and implementation process were quite "piecemeal" as a result (Tylor 2005, 63). What the condition Tylor faced in writing that book, remains the same to other historians nowadays. Secondarily, without proper training and common interests, the war history is commonly dominated by military historians. Compared to Kuo-li Pi's work, only a Japanese historian Norihito Mizuno issues "Kampo-in wartime Sino-Japanese relations: the Association of East Asian Medicine and the search for a tripartite medical partnership" have slightly extended his research beyond the peacetime to the rumbling periods (Mizuno 2016, 197-214). It is obvious that western readers may requires more information about the linkage of scientific experiments on Chinese medicine between pre-modern and modern China.

Jing Zhao is a qualified Chinese medicine practitioner and PhD student of history. Her article "Rediscussion on the 'Scientific' of Modern Acupuncture" analyzes two main external treatment methods of TCM – acupuncture and surgery of traditional Chinese medicine. Acupuncture and surgery of traditional Chinese medicine are the main external treatment methods of TCM. In the early stages, both therapies were based on the "muscular anatomy view" of the body and emphasized the blood body. Early medical practitioners paid more attention to the skin, muscles (sinews), and bones than to the more impersonal ideas of *qi*, meridians, and other such concepts. To ancient doctors in China, skin is the surface of the human body, and its continuous depth is made up of "muscle" and "sinew". It is important to note that TCM surgery uses a definition of "muscle" differed from Western medicine. The muscular system is occasionally the primary standard for determining where acupoints are located.
Since the Song Dynasty, external medicines like acupuncture and surgery began to be marginalized. Chinese medicine thus went through a transformation of "Confucianization," tended to be conservative in techniques. Due to the high degree of integration between Confucianism and medical thought, a theoretical connection between the two was established. Neo-Confucianism later unified in the reasoning system of *qi*, *tai chi*, Yin and Yang, and the five elements, the most prevalent Confucian theory of medicine. The theory of acupuncture gradually unified and solidified in this predominately philosophical environment, and the "meridian theory" came to represent the core of acupuncture.
The competition between Chinese and Western medicine heated up during the late Qing Dynasty. Consistent with the development of Western surgery, knowledge closely related to surgery, such as anatomy and bacteriology, was introduced into China and constantly updated. The concept of "disinfection and sterilization" and "anesthesia making pain relief" represented the most different characteristics of Western medicine and traditional Chinese surgery, and was also the key to its curative effect. The absence of "anatomy and physiology" and "disinfection is obviously the weak spots to cause the disappearance of TCM surgery while acupuncture was solely survived. On the early development of "scientific" acupuncture, Meiji Japanese played the key role in its modernization. With the support from the Meiji government, around the 1930s, traditional acupuncture knowledge and teachings were merged with various "scientific" justifications and experiments. During this period, the introduction of "anatomical physiology" and clinical disinfection practice were quick measures to meet the medical trend and improve the status of acupuncture in Japan.
The introduction of anatomy and physiology played a role in exploring the essence of meridians, positioning of acupoints, interpretation of diseases and other aspects, which was also the requirement of "scientization of traditional Chinese medicine" by the supporters of TCM in China. The most significant one was the development of anatomical description of the positioning of acupoints. After the concepts of anatomy and disinfection were acceptable in Chinese society, learning from Japan, Chinese acupuncture practitioners advocate disinfection not only for the need of technical progress, but also for identity transformation, to win the respect of Western medicine and the public. Marking the anatomical structure of the acupoints and clarifying the acupuncture site in imitation of Japanese precedents is required for safety reasons, but this method has no substantive integration with the traditional theory of meridian acupoints. To meet the "scientific" criteria, the "scientific" acupuncture is completed in accordance with the surgical theory and operating rules of Western surgery. In the end, Miss Zhao claims that the development of modern "scientific" acupuncture has not faded way. It is still used in teachings and clinical practices today.
The two articles on Chinese medicine provide the readers an opportunity to look into various debates on the survival of TCM in modern China. During the past decades, Kuo-li Pi also explores the transformation of Chinese medicine in facing the challenge of western medicine since the early Republican era. Focusing on the transformation of concept *qi* in Chinese medicine to meet up western germ theory, he makes vital conclusion that the rejuvenation of Chinese medicine with the of the transformation of concepts on *wenshi shanghan* (warm-damp cold-harm) in the 1930s became popular, might compensate the potential damage of anti-Chinese medicine atmosphere in the 1930S[1].

To the works of Kuo-li Pi and Jing Zhao on Chinese medicine, Kuo-li Pi does not only portrays the transforming scenario of military medicine under the rivalry between traditional Chinese and modern western medicines, but also provides an above topic has never been touched by researchers.

Concluding remarks

In less than twenty years a number of developments have dramatically reshaped much of what was considered as common ideas in the history of science and technology. The intense discussions among scholars concerning a number of theoretical issues, and the subsequent re-thinking of foundational historiographical problems. With more case-studies on non-western societies in hands, researches in the history of science and technology could expanded range of themes for study and up leveled its academic horizon. The focus on Chinese experience of modernization in the scientific peripheries can shed light on how technology and society are transferred and appropriated in both the applied and the theoretical sciences. Historians like the four authors of this issue will be active agents in exploring Chinese cases and themes to illuminate a multi-direction of the history of science and technology that implies a strong interaction within the complicated relationship between modernization and modernity as well as science and scientization. When moving from center/West to periphery/non-west, researchers will immediately realize modernization could be cultural-determined and the success to apply western science and technologies definitely required soils of traditions.

Concomitantly, the proliferation of this special issue along with the information from a variety of original sources could play a key role in defining the contours of the western-centered scope of history of science and technology. The major transformations could thus take place in both the actual case-studies and the inspiration from non-western contexts of the history of science and technology in a number of countries, China in this special issue of the western periphery. All four papers are accordingly done with the latest trends of the history of science and technology in Chinese academic circle. This special issue intends to investigate the transformation and adjustments of technological application and modernization in contemporary China from historical angles. This issue is primarily concerned with the disruption caused by the impacts of western science to traditional Chinese society and culture. Finally, this special issue will not only be the first one in discussing the topic of science and technologies transformed China, but will rebut the western-centric experience and form a global view of the history of science and technology with new approaches.

Note

1 For details, please refer to Kuo-li Pi, *Study Notes on Chinese Medicine in Modern Warfare* and Michael Shiyung Liu, James A. Cook, *An Introduction to War, Medicine and Modernity in East Asian Conflicts*, in forthcoming EASTS (2023)

Bibliography

Finlayson J.G.
2005 *Habermas: A Very Short Introduction*, Oxford, Oxford University Press.

Gentile E.
2003 *The Struggle for Modernity: Nationalism, Futurism and Fascism*, London, Praeger.

Golinski J.
2010 *Science and Religion in Postmodern Perspective: The case of Bruno Latour*, in Dixon T., Cantor G., Pumfrey S., *Science and Religion: New Historical Perspectives*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Guo Yanmei
2001 *Dui Zhongguo xiandaihua licheng de huigu yu fansi (Review and Reflection on the Course of China's Modernization)*, in "Lingdao zhi you", n. 1.

Hsu E.
2008 *The History of Chinese Medicine in the People's Republic of China and Its Globalization*, in "EASTS", 2, n. 4.

Huang Xingtao
2005 *Qingmo minchu xin mingci xin gainian de 'xiandai xing' wenti—Jianlun 'sixiang xiandai xing' yu xiadai xing 'shehui' gainian de Zhongguo rentong (The 'Modernity' Problem of New Terms and Concepts in the Late Qing Dynasty and the Early Republic of China. Also on the Chinese Identity of the Concepts of 'Ideological Modernity' and Modernity 'Society')*, in "Tianjin shehui kexue", n. 4.

Jansen M.B. *et al.*
1979 *The Historiography of the Sino-Japanese War*, in "International History Review", vol. 1, n. 2.

Latour B.
1993 *We Have Never Been Modern*, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press.

Linehan D.
2009 *Modernity, Knowledge, and Geography*, in Kitchin R., Thrift N. (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Human Geography*, Amsterdam, Elsevier.

Lo V., Stanley-Baker M.
2011 *Chinese medicine*, in *Oxford Handbook of the History of Medicine*, Oxford UK, Oxford University Press.
2022 *Negotiating modernity*, in Lo V., Stanley-Baker M., Yang D. (eds.), *Routledge Handbook of Chinese Medicine*, London, Routledge.

Mariwan Nasradeen Hasan Barzinji
2013 *Modernism, Modernity and Modernisation*, in "Research on Humanities and Social Sciences", vol. 3, n. 12.

Mizuno N.
2016 *Kampo-in Wartime Sino-Japanese relations: the Association of East Asian Medicine and the Search for a Tripartite Medical Partnership*, in Wittner D.G., Philip C., Brown P.C. (eds.), *Science, Technology, and Medicine in the Modern Japanese Empire*, London, Routledge.

Tylor K.
2005 *Chinese Medicine in Early Communist China, 1945-1963: A Medicine of Revolution*, London, Routledge.

Whimster S., Weber M.
1980 *The Profession of History in the Work of Max Weber: Its Origins and Limitations*, in "The British Journal of Sociology", vol. 31, n. 3.

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY IN TRANSFORMING CHINESE SOCIETY: RESEARCH NOTES

Le tecnologie della comunicazione nella trasformazione della società cinese. Alcune note su una ricerca

Enchao Yang

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723b

Abstract

This paper considers the development of communication technologies in China. By analyzing the literature, this work aims to view technology as a driving force of social transformation and how the state government can use communication as a control mechanism.

Questo documento presenta una riflessione sullo sviluppo delle tecnologie di comunicazione in Cina. Attraverso l'analisi della letteratura, l'obiettivo di questo lavoro è quello di riflettere sulla tecnologia come motore della trasformazione sociale e su come le comunicazioni possono essere uno strumento di controllo gestito dallo Stato.

Keywords: communication technologies, social transformation, social control, China.
Tecnologie della comunicazione, trasformazioni sociali, controllo sociale, Cina.

Enchao Yang received his master's degree of the history of science from the Center of History of Science, Technology and Medicine, Manchester University, UK and is currently a Ph.D. candidate at Shanghai Jiao Tong University. His doctoral dissertation focuses on the changing history of communication technologies in China. With an undergraduate education in natural science, Mr. Yang also publishes articles on communication issues in late Qing through the lens of STS (abb. Science, Technology, and Society). E-mail: yec2013@sjtu.edu.cn.

Enchao Yang *ha vinto il suo master in storia della scienza presso il Centro di Storia della Scienza, Tecnologia e Medicina, Manchester University, Regno Unito ed è attualmente Ph.D. candidato di Shanghai Jiao Tong University. La sua tesi di dottorato si concentra sulla storia mutevole delle tecnologie della comunicazione in Cina. Dopo aver conseguito un'istruzione universitaria in scienze naturali, Mr. Yang sta pubblicando alcuni articoli su questioni di comunicazione nel tardo Qing dagli angoli di STS. E-mail: yec2013@sjtu.edu.cn.*

Communication is vital to maintaining the basic functions of a society. Forms of communication vary from regular chats, talks, speeches, and lectures to the modern technologies of the telephone, broadcast, email, postal service, and printed materials. The breadth and depth of the different forms of communication reveal the sophistication of human civilization. Just as the ticktock of telegraph machines are still sounding somewhere on earth, Tik Tok, the online video platform, is downloaded onto many cellphones. Due to the interest in the study of the history of communication within China, research into communication technologies has bloomed over the past decade with the publishing of several important scientific achievements like *The Chronology of Communication Technologies* (Zhenhuan Jiang 2019), *Mechanical Engineering and Electrical Engineering in the Republic of China* (Shoutai Wang 2009) and *A brief history of Everything Wireless: How Invisible Waves Have Changed the World* (Launiainen 2020).
However, as the Edinburgh School of the History of Science has argued, science and technology emerge from societies that are simultaneously shaped by the application of those new sciences and technologies (Shapin 1982, 157-211). In the case of China, society and communication are entangled together in a long history.
In ancient China, traditional communication networks – *Yichuan* System – were consistently constructed but only operated by the government. Many restrictions were applied to prevent usage by the common people. However, since the 19th century, the introduction of modern means of communications to China was achieved through governmental and private investment, allowing access to public and private society and revealing the unique transformation of communication and society in late imperial China. This article aims to provide a holistic view of the features of Chinese communications, followed by a discussion of their modernization and impact on Chinese society since the 19th century. Analyzing the history of communication in China provides a clear lens through which to view and understand the characteristics of modern communication in contemporary China.

Review of related scholarship in China

Reviewing the research on Chinese communication history, historical factors, and the historiography of science creates a hypothesis for the Chinese modernization in the late Qing period. The late contact and development of science and technology in China created an opportunity for scholars to thoroughly investigate the relationship of society, communication, and science.
The diversity of communication has led to research about every aspect of communication. In the case of China, *The Short History of Chinese Communication* (Weiqing Zhu 2011), *The History of Communication Discipline in China* (CAST 2010), and the masterpiece *A Brief History of Communication Technology* fundamentally discussed the development of communication technologies in China (Shengjun Zhou 2022). Related organizations like postal offices, telegraph companies, and the ancient mailing system have also attracted researchers' attention, revealing the features of traditional and modern communications and how those features have changed. The interest in how ancient China communicated has inspired many publications. For instance, *Late Qing Telegraph and Its Media ideology 1860-1911* (Li Sun 2007), *A History of Telecommunications in Pre-war Hong Kong, the development of Chinese You and Yi* (Guanyao Ma 2017), and *The Development of Communication Technologies* (Chunbo Mao 2016) all focused on various aspects that maintained the functions of communication in pre-modern Chinese societies. Communication organizations have changed along with changes in societies and countries over time, which indicates the importance in studying communication in time and space. For instance, *The System of Song Yi* (Xiaoxuan Zhao 1983) and *A Study on the Post System in Southwest China of the Ming Dynasty* (Pinglue Zhao 2021) are two essential references for scholars of the postal system in ancient China. Recently, scholars have paid further attention to the mutual impacts between communication forms and social transformations. Especially in modern society, the rapidly changing communication science and technologies in the modern period have trans-

formed the ways people have understood each other and their own identity, while old technologies kept their influence in daily life. The three monographs *Late Qing Telegraph Construction and Social Change* (Weiqi Xia 2012), *Historical Analysis on Chinese Internet Politic: Telegraph and Late Qing Politics* (Yongming Zhou 2013), *Telegraph Technology Transfer from the West to China in Qing Dynasty* (Xue Li 2013) are essential volumes for the discussing the relationship between innovative technologies and social change.
In the 17th century, Western missionaries first brought science, technology, and engineering instruments to traditional China and its literati to promote Christianity. Although the missionaries failed in their mission to convert China to Christianity, western sciences and technologies survived despite years of setbacks. Because of a series of military defeats and diplomatic humiliations, China in the late 19th century started to consider western learning to rescue the Empire through modernizing Chinese society. Along with other modernization schemes, modern communication technologies were introduced to China but were soon embroiled in a wide-spread debate about whether the innovative technologies should replace or merge with the traditional communication systems such as the postal system, which played a significant role in the socio-political context of China.

Communication and society from ancient to modern China

In 221 BC, China was united under the first emperor of the Qin Dynasty. The new empire immediately faced the challenge of managing a vast territory with many different peoples. This challenge has puzzled rulers in mainland China for centuries. Without the modern technologies of communication, the government could only control the society by human connection, making ancient China a gentry society. The gentry class was needed to handle the communication and negotiation between the public and civil sectors in traditional Chinese society. The gentry, a prestigious social class in imperial China, was made of retired bureaucrats and their heirs who were leaders of local communities and consistently enjoyed the trust of the ruling classes (Fei Hsiao-Tung 1946, 1-17). Since the 6th century, the public service civil examination in China laid out a formal foundation to maintain the gentry class, aiming to favor those who were educated and rich. This system created a relatively stable social structure for running imperial regimes from the 11th century until its abolishment in 1905 (Elman 2013). Due to their socio-political status, Chinese gentries were allowed to utilize ancient communication infrastructure.
To access the government-dominated communication systems of the vast empire, government officials had to travel far to serve their roles. However, this trip might risk their loyalty to the state due to their inability to stay connected with families at home. To solve loyalty risks and other concerns that arose due to this travel, it became necessary for the government to institute the *Yichuan*, or public communication system (Tongbing Su 1969). The career of serving the state and the prestige of being social leaders after retirement made bureaucrats the few in ancient China allowed frequent access to the governmental communication system.

Features of ancient communication in China

Due to the frequent military confrontations and chaos during the “warring-states” period, little evidence exists of a nation-wide communication system prior to the Qin Dynasty (221 BC-207 BC). Individual states separately built transportation and postal systems, but only the royal and aristocratic members could use these, rulers using such systems only for political and military reasons. Without a comprehensive communication network to serve each state, only emergencies or the most valuable information was passed through the services (Guangsheng Liu 1999). The unification of China by the Qin Empire was

mainly created by military conquest; however, the conquest by soldiers in shining armor was also due to technological innovations that overcame the communication difficulties of effectively managing valuable information in a timely manner.
In 1975, private letters were discovered in a tomb from the early Qin period. In those letters, two brothers in the Qin army discussed family affairs, asked for uniforms, and recounted their fighting in the frontline. The letters were delivered between Huaiyang and Anlu, two areas separated by 400 kilometers (about 248.55 mi). Furthermore, the letters were delivered during fierce battles around 224 BC (Jisen Li 2017, 60-61). Despite no further evidence of a postal system in the Qin Dynasty, according to the contents of the letters, a trustworthy communication system was established from the frontier to the heartland of the Qin Empire, and even functioned during wartime. However, the myth of the ancient Chinese communication system remains. Did the Qin army develop a military postal service to tighten connections between soldiers and their families? Or were the letters smuggled through the official military communication network? Or were these letters delivered due to someone's friendship or a personal favor? With questions unanswered from archeological discoveries, these letters implied that ordinary soldiers on the frontlines could have their own means of communication when necessary. The empire could have very possibly had a sophisticated communication network to help win the war, unify China, and manage a vast empire.

The ancient forbidden "high-way" in China

Without the benefit of historical precedence, the Qin Empire had to quickly learn how to go from a military victory to managing a vast territory in the 3rd century. Shortly after the end of the military campaigns, a standard road network across the country was established by the emperor's order. Like the saying "All roads lead to Rome", the Qin built a paved road linking major cities and military encampments to the capital of Xianyang to deliver information and transport the troops needed to manage the empire. This road network was completed two hundred years before the Roman Empire's highway system.
Right after the Qin's unification, *chidao*, or a special "highway," was constructed exclusively for the emperor's need to travel around the country. The *chidao*, like modern transportation systems (Morgenthau 1964), was a symbol to illuminate imperial glory and the emperor's authority, a tool to collect critical information for control purposes, and a way to share bureaucratic duties with local authorities. The highway was a prestigious way for the royal family, and occasionally imperial officials when given permission, to travel the country. With the necessary development of a highway network, an administration was created to handle the demand for communication, thereby allowing the emperor to rule over the massive territory (Zijin Wang 2020).
Based on the foundation of the Qin Dynasty, the Han Dynasty (202 BC-222 AD) inherited the previous dynasty's infrastructure and left much evidence to modern historians about its communication system. Although the construction of transportation was further expanded, the Han government, like its predecessor, kept the injunctions against allowing regular people and governmental officials from accessing the official road system for personal reasons. All personal correspondence had to go through private channels. However, the internal friction and corruption in the court during the late Han Dynasty eventually weakened imperial control over society. Religious unrest by armed rebels occurred throughout the empire, damaging the central authority and its control over communication. As the government lost its control, the religious network in turn provided an alternative for communicating its rebellious actions. In the case of the Huangjin Rebellion and its suppression by the Han government, the region could accommodate a network of communication for various needs. With the unofficial network of religious-based communication, messages could be easily passed from the top down to the believers, local gatherings,

and even rebel commanders. The impact of religious communication in the 4th century has similarities to early 20th century China (Congshan Wei 2020, 120-122), a coincidence which highlights the historical continuity of Chinese society.

Limited impact of the gentry society to traditional system

Even as many dynasties in China rose and fell, the restrictions against accessing the official communication systems remained. The public communication network still differentiated the needs of private users from royal needs except in times when governmental power was weak. However, the creation of the public service civil examination created a chance to form a gentry society in China with the Song Dynasty (960 AD-1279 AD) serving as the turning point in this transformation (Chen Song 2017, 141-182). For centuries after the Song Dynasty, emperors had to rely on gentry-bureaucrats to rule the country, and subsequently had to allow civil servants to legally access government communication networks for personal reasons (Xiaoxuan Zhao 1983). However, the unrestrictive use of the communication network eventually overloaded its capacity and efficiency. The overload of the communication network continued until the late Qing Dynasty in early 20th century. To satisfy the civil demands of communication, the civil communication organization Minxin Ju was created in the Ming Dynasty (1368 AD-1644 AD). This bureau of postal services served as the first commercial facility of mail and post in China, allowing the acceleration of the speed of the service through different prices. However, as ancient China was co-ruled by gentries and government officials which shared socio-political benefits with each other, the development of the civil postal services was limited and is unclear to historians. Later, by the end of Qing Dynasty (1644 AD-1912 AD), after hundreds of years development and expansion, Minxin Ju only served the major commercial cities alongside the coast and the river basins. The vast interior of the empire still lacked communication channels for ordinary people (Jianguo Xu 2017). Most of the population in inland and rural China were still unable to enjoy the dawn of modern communication unless revolutionary social changes occurred.

Modern communication to China

The First Opium War in 1840 has been seen as the starting point of the modernization in Qing China (Suwanthanin Waroonporn 2022, 1-12). In the almost one hundred years that passed after the First Opium War, the traditional Chinese communication system and western communication facilities were all checked, inspected, and tested by promoters of Chinese modernization. After long negotiations and near confrontations, a new system of communication arose in China from the ruins of the old system. In the late 19th century, large numbers of western merchants, diplomats, military service men, and sailors poured into China. As the counterparts to the Qin soldiers of two thousand years ago, these men stationed in remote China wanted to maintain contact with their friends and families at home. In addition, foreign companies, commercial enterprises, and political authorities also required a reliable way to communicate with their men in China. Unfortunately, China in the late 19th century possessed no communication system that could satisfy foreign needs.

Qing China did not possess civil communication services for ordinary people let alone foreigners. The Qing government adhered to the prevailing political tradition and kept the official communication system accessible only for public affairs, constantly overlooking the rising private needs. Even worse, the Chinese communication network was totally disconnected from other countries, making international communication impossible. To overcome the communication obstacles in China without interfering with the political situation, foreign postal services created their own overseas branches in major Chinese cities

as part of their international network of connections. These overseas branches served foreigners' communication needs through the existing network of postal offices (Committee on Youdian History 1984). One scheme of Qing modernization, the Maritime Custom Service, started its mail delivery service in 1866 under the supervision of western officers. Under the leadership of Inspector-General Sir Robert Hart, the Maritime Custom Service Postal Service initially only transported official documents but soon started to deliver letters for foreign citizens in 1868 (Liangren Zhang 1935).

Modern communication network for civil needs in China

The foreign postal service and Maritime Custom Service postal service gradually set up offices in more cities to expand business within China. With the growing interest in modern postal services, the telegraph, a high-tech communication method, drew the Chinese government's attention. Before 1871, western telegraph companies, like the Great Northern Company from Denmark and the Great Eastern Company from England, had unsuccessfully tried to expand their business to China. However, the Chinese government distrusted foreigners, not their technology. Until 1871, after losing some critical battles against England and France, the Chinese government gradually realized the telegraph could be the key for winning the next war due to its fast exchange of information. Due to this change in the government's attitude, Qing authorities signed the contract with the Great Northern Company to build telegraph lines from the capital of Beijing to the treaty-port city of Shanghai. By the end of 1890s, with sufficient imported materials and the assistance of foreign engineers, the Qing government finally built a telegraph network linking major cities across the country. As the domestic network was completed, the Qing government realized this novel communication technology could be used for international communications as well (Weiqi Xia 2012). The network of telegraph lines was further expanded northward into Russia, overseas to Japan, and southward to Hong Kong. In sum, the Postal Service and the telegraph allowed China to merge with global communications systems for the first time.

While innovative technologies such as the telegraph linked China with the world, the old communication methods persisted. The telegraph was good enough to transfer the message faster than the traditional Youyi System; however, the cost of this innovative technology was also a heavy burden for the Chinese people. Most of the materials and the engineers were from overseas, so Chinese people had to employ foreign engineers and use the telegraph at extremely unaffordable prices. For a long time, the telegraph was only allowed to transport emergency messages such as urgent military intelligence or diplomatic reports. Another problem was that the construction of telegraph lines required time and resources. Starting in 1871 and after 30 years of construction, the telegraph only covered the major cities of China. The small towns, the frontier garrisons, and cities in rural areas were not connected to the telegraph network. The traditional Youyi System had been in place for centuries, serving as a symbol of imperial authority and emperor's glory; however, due to modernization, the traditional Youyi and modern telegraph systems were forcibly integrated for the development of China. However, the early compromise of integration was chaotic. Local officials were often hesitant to make the choice between sending reports via telegraph or through the old Youyi system. Also, the maintenance of this dual communication system was costly. In 1906, to facilitate the integration, the Qing government set up a new ministry, Youchuan Bu (Ministry of Postal and Communication), to oversee the Youyi System, the telegraph, and the Postal Service (Quanyou Su 2005). The selection of the term Youchuan, meaning postal and communication in Chinese, signaled the integration of the traditional and newer forms of communication under one administration. The government hoped that this strategy could save financial expenses without losing efficiency.

The goal of building Youchuan Bu was unsuccessful. Resistance came both internally and externally. On one hand, the military kept control of the Youyi System, and the Ministry of Defense used the excuse of

national security to challenge the authority of Youchuan Bu until the collapse of Qing Empire in 1911. The military argued that military intelligence was vital for the survival of the country; therefore, the army and navy must maintain their own communication network in the form of the Youyi System. However, the Maritime Custom Service Postal Service was taken over by the Qing government. This political move increased the foreign Postal Service's distrust in the administrative ability of the Chinese government, especially when most of the offices were still controlled by Great Britain, France, Russia, and other western states. During World War One and the subsequent advantages China received from joining the Allied Force, the Chinese Republican government seized the opportunity and abolished some of the foreign Postal Service offices. In the 1950s, the Chinese communist government finally took over full control of all the postal services (Committee on Youdian History 1984). This history of administration transformation reveals the complicated relationship between the development of new communication technologies and the political atmosphere in modern China.

Changing communication technology leads to institutional change, and institutional change should push the government to generate new administrative functions. However, ordinary Chinese people might have felt apathetic towards these technological changes and social impacts. In the beginning, the postal services, whether the foreign Postal Service or the Maritime Custom Service Postal Service, aimed to serve foreigners rather than the Chinese people. Moreover, the telegraph was supposed to serve the whole of Chinese society just as it did in western societies. The telegraphs services in Qing China were divided into four categories. The first class only served the royal members and diplomats, the second class was for high-ranking officials, the third class was for low-ranking officers, and the fourth class was for civilians. Furthermore, due to political traditions and social norms, for a long time, telegraph services for the government were provided free of charge. Simply, the government carried the cost to construct and manage the network; therefore, the telegraph company must provide free service to the government for these costs. This explains why the telegraph was always full of official reports and rarely for civilian purposes (Bin Shi 2012). Government officials frequently enjoyed the communication network, and the ordinary people could only use the network sparingly.

The prohibitive cost and governmental domination over the modern communication system of the telegram scared many ordinary people away from using the service. However, the cheaper and easier to use traditional Youyi System could still carry out the functions of serving both public affairs and civil needs. The expansion of postal services to cover most of the Chinese population took time, and its speed depended on the economic conditions in China. Most Chinese people in early 20th century still lived traditional lifestyles and followed the doctrines from their ancestors' teachings. For communication, people were still waiting for letters and news from far away relatives and friends to arrive via an unreliable communication network. However, although slow, modern technologies did ultimately change this society.

Impacts of circulating information by new communication

The prohibitive cost finally made the government unable to cover all the expenses of building the telegraph network; the government needed private investment. To motivate private investors, the selling of telegraph communication service was seen as a way to continue construction without increasing the financial burden. The common solution of issuing bonds and treasury bills in the West now became the solution to save the telegraph network in late imperial China. This solution invited ordinary Chinese people from civil society to experience innovative technologies, namely the telegraph and postal services. The demands and uses of the new communication system by ordinary people varied widely. In addition to the conventional function of delivering letters and news, rumors also became a part of modern China. Newspapers were a foreign concept to China in the late imperial period with the Chinese *Dibao* being the

only similar counterpart to western way of circulating information. Some researchers regard *Dibao* as the prototype for the newspaper in China. However, only governmental information such as emperor's activities and officials' decisions could be posted in *Dibao*. Without modern public media in China and with the government controlling communication, *Dibao* was the only media that delivered information all around the country (Jiayong Qian 2020). With the introduction of the telegraph and Postal Service network, modern newspapers soon started to circulate messages to Chinese civil society by more conveniently and cheaply providing access to modern communication systems. Foreign publications in coastal port cities provided the first newspapers but were later followed by Chinese copycats with *Shenbao* being one of the most famous newspapers in China. Founded in 1872 by British and American merchants in Shanghai, it became the symbol of Chinese commercial newspapers and an example of a Chinese newspaper that served local citizens. The first editor group was influenced by traditional Chinese culture, and the publication concerned local affairs.

Following the fast growth in the market, the competition between various newspapers became fierce in Republican years. In an attempt to dominate the market through the immediate dissemination of news, *Shenbao* opened a correspondence office in Beijing and rented an exclusive telegram line to send information to Shanghai. Despite the telegraph being too expensive for regular people to use, reading news on *Shenbao* offered an inexpensive alternative. In addition, *Shenbao* could extract information from *Dibao* and quickly distribute the information as its own news to the citizens of Shanghai. This efficiency allowed *Shenbao* to deliver immediate news, making it the most popular newspaper in both Shanghai and all of China. With help from the modern communication technologies and networks, the social image of *Shenbao* became even more vital when Chinese citizens became eager to read about news and safe zone locations during wartime, especially during the Second Sino-Japanese War (Jiayong Qian 2020).

As soon as the modern communication network could easily reach users and circulate information for both public and civil needs, the power of civil society within China was able to strengthen to replace the traditional function of the imperial government. Public opinions started to form as civil society's power increased. In the first century of 20th century, *Tongdian* became the key media for political leaders to express their views on current events. *Tongdian*, meaning "general telegraph" in Chinese, was usually sent by political leaders such as governors of provinces, generals of armies, or leaders of social groups. The rise of *Tongdian* had its unique background in the 1920s as Republican China experienced long-term military confrontations and political conflicts. The danger of civil wars was constant and overwhelming. To persuade the people to support their army and to win the public's support, warlords disseminated *Tongdian* via telegraph stations to spread orders and news throughout the country. For some important *Tongdian*, newspapers were also circulated via the telegraph. On several occasions, *Tongdian* were intentionally delivered months before the fighting began (Cunling Gao 2019, 59-70). In these cases, researchers suspected that the warlords used *Tongdian* as a fighting strategy to interfere with their enemies.

The function of modern communication was also used beyond domestic conflicts. During the May Fourth Movement in 1919, the communication network again demonstrated its power over the Chinese political arena. At the end of the First World War, information about the peace talks in Paris were all over the headlines of Chinese newspapers. The Chinese delegation in Paris kept in communication with the government in Beijing by telegraph, and on May 2nd, unwelcome news about the Chinese failure at the negotiations in Paris reached Beijing. The failure ignited anger in young students prompting them to demonstrate on the street to protest the Beijing government, leading to arrests. On June 4th, a telegram from Beijing to Shanghai reported that the arrested students in Beijing asked for support from the citizens of Shanghai. The message was soon spread to northern China. From June 5th to June 10th, students, merchants, and workers from Shanghai, Nanjing, Ningbo, Zhenjiang, Suzhou, Changzhou, Wuxi, Yangzhou, Wuhu, Jiujiang, Hangzhou, Hankou, and Jinan all joined in the strike. The government was shocked by the brief time it took for cities all over China to join the strike. The modern medias of communication

intricately linked Chinese citizens in every corner of the country, putting them on a trajectory of patriotism towards a mentally united China. At last, access to reliable communication networks for everyone in society was opened. This freedom of communication would be amplified by the emergence of the new media outlets of a modern Chinese society.

Conclusion

Throughout the long history of ancient China, it was the government that controlled the communication network, restricting ordinary people from accessing or using the systems. This resulted in allowing the government to easily maintain its rule over a vast land while, due to lack of communication channels, the development of society met with many difficulties. In the history of modern China, the introduction of technology was regarded as the beginning of the change in Chinese society. From research into how ordinary people initially interacted with the telegraph, it became clear that the technology did not change the traditional way of Chinese life; the power of the telegraph was not easily accessible for ordinary people, though the opening of communication to ordinary people made newspapers and magazines possible to develop in China. The power of communication technologies was amplified by those media. In just 50 years, from the 1870s to the 1920s, Chinese society had developed public opinion which was strong enough to make warlords and intellectuals seek their support. The people that once sat on top of society now were threatened by ordinary people through just their words or thoughts. From that point, the real power of communication technology started to emerge.
Technology is born from a society's structure. When introducing innovative technology to society, the technology itself might initially only have a limited influence. Technology must be used and accepted by human beings in order to change people and society. This process usually does not happen in a natural or defined way. In the case above, it was the Western social structure, that every citizen had the same right to communicate, introduced into China by accident that allowed social changes in China. Before this introduction, the Chinese people lived in a society where the communication network was specifically used for public affairs. This way of life was perfectly embedded into Chinese civilization over a thousand years, and very few could imagine a unique way of life. The way western and eastern civilizations met shows the possibilities humans can reach; however, tradition maintained its power from history. The Chinese government and the Chinese society did not find a way to peacefully live together. The Great Firewall is a salient example of this unease. When the government tried to maintain control over communication, society tested the limits of such control. As is true with every country, China's special history led to its own particular problems. The solution to these problems might lie in the history or somewhere else.

Bibliography

Bin Shi
2012 *Telegraph Communication and Late Qing Political Change*, Beijing, CASS Press.

Chen Song
2017 The *State, the Gentry, and Local Institutions: The Song Dynasty and Long-term Trends from Tang to Qing*, in "Journal of Chinese History", vol. I, n. 1.

China Association for Science and Technology (CAST)
2010 *The History of Communication Discipline in China*, Beijing, CAST Press.

Chunbo Mao
2016 *The Development of Communication Technologies*, Beijing, Tsinghua Press.

Committee on Youdian History
1984 *History of Modern China Youdian*, Beijing, Renmin Youdian Press.

Congshan Wei
2020 *Discussions on Huangjin Rebellion in the late 20th Century*, in "Journal of the West", vol. 11.

Cunling Gao
2019 *History and Analysis on Tongdian in the Late Qing and Republic of China*, in "Journal of News University", vol. 3.

Elman B.A.
2013 *Civil examinations and meritocracy in late imperial China*, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press.

Fei Hsiao-Tung
1946 *Peasantry and gentry: An interpretation of Chinese social structure and its changes*, in "American Journal of Sociology", vol. 52, n. 1.

Guangsheng Liu
1999 *History of Ancient Chinese You and Yi*, Beijing, Renmin Youdian Press.

Guanyao Ma
2020 *A History of Telecommunications in Pre-war Hong Kong*, Hongkong, Sanlian Press.

Jianguo Xu
2017 *The Rise and Fall of Minxin Ju in China*, Beijing, CASS Press.

Jiayong Qian
2020 *What is News: Telegraph Application and Late Qing Shen Bao*, Beijing, CASS Press.

Jisen Li
2017 *The Earliest Letters to home*, in "China Post", vol. I.

Liangren Zhang
1935 *China Post*, Shanghai, Shangwu Yinshu Press.

Launiainen P.
2020 *A brief history of Everything Wireless: How Invisible Waves Have Changed the World*, Beijing, Renmin Youdian Press.

Li Sun
2007 *Late Qing Telegraph and Its Media ideology 1860-1911*, Shanghai, Shanghai Shudian Press.

Morgenthau H.J.
1964 *Modern Science and Political Power*, in "Columbia Law Review", vol. 64, n. 8.

Pinglue Zhao
2021 *A Study on the Post System in Southwest China of the Ming Dynasty*, Beijing, Renmin Press.

Quanyou Su
2005 *Study on Late Qing Youchuan Bu*, Beijing, Zhonghua Shuju Press.

Shapin S.
1982 *History of Science and its Sociological Reconstructions*, in "History of Science", vol. 20, n. 3.

Shengjun Zhou
2022 *A Brief History of Communication Technology*, Beijing, Renmin Youdain Press.

Shoutai Wang
2009 *Mechanical Engineering and Electrical Engineering in the Republic of China*, Changsha, Hunan Jiaoyu Press.

Suwanthanin Waroonporn
2022 *Closed-Door Policy of the Qing Dynasty and China's Defeat in the First Opium War*, in "Journal of ASEAN PLUS Studies", vol. 3, n. 2.

Tongbing Su
1969 *The System of Yidi in Ming Dynasty*, Taipei, Committee on Chinese Books.

Weiqi Xia

2012 *Late Qing Telegraph Construction and Social Change*, Beijing, Renmin Press.

Weiqing Zhu
2011 *The Short History of Chinese Communication*, Beijing, Xuexi Press.

Xiaoxuan Zhao
1983 *The System of Song Yi*, Taibei, Lianjing Press.

Xue Li
2013 *Telegraph Technology Transfer from the West to China in Qing Dynasty*, Jinan, Shandong Jiaoyu Press.

Yongming Zhou
2013 *Historical Analysis on Chinese Internet Politic: Telegraph and Late Qing Politics*, Beijing, Shangwu Press.

Zhenhuan Jiang
2019 *The Chronology of Communication Technologies*, Jinan, Shandong Jiaoyu Press.

Zijin Wang
2020 *The research on Transportation culture in Qin and Han*, Shaanxi, Xibei University Press.

Zuyi Lou
2017 *The development of Chinese You and Yi*, Zhengzhou, Henan Renmin Press.

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

TRADITIONAL CHINESE MEDICINE IN MODERN WARFARE (1937-1945)

La medicina tradizionale cinese nella guerra moderna (1937-1945)

Kuo-li Pi

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723c

Abstract

A significant body of research exists on the Sino-Japanese War, 1937-1945, with most scholarship focusing on military and diplomatic affairs. Relevant cultural-historical research has also been conducted in recent years on regional differences, such as whether the region was controlled by the Japanese, a puppet regime, or the Chinese government. This work, instead, will focus on Chinese medicine during the war and will attempt to explore the problems rarely touched upon in past research on the history of Chinese medicine, namely the relationship between Chinese medicine, war, and country. Chinese medicine lagged in modern developments of surgical techniques and physiological knowledge. The outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War, however, led the Chinese medicine community to consider the connection between traditional knowledge and the country's survival, as well as the treatment of wounded patients during times of war. These insights allow us to discover that contemporary Chinese medicine physicians constantly reflected upon their knowledge of surgery, first aid, and drugs from ancient medicine, and that they hoped to play a practical role in the war. In addition, the Chinese medicine community also endeavored to open new schools and hospitals to advance Chinese medicine knowledge in society, as well as to carry out treatments for wounded soldiers. Most of the Chinese medicine community believed that Chinese medicine should play a role during wars and national disasters. In addition to enriching the research on Chinese medical history, this work also aims to supplement the current discussion on the history of the Sino-Japanese War, which has been traditionally skewed towards politics and the military, thereby providing a more comprehensive picture of this period of history.

Esistono molte ricerche sulla guerra sino-giapponese tra il 1937 e il 1945, anche se la maggior parte di esse si è concentrata sui militari e la diplomazia. Negli ultimi anni sono state condotte rilevanti ricerche storico-culturali. Questo lavoro si concentra sulla medicina cinese durante la guerra, tentando di esplorare problemi raramente toccati nella letteratura sulla storia della medicina cinese: in particolare, il rapporto tra medicina cinese, guerra e paese. È un fatto indiscutibile che la moderna medicina cinese fosse in ritardo nello sviluppo delle tecniche chirurgiche e della conoscenza della fisiologia. Lo scoppio della guerra sino-giapponese, tuttavia, ha portato la comunità medica cinese ad iniziare a pensare al collegamento tra la conoscenza tradizionale e la sopravvivenza del paese, nonché al trattamento dei pazienti feriti durante i periodi di guerra. Questa ricerca ha permesso di scoprire che i medici riflettevano costantemente sulla loro conoscenza della chirurgia, del primo soccorso e dei farmaci della medicina antica, sperando di giocare un ruolo attivo in tempo di guerra. Inoltre, la comunità medica cinese ha cercato di aprire nuove scuole e ospedali per far progredire la conoscenza della medicina cinese all'interno della società. La maggior parte dei medici credeva che la medicina cinese non avrebbe dovuto essere assente durante le guerre e i disastri nazionali. Oltre ad arricchire la ricerca sulla storia medica cinese, questo lavoro mira anche ad integrare la discussione attuale sulla storia della guerra sino-giapponese, che è stata tradizionalmente distorta attraverso gli aspetti politici e militari, fornendo così un quadro più completo di questo periodo.

Keywords: Chinese medicine physicians, military doctors, surgery war, Chinese medicine.
Medici tradizionali cinesi, medici militari, chirurgia di guerra, medicina cinese.

Kuo-li Pi is an Associate Professor and currently the Director of the Graduate Institute of History, National Central University, Taiwan. His research interests range from histories of diseases and the body to the impacts of modern warfare to Chinese medicine. He has published more than 80 academic papers and written and edited 17 books. His latest popular contribution to Chinese scholarship is a dietary history of supplements in Chinese society (in Chinese). E-mail: pikuoli@g.ncu.edu.tw.

Kuo-li Pi *è professore associato e attualmente direttore del Graduate Institute of History della National Central University a Taiwan. I suoi interessi di ricerca spaziano dalla storia delle malattie e del corpo agli impatti della guerra moderna, alla medicina cinese. Ha pubblicato più di 80 articoli accademici e scritto e curato quasi 17 libri. Il suo ultimo contributo su una storia alimentare degli integratori nella società cinese (in cinese) è un grande successo. E-mail: pikuoli@g.ncu.edu.tw.*

Introduction

A significant body of research exists on the Sino-Japanese War, 1937-1945, with most scholarship focusing on military and diplomatic affairs. Relevant cultural-historical research has also been conducted in recent years (Schoppa 2011; Watt 2013) despite regional differences, such as whether the region was controlled by the Japanese, a puppet regime, or the Chinese government. Having recently taken an interest in the history of this war and medicine, I was surprised to discover that Chinese medicine, which was about to be abolished during the Republic of China era in Mainland China, displayed a strong vitality and even developed during the war (Pi Kuo-Li 2020, 89-126). Therefore, this work intends to focus on the relevant evidence of Chinese medicine before and after the outbreak of the war. I will first lay out the circumstances surrounding Chinese medicine during the ROC era. Exploring the circumstances surrounding Chinese medicine during wartime, my thesis investigates the issues that Chinese medicine history research has rarely touched upon relating to the relationship between Chinese medicine, war, and country. This thesis also aims to supplement the current discourse on the history of the Sino-Japanese War, which has been traditionally skewed towards politics and military, thereby providing a more comprehensive picture of this period of history.

Traditional Chinese Medicine Before and after the Outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War

Before the Sino-Japanese War, Chinese medicine physicians constantly sought access to the national health system and medical administration. In 1932, the Chinese medicine community put forward "Proposals to the Political Council to empower Chinese medicine physicians to implement health related policies", which stated that the authority of Chinese medicine physicians should be immediately transferred to the Ministry of the Interior and should be equal in status to the authority of Western doctors under the Department of Health. At that time, the Department of Health, the authority in charge of health care, was monopolized by Western doctors, and Chinese medicine physicians did not have opportunities to develop their practice. The proposal pointed out that the definition of "hygiene" by Western medicine was confined to "cleanliness"; however, Chinese medicine also included health care, dietetics, mental rehabilitation, and more. The Chinese medicine community argued that the government should allow policies giving administrative rights to Chinese medicine and hygiene (Wu Hanxian 1943, 83-84).
Even before the war, Chinese medicine had been incorporated into the national health management system. There was even a proposal to merge both Chinese medicine and Western medicine to form a "China denominated new age medicine" (Ren Qizhi 1937, 1). Most people at that time also felt the need to enhance Chinese medicine's status and to debunk the negative greedy image linked to Chinese medicine physicians at the time. Only by conducting fundamental research on Chinese medicine could China shed

its humiliating image of "the sick man of Asia", and only by ensuring the physical and mental well-being of its people could the Chinese people be strong again (Ni Shiying 1937, 15). Even though the "Chinese medicine regulations" were passed by the Nationalist government in 1936 and Chinese medicine physicians attained the same legal status as Western medicine doctors, health authorities still rested with the Western medicine-controlled Department of Health (Ye Yongwen 2013, 84). Despite these new legal regulations, before the outbreak of war, Chinese medicine physicians could still do extraordinarily little; they were insignificant in shouldering national and societal responsibilities.

In addition to the legal recognition, Chinese medicine physicians sought to attain the same educational rights as their Western medicine counterparts. For example, during the 3rd plenary session of the 5th General Assembly convened by the Kuomintang (KMT) in February 1937, Jiao Yitang (1879-1950), director of the Central Chinese Medicine Academy, and 53 others, proposed that the Ministry of Education should include Chinese medicine curriculum in the educational system. The legal right to run Chinese medicine schools was also approved by the KMT's central political council and was commissioned by the "Chinese Medicine Committee". The issue of equal rights for Chinese medicine education seemed to have been resolved at these initial stages. However, opposition to Chinese medicine existed throughout this process. For example, Wang Shijie (1891-1981), the then Minister of Education, wrote his concerns about the meeting in his diary: "It resulted in disappointment and suspicion for the majority of people, due to proposals to 'turn to the past' made by some people, such as the classical reading in elementary and junior high school proposal by He Jian, as well as the setting up of Chinese medicine schools by Jiao Yitang. This inevitably led to frustration by people responsible for advancing the educational cause; "turn to the past" inclinations would disappoint intellectuals and youth, leading them to take more extreme paths" (Wang Shijie 2012, 10). Chinese medicine capitalized on the Nationalist government's inclination at that time to "turn to the past" as a way to survive[1].

In general, however, the Chinese Medicine Committee under the Department of Health was a competent authority to regulate Chinese medicine businesses. Some within the Chinese medicine community, dissatisfied that the management of Chinese medicine businesses was handed over to the Western medicine-controlled Department of Health, planned further resistance. Some Chinese medicine physicians even hoped that the government would set up an institution such as the "Chinese Medicine Reorganization Committee", with administrative oversight equal to that of the Department of Health. Until the outbreak of war, the Chinese medicine community fought for equal medical rights (Zhang Hong-sheng 1942, 55-56). In addition, although the "provisional curriculum" of Chinese medicine had been announced, the textbook outline had not yet been announced and standard teaching materials were yet to be confirmed. Against this background, even though the Chinese medicine community had made progress in the fight for legal status, as of the start of the Sino-Japanese War, a standardized education system for Chinese medicine had not yet been established[2].

With the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War, the issue of Chinese medicine education was put on hold, and the development of Chinese medicine came to a near standstill. During the war, even though there was a large-scale reduction and suspension of medical publications, there were still calls for editorial journals to be continued and improved so that they could empower the Chinese medicine community to communicate more effectively (Zhang Ziying 1941, 3). After the outbreak of the war, the former Chinese Medicine Committee and some members of the Chinese Medicine Academy again launched the "Chinese Medical Education Society" in Chongqing, with members drafting the provisional general principles and curriculum for Chinese medicine schools, officially announced in May 1938. Wang Shijie voiced his opposition in his diary:

> In recent years, I have been a strong advocate of scientific medicine, establishing several medical schools and specialist schools for dentistry and pharmacy, and establishing a medical education committee under the

> Ministry of Education to serve as a design and monitoring authority for medical education in the country. If we continue with this progress, we will see a gradual increase in medical talent within the next few years and significant improvement in our people's health and health administration. However, there are some who are rigid in their thinking such as Chen Guofu, Chen Lifu and Jiao Yitang, who strongly advocate the idea of Chinese medicine currently. Most of their remarks are not credible. Yesterday, Minister Chen Lifu reorganized the Medical Education Committee and appointed Jiao Yitang as a committee member. I could not help but fear for the future of scientific medical education. (Wang Shijie 2012, 112)

Such opposition showed that Chinese medicine education was on the right track. In times of war, however, the whole country was embattled, and it was difficult to implement the ideal form of Chinese medicine education from the perspective of the Chinese medicine industry. The Chinese medicine physicians in zones occupied by the Japanese were less likely to engage in the war and continue to call for reforms within the Chinese medicine profession. This division made it impossible to forge a national consensus regarding Chinese medicine while the war was ongoing.

The war deepened the crisis in the development of Chinese medicine, and there seemed to be no viable solution. However, some areas saw a turnaround in their fortunes. Before the outbreak of war, the Chinese medicine community became cognizant of the importance of unity in speaking out together and demanding inclusion in the national development discourse, gradually organizing themselves. The "solidarity" of the Chinese medicine community continued to foment until, in 1929, considering the proposal to abolish Chinese medicine (Wang Mingfan 1937, 16), their solidarity eventually coalesced into the question of "what can Chinese medicine do for the country?". Such a consensus had already begun to form before the war; however, the outbreak of war reinforced the notion. At that time, the Chinese medicine community believed that the established academic reorganization reforms should be continued. However, in response to the war mobilization, nationalist sentiments became even more popular, and Chinese medicine continued to discuss its value from the standpoint of inherent culture impact and place in the national culture. Chinese medicine also used the example of "broad science" to illustrate the value of Chinese medicine in scientific development (Zhang Hong-sheng 1942, 61). These narratives were continued into the war, albeit with some distinctive characteristics and remarks.

One reader, Wang Mingfan, pointed out that a global war was about to break out, and in a world where only the fittest survive, one must do everything within their power to gather war supplies. He pointed out that if war cannot be avoided, where would the "Chinese medicine physicians" run to? He wrote in a sarcastic tone, "would they escape to the back of the home front to treat flu and cough?" During the Sino-Japanese War, medical students were criticized for knowing only scientific knowledge but not how to win, or the importance of winning, the war and rebuilding the country. Medical students who were interested only in studying and eschewed politics were seen as a disgrace to the nation. People who studied medicine were included in the construction and modernization of the country during the war, which applied to students of both Chinese and Western medicine (Chen Liyu 1940, 30-32).

Before the war, Chinese medical research societies were established in various regions, and the outbreak of the political events strengthened the unity of the Chinese medicine community and its ties to the state. For example, after the Xi'an incident, the Chongqing Society of Chinese Medical Science and Research held a meeting to support the country and its leader Chiang Kai-shek. The meeting also mentioned rejuvenating the health of citizens and producing publications to educate the public about the concept of health and to enable Chinese medicine to "heal the country"[3]. After the outbreak of the war, Chinese medicine books put more emphasis on "saving the nation" (Wu Hanxian 1943, 89). Another example of this nationalistic rhetoric was the 1938 Chinese Medicine Festival commemoration, which lacked the atmosphere of a commemoration. An author pointed out in his speech, "Chinese medicine should heal, rescue, donate money and contribute during a national disaster, and wholeheartedly support the only one who loves and

promotes Chinese medicine, our leader General Chiang" (Bin 1938, 1). This discourse of Chinese medicine's involvement with the state is associated with the rise of nationalism and its continuity.
Other relevant remarks also focused on the nation and the fortunes of its people. For example, there were remarks such as "Chinese medicine lacks organizational research, is overshadowed by Western medicine, and is on the brink of being abolished. It should focus on academic research, form organizations, improve the health of its people and reduce fatalities". In other words, organizational research is not just academic in nature, but also shoulders the new mission of Chinese medicine, which is to improve people's health and reduce the financial burden from prescription drugs[4]. Many Chinese medicine physicians also pointed out that despite China having an illustrious history in medicine, the nation was in gradual decline. According to these Chinese medicine physicians, this was because people did not appreciate nor make use of Chinese medicine, which would have allowed Chinese medicine to shoulder the responsibility of rejuvenating the nation and its people (Zemin 1938). The purpose of medicine should not be constrained to saving individuals but to ensure the health and lives of citizens in times of war. He Yingfu mentioned, "the responsibility of Chinese medicine should be manifested in the manufacture and development of new drugs, the collaboration of the industry to participate in rescue work on the ground, and the rescue of refugees at the home front (He Yingfu 1939, 8)". These remarks highlight the trends in Chinese medicine before and after the outbreak of the war. The actual actions relevant to Chinese medicine should also be explored in depth.

Rescue and Medical Treatment in War

After the outbreak of the war, a reader commented on a newspaper column that seeing the constant soliciting of military doctors in newspapers reminded one of the problems of the soldiers. But was there a shortage of military doctors? The truth may be that the government was reluctant to train Chinese medicine physicians to enter the military medical system. Chinese Medicine hospitals and schools, during the early years of the ROC era, had already adopted the scientific knowledge of anatomy, physiology, and chemistry. They were many medically trained individuals who were unable to serve their country as military doctors because of the differences, controversies, and rivalry between Chinese and Western medicine (Han Spirit 1938).
Chinese medicine was "serving the country" in other ways. After the Battle of Shanghai began in 1937, Jiao Yitang and General Zhu Ziqiao (1874-1941) established the Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital, which was then shifted to an even larger area due to increasing numbers of injured soldiers and civilian refugees. Back then, an ongoing Western medicine "revolution" occurred in China. The Chinese medical professionals believed that a self-manufacturing Western medicine already appeared in China, demonstrating China's modern medicine could be self-sufficient without relying on assistance from Western countries (Pi Kuo-Li 2019, 27-47).
What about the Chinese Medicine Revolutionary Movement? One author pointed out that the Nanjing Central Medical Center Ambulance Hospital was later enlarged with Yu Youren (1879-1964), Sun Ke (1891-1973), Juzheng (1876-1951), Kong Xiangxi (1880-1967), Chen Lifu (1900-2001), and others assigned as directors. The hospital was moved to the first model prison in Jiangsu Province, and in addition to having the capability to perform internal and surgical operations, the hospital was expanded to contain more than 1,000 beds, with more doctors and nurses being hired. The Military Medical Department under the Ministry of Military Affairs, the Department of Health, the Ministry of Health, the Rejuvenation Affairs Committee, the Central National Medical Center, the Red Cross, and other agencies were all present at the Injury and Rescue Design Committee meeting that convened in Nanjing. At the meeting, Jiao Yitang proposed that, "it is better to adopt a combination of Chinese and Western Medicine for rescuing and treating

wounded soldiers and civilian refugees to achieve a more effective outcome". The proposal was passed at the meeting, and the Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital's future was considered promising[5].

Due to the imminent fall of Nanjing in mid-October 1937, the hospital was moved to Hankou. The main hospital was set up in Chongqing subsequently, with two branches established in Wan County, Xi'an. When the hospital was initially established, the Central Chinese Medicine Academy ordered all province's national medical organizations to set up rescue training and rescue teams, including larger ones like the Shanghai Chinese Medicine Injury and Rescue Hospital, the Chinese Medicine Community Rescue Team, the Hangzhou Nursing Home for Injured Soldiers, and the Hubei Chinese Medicine Community Service Organization. Other respondents included members from the Overseas Chinese Medicine Association in Hong Kong, as well as Chinese medicine organizations in the Philippines and other places who returned to China to work as rescue workers. The two branches in Xi'an also trained rescue teams operating in the battlefields of the south of China. The battle slogans from the north were "protecting Chinese health with Chinese Medicine", or the spirit of "fighting the war like revolutionaries". The Chinese Medicine Revolution allowed the demands of war to be met with Chinese Medicine that had been enhanced by and merged with science[6].

Funding for the Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital was set aside regularly by the Ministry of Military Affairs for purposes such as food expenses and medical care expenses for soldiers. Other sources of funding include the National Rejuvenation Affairs Committee with Zhu Qinglan as its chairperson, the Central Chinese Medicine Academy, the Ningbo Clansmen's Association, and other charitable organizations. Therefore, this unit was neither an official unit under the government nor a traditional charitable organization, but rather a demonstration of the Chinese medicine community's desire to get involved in national affairs and obtain national recognition during the war[7]. Subsequently, as Nanjing was on the brink of falling, the hospital was shifted to Hankou. Each shift in location required the assistance and contribution of medical workers in various regions, and expanded possibilities for people everywhere to understand and participate in Chinese medicine's war effort.

For example, in addition to its existing sources of funding, the Hankou Branch received funding from the "Hubei Chinese Medicine Community Home Front Service Organization". Kong Geng (1873-1950), a member of the Hubei Provincial Chinese Medicine Branch, also called for the establishment of the "Home Front Service Organization" which included rescue crews, treatment centers, pharmaceutical companies, and more. Kong Geng also held banquets for military and political leaders and socialites from all occupations in Wuhan, including He Chengjuan (1882-1961), Wu Guo Zhen (1903-1984), and Yan Lisan (1892-1944)[8]. When the Nanjing group arrived, Jiao Yitang negotiated with Ran Xuefeng (1879-1963), Kong Geng, and the Wuhan military authorities to establish the first branch of the Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital in Hankou, with Ran serving as the chair of the newly formed board of directors. Later, when Jiao Yitang went to Chongqing, these organizational experiences and bylaws were assembled and published in a book. He pointed out that many Chinese medicine physicians throughout the country were doing the same thing, coming together to do their part in the war against Japan[9].

For example, the rescue team of the Huabei Chinese Medicine School also rushed to the Suiyuan front line with the Red Cross flag and the Red Cross armband to rescue wounded soldiers (Fan Zhengren 1937, 11). According to the hospital's report, the Shandong Chinese Medicine Home Front Hospital received more than 800 refugees and wounded soldiers, with more than 70 people suffering from severe bone and muscular injuries. On one hand, all the wounded were treated with traditional Chinese medicine techniques, with no surgical removals or amputations. The report also illustrated the achievements of the Nanjing and Hubei Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital in traditional Chinese medicine injury and rescue techniques, such as pain relief, hemostasis, and orthopedics. On the other hand, both new and old Chinese and Western methods were adopted for disinfection and rescue. The report emphasized the medical techniques of Chinese medicine and called for it to be included in the military medical system

as soon as possible (Han Spirit 1938). There was already a "Chinese Medicine Research Association" in Sichuan, and in 1938, the "Chinese Medicine Rescue Team" was established. Its personnel changed frequently, but the team continued to be in existence throughout the war[10]. Luoyang also set up a "Chinese Medicine Rescue Training Class", with the then Red Cross Commissioner Zhang Junguang visiting the class in person when it began[11].

Before the Sino-Japanese War, some Chinese medicine schools had set up "rescue classes (teams)", but the number enrolled occupied only a small proportion of the country's Chinese medicine physicians. Wang Mingfan (1937) mentioned that the old Chinese medicine physicians should also be trained as soon as possible because "no one should idle around during times of war". He recommended the following:

> (1) All Chinese Medicine physicians up to 45 years old must be trained in military rescue barring exceptional reasons. (2) Recruit Chinese personnel that specialized in the treatment of bruises and bone grafting and train them in techniques of retrieving bullets and bone grafting. (3) Each Chinese medicine school should increase the number of classes at its location to enroll young Chinese medicine physicians. (4) The Central Chinese Medicine Academy should send designated training personnel to provinces and cities that do not have a Chinese medicine school.

Despite the above understanding, mobilizing an entire country had become difficult due to the war. As a result, the Chinese Medicine Rescue teams in various locations were often suspended for reasons of "application failure", rendering them useless. The editor of a medical journal admitted that, during the war, although Chinese medicine physicians were less effective in treating wounds due to gunshots and poisoned gas, they could help with treating fall injuries and fractures. However, there was a lack of facilitators and advocates to organize and mobilize doctors[12].

Fortunately for historians, there was a Chinese medicine rescue hospital at the time, making further research possible. The original plans were to establish a Chinese Medicine Hospital Branch at Hankou, before building another branch at Wuchang and the main hospital at Chongqing. Chinese Medicine rescue teams were set up at Wuchang, Hankou, and Hanyang[13]. Historians can also use records from the "Hubei Chinese Medicine Community Home Front Service Organization Hospital Briefing". For example, in "Article 2: The regiment 's hospitals specialize in the utilization of Chinese medicine's inherent advantages and adopting Western medicine surgery to treat injured soldiers and refugees in various camps, successfully completing their rescue missions"[14]. The rescue hospital used both Western medicine and "Chinese medicine technology to treat internal and external injuries and adopt new equipment methods"[15]. The rescue hospital was equipped with attending physicians, resident physicians, assistant resident physicians, and intern physicians. This organization was not the norm for traditional Chinese medicine but was a brand-new form of hospital supported primarily by Chinese medicine but complemented with Western medicine[16].

In addition, the "Hubei Chinese Medicine Home Front Service Rescue Team Organization Regulations" stipulated that "anyone who has graduated from the Hubei Chinese Medicine Rescue Training Course and received a Chinese Medicine certification, or has graduated from the Chinese Medicine School and undergone training, can serve as rescue team members"[17]. This regulation demonstrates the wide range of areas allowing Chinese medicine physicians to participate in military emergency services. They could first treat the injured soldiers and then transfer them to the home front hospital. The "Regulations of the Hubei Chinese Medicine Home Front Service Organization" also stated, "our mission is to support the government's war efforts and to manufacture various new drugs for the purpose of rescue and treatment"[18]. Chinese medicine rescue hospitals made use of medicines produced by Chinese Medicine pharmaceutical companies to promote medical developments.

After the fall of Wuhan, in other areas of medical care the focus of the entire government shifted to Sichuan, including the resumption of Chinese medicine development, with the most important devel-

opment being the "Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital". The "Chinese Medicine Monthly" in Chongqing pointed out that "the Department of Health was planning to set up a Chinese Medicine hospital in the provisional capital in order to introduce scientific enhancements into Chinese medicine". The hospital was opened on May 15th, 1944, and the Chinese medicine physicians in charge were Zhang Jianzhai, Qiu Xiaotian, Hu Shucheng, Huan Shian, Zheng Manqing, and Wu Fuxian. These physicians were joined by Western medicine doctors and midwives[19]. In 1944, Cao Shushe and 25 other members of the Sichuan Senate proposed that more wards should be established as soon as possible. The general state of the hospital in the provisional capital was as follows:

> Regarding the establishment of the Chinese Medicine Hospital, after repeated recommendations by the committee, the government has set up a Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital in Yushi city. It has 4 internal and external pediatric and gynecological departments, along with 2 nurses. It has the scale of a modern hospital. The low fees charged sets an example for public hospitals in the country, with each patient only charged a registration fee of 10 yuan. The military, their family members, and poor patients receive free medical treatment. This spirit is in line with that of international public hospitals and highly praised by residents of the provisional capital. However, the hospital has little funds approved for the year, and is still unable to set up medical wards or purchase equipment as planned. The provisional capital hospital is the only Chinese medical institution in the country. The government, with the purpose of safeguarding and advocating Chinese medicine, should raise funds and strive to be self-sufficient, ensure the advancement of the health of its citizens, and therefore reap the benefits of medical revolution[20].

The hospital experienced a critical lack of medical resources. Despite the national scope of the provisional capital's Chinese medicine hospital, it faced operational challenges and found difficulty expanding and providing medical services to a larger population.

The hospital director at that time, Chen Yu, always emphasized that the funding father of the Republic of China, Sun Yat-sen once said that after recovering the knowledge and capability of Chinese Medicine, there is a need to learn from the advantages of Europe and America. Chen believed this was true for both Chinese medicine reforms and for the rejuvenation of the nation. Even before the war, he put forth that an experimental institution for the use of Chinese medicine should be established. Also, the diagnoses of diseases in that institution should completely follow the latest scientific examination methods, and after the pathogen has been identified, Chinese medicine prescriptions should then be used for treatment. Treatment should be validated with experimental statistics and then by scientific statistics to confirm efficacy. Under Chen, all these procedures could be implemented in the provisional capital Chinese medicine hospital. He hoped to establish advanced Chinese medical training classes and allow more young people to intern at the hospitals on a rotational basis (Chen Yu 1944, 1).

In 1944, this vision was realized when the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Social Affairs, the provisional capital Chinese Medicine Hospital, and the China Medicine Education Association jointly established the "Advanced Chinese Medicine Research Class". Now, for the first time, Chinese medicine had a nationally established medical institute that connected treatment, research, and education and an advanced research institute. Lecturers at the institute then included the educational director Hu Guangci, Liu Yuzhou who specialized in prescription, Rao Fenghuang, Zhang Maojin, Tang Yangchun who specialized in clinical experiments. Researchers included Zhang Binghui, Wang Guoxun, Gu Muyong, Su Jihui, and Yang Tiechao[21]. Initial participants included Chen Xunzhai, Gao Deming, and Chen Xiaofeng, with a total of approximately 50 students[22].

Despite the continuing education at Chinese medicine schools during the war, the lack of nationally established Chinese Medicine schools throughout the country remained an issue. There also were no standardized textbooks, which lead to members of the Chinese medicine community adopting different and

conflicting methods. This resulted in a neglect of traditional knowledge, a lack of innovation, and a subsequent inability to study Western medicine in an in-depth manner (Tang Zhen 1944, 4-5).
Chinese Medicine physician Deng Bing Kui felt that the Chinese Medicine Associations in the various provinces, cities, and counties should push the Central Party to promote Chinese medicine academic knowledge, acknowledge it as a key policy for implementation, and to order the Ministry of Education to actively launch Chinese medicine schools and specialist schools. Deng even put forth that "a Chinese medicine school should be established in the Central University, four Chinese medicine specialist schools should be established nationwide, and each province, city, and county to have one Chinese medicine lecture workshop respectively". The government should also consider providing subsidies to ensure long term sustainability of the initiative. This would allow the advantages of both Chinese and Western Medicine to be utilized, leading to higher quality graduates who could shoulder the public health and hygiene duties.
Regarding hospital locations, Deng proposed that the Bureau of Health should provide funding to set up a Central Chinese-Western Hospital near the newly built Chinese medicine school to "allow students to learn treatment methods combining Chinese and Western Medicine experiments. A Chinese-Western Medicine Hospital should be set up nearby each Chinese medicine specialist school, with a smaller hospital set up in each province, country, and city, respectively. Such experiments and internships are more methodological and allow both Chinese and Western medicine learning, hence enabling rapid improvement and enhancing the health of our people" (Deng Bingkui 1944, 2). However, this call during the war did not materialize.
Even though the establishment of Chinese Medicine Advanced Research Classes and the Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital led to the first national hospital and research class, the numbers of resulting talented students were insufficient. In addition, the regular Chinese medicine schools were unable to maintain regular teaching, which led to the emergence of many short-term rescue training classes. For example, the "Chongqing Training Center" established in 1944, which played an essential role as a regional provisional educational unit, was also a jointed member of local education board. Zhang Jianzhao and Li Jianxun were appointed as emeritus center directors, Li Fuguang as center director, Shen Zhonggui as educational director, Shen Shoujin, Liu Yuzhou and Wu Huilin as the respective team heads, and renowned Chinese medicine physicians in Chongqing as lecturers. The training center was praised as a bulwark of "protecting the health of citizens"[23]. In 1945, considering the lack of medical drugs and health workers during the war, which in turn affected the war effort, the Central Chinese Medicine Academy ordered Zhao Fengjiao to set up the "health personnel training class" to mobilize the nation's doctors and provide training for health workers. The method of implementation was to compile various teaching materials, including anti-poisoning, rescue, and internal medical and surgical procedures. The compilation included Chinese-Western medicine content, including endocrine knowledge, and Chinese medicine knowledge about the internal organs.
Zhao Fengjiao, the director of training and the person in charge of compiling teaching materials, stated the following:

> I hope that the Chinese medicine community can unite as one to push for the establishment of the National Chinese Medicine Physicians Association as early as possible. This will allow Chinese medicine physicians to consolidate, participate in democracy, and become the health administrative personnel required as per Chiang Kai-Shek's "China's Fate". I also call upon the government to set up large scale Chinese medicine pharmaceutical companies to ensure self-sufficiency. The government should also establish Chinese-Western hospitals and a national medical drug research center[24].

> Be steadfast in our determination to rejuvenate Chinese medicine, adopt scientific methods and enhance traditional culture. Encourage Chinese medicine to fulfill their purpose of "serving the public health interest

and as battlefield rescue personnel", "Chinese medicine as a form of National Defense", and "Incorporating Science into Chinese medicine", thereby achieving success in the war, rebuilding the nation, and eventual prosperity[25].

From the perspective of Chinese medicine physicians, these ideas were an improvement on the debate between Chinese and Western medicine; the development of Chinese medicine should not stagnate due to semantic arguments. In addition to calls for Chinese medical administration and medical care to be independent, there was also discouraging news for the Chinese medical community. The compilation "Health and Physical Education during War" from 1939, despite including the names and position titles for health institutes, the health bureau, and its associated authorities, did not introduce the Central Chinese Medicine Academy or the Chinese Medicine Committee, clearly demonstrating the irrelevancy of Chinese medicine in the areas of public hygiene and health promotion[26]. The exception was Gao Deming, an excellently performing employee at the Bureau of Health, who was personally called upon by Chiang Kai-Shek, a member of the Chinese Medicine Committee. Gao graduated from the Zhejiang Chinese Medicine Specialist School and the Central Chinese Medicine Academy Special Research Class and by then had been working at the Bureau of Health for six years. He was a regulation review committee member at the Bureau of Health, and the Assistant Director of the Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital Internal Treatment Center. A medical journal reported that Chinese medicine physicians were able to shoulder modern health administrative duties, an example of ways in which Chinese medicine physicians were involved in public affairs[27].
Other public medical affairs were discussed such as the order by the Ministry of Military in 1944 for Chinese medicine physicians to conduct treatment for injured and ill soldiers. This would be done by local service teams according to the size of various regions and organized by the Chinese Medicine Association. The person in charge, or team leader, of the local Chinese Medical Association was to bring a register of team members to the local military authority and county or city government for recording. Medical diagnosis would be free. The Chinese medical physicians participating may be temporarily exempted from conscription[28]. The Chongqing Chinese Medicine Association also responded to the government's youth military policy and conducted funding and donation drives for the family members of young people joining the military[29]. In February 1944, Li Jianhong, Head of the China Women's Self-Defense Association, Chongqing Branch, added a Chinese medicine team to its voluntary treatment department to resolve the scarcity of medical drugs and the excessive number of military personnel family members. Chinese medicine physicians such as Li Fuguang, Zhao Fengjiao, Xu Jueyuan, and Fang Le were also hired. The physicians were willing to help on a voluntary basis without charging expenses as they felt that Li Jianhong was promoting the development of Chinese medicine[30]. There were many other donations, drives, and different voluntary medical services that are not mentioned in detail.

Chinese Medicine Physicians' Discussion of Surgery and Orthopedics during the War

Chinese medicine schools included 96 hours (about 4 days) of teaching in "rescue training during times of war", specifying that "orthopedics and traumatology should be merged under surgery and that Western surgery methods should also be taught"[31]. At the outbreak of the war, there were only 5,000 registered Western medicine doctors nationwide, but 100,000 registered Chinese medicine physicians. However, it was disappointing that Chinese medicine physicians could not be sent to the front line to rescue and treat wounded soldiers. Sun Songjiao pointed out that in the wars fought in ancient times in China military doctors were, obviously, Chinese medicine physicians. Why was it that Western medicine doctors looked down on the efficacy of Chinese medicine physicians on the battlefield? Sun thought it was because the

recent compilation of Chinese medicine at the Chinese Medicine Academy had been mostly focused on internal medicine rather than surgery, which had been neglected (Sun Songjiao 1938, 2-3). Compilation of information on Chinese medicine surgery became a critical issue during the war.

Furthermore, Ruo Yu, saw the Sino-Japanese War as a war of attrition. For Ruo, the most salient issue faced in the war was a lack of Western medicine doctors. Yet, the government neglected highly skilled Chinese medicine physicians who could help resolve this issue of scarcity, one of the results of having neglected the training of such professionals in the past. He called upon the government to strengthen the training of Chinese medicine surgeons. He argued that Jiangsu province had already implemented province-wide surgery training. The regulation stated that physicians who were not willing to undergo Chinese medicine surgery training would be stripped of their medical practice licenses by the local government and ordered to cease operations. He believed that urgent times, such as war, required enforced surgery training to be expanded nationwide (Ruo Yu 1938).

Promulgated by Jiangsu province in 1936, the "Jiangsu Province Surgery Training Guidelines for Chinese Medicine" stipulated that the training period was to be 4 months. The subjects taught included an introduction to surgery, disinfection, emergency rescue and bandage application, and basic military training. Training and teaching materials were provided for free, but trainees had to provide their own food and clothing[32]. This training class was conducted by a provincial-level administrative medical academy. Sixty trainees were recruited for the first class. Special importance was given to training Chinese medicine physicians in disinfectant knowledge, as Chinese medicine traditionally had no concept of disinfectants or equipment for disinfecting, leading to a high number of fatalities among soldiers from infections related to surgery[33].

At the onset of the Lugouqiao incident, the newspapers published the "Health Report" by Wang Jungyu from the Henan Chinese Medicine Advancement and Research Society. It included two columns on "red wounds" (surgical) and "antiseptic", which were specially planned in response to the impending war[34]. Tang Yangchun argued that Chinese medicine should, in times of national hardship, accelerate research on surgical treatment methods and include both Chinese and Western knowledge. Research should also be conducted on toxic gas chemistry and protection from poisonous gas, as well as on "Chinese medicine drugs for traumatology". The fact that Western drugs were blocked from entering China by the Japanese military made it necessary to conduct research on possible Chinese medicine alternatives. For example, Chinese medical physicians argued that anti-corrosive Western medicine drugs could be replaced for "disinfection" purposes by medical oil gels that also possessed anti-corrosive characteristics and should be further developed for use (Tang Yangchun 1939, 7-8). Yuan Junting stated that most members of the Chinese medicine community were not formally trained in chemistry and hence knew little about protection from poison gas. Even so, they should increase contact with and enhance their understanding of new chemistry knowledge and publicize its importance to society. The Chinese medicine community knew the importance of such actions for the consolidation of the home front (Yuan Junting 1938).

Similarly for surgery and surgical drugs, the Chinese medicine community also published their contributions on surgical and wound treatments in newspapers and magazines. Zhou Fusheng used a battle in Guizhou against the Communists that happened one year before the Sino-Japanese War as an example to illustrate the positive effects of Chinese medicine surgical treatment. In the example, Wang Hongru from the Nationalist forces was wounded by a firearm that also broke several bones. Western medicine doctors decided that it could not be healed, and amputation was necessary to save his life. Wang insisted on trying Chinese medicine and was transferred to a Chinese medicine hospital for treatment. One of the more incredible descriptions entails Wang's ingestion of a Chinese medicine bone healing pill. Although X-ray scans had shown several broken bones, after several dosages of the medicine and retrieving more than 20 pieces of broken bones from the wound, X-ray scans showed that the injured area had healed after a few weeks of treatment:

> The incredible bone healing pill, invented by Chongqing's Chinese medicine physician Zhang Letian, upon several successful experiments, is now being advocated by Jiao Yitang, director of the Central Chinese Medicine Academy. Funding is also being carried out, and the medicine was used to treat more than a thousand injured soldiers at the Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital in Sichuan's Jiangbei province.

The pill was made from herbs that were not recorded in ancient *Bencao Gangmu* (Compendium of Materia Medica). Zhou Fusheng mentioned that the scientific application method and manufacturing method were publicized in the "Explanations on Herbal Medicine" (Zhou Fusheng 1938a, 3-4)[35].
Western medicine doctors often used amputation on soldiers as a last resort because the soldier's body would be crippled once amputation is performed. Even Western medical physicians urged against amputating a patient's limbs. Western medicine doctors pointed out that there was no way to deal with bone infections, sepsis spreading to organs, and gangrene of the limbs. In fact, the dangers of pus and gangrene were emphasized in traditional language (Yu Shangren 1939, 19). Chinese medicine physicians were proud that the development of Chinese medicine surgical treatment had, by then, been aware of such issues and been able to resolve them (Li Jianming 2011, 32-38). Drugs produced by the "Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital" during the war included "anti-pus skin gel", "anti-corrosive soft gel", "simple anti-pus powder", and more, providing the appropriate corresponding treatment drugs to prevent the need for amputation (Shen Zhongkui 1943, 57-59).
Right after the opening of the Central Chinese Medicine Academy's Nanjing War Rescue Hospital, wounded soldiers at the hospital were all treated with Chinese medicine. "Retrieval of bullet shells and bone grafting were performed with patients recovering fully without amputation which would have crippled them physically". The hospital had 300 beds with most patients suffering from bullet wounds and broken bones[36]. Chinese medicine physicians frequently mentioned surgery and traumatology methods. For example, Wang Mingbo wrote the following:

> Rescue surgeries remind us of the brilliant surgical procedures for bone grafting in Chinese medicine, which is one that has frequently drawn praise from foreign doctors; such testing times demand us to widely recruit such talents as professors, even though they could be uncouth as times, which is harmless in practice. Hence, there is no need to overlook them totally despite certain flaws they have. A certain military leader in Guangdong was once troubled by the fact that his injured soldiers became crippled after undergoing Western medicine treatments and sought to recruit Chinese medicine talent. The results were miraculous and outshone those of Western medicine. A certain newspaper in Shanghai reported on it back then.

Wang felt that the country should consolidate such considerable talents to allow Chinese medicine to compete with Western medicine (Wang Mingfan 1937, 17). The first factor in the development of Chinese medicine traumatology was the Japanese blockage of Western medical drugs during the war, affecting military doctors, most of who practiced Western medicine. Second, Chinese traumatology, despite its long history, was orally passed down from master to disciple. The Chinese medical profession also had a habit of strict adherence to secret prescriptions, resulting in the loss of many effective medicines; the government was called on to reward transparency and award patents to protect medical advancements (Zhou Fusheng 1938b, 2). Tang Yangchun questioned what kind of "Chinese Medicine Surgery" to research. For Tang, the treatment of broken bones, inflammation of the sinews and pus, without dissection, should be the focus of research during times of war (Tang Yangchun 1939, 8).
Other popular publications during the war included *Medical Advancements*, edited by Shen Bochao, which included practical theories and drug prescriptions on Chinese medicine surgery and traumatology, as well as Chinese medicine's involvement with the war. Shen used the characteristics of traditional Chinese medicine to explain his argument. For example, wounds caused by gunshots should be treated with Chi-

nese medicine "Bai Shao Lian" to cool the patient's blood. "Huang Qi" should then be applied to enhance 'qi' and strengthen the 'yin'; Western medicine applied cardiac stimulants to the same symptoms, but that only served to constrict the blood vessels which increased the patient's blood pressure. It was, therefore, better to adopt the Chinese medicine method which benefits the blood and 'qi'. Shen believed that Western medicine had advanced technology but was still lacking in "physiological treatment". He believed that many soldiers were crippled or had limbs amputated because of excessive bleeding, rising heat deficiency, blood deficiency leading to malnourished bones, and blackening and rotting of those bones. Therefore, he believed that cooling and nourishing the blood was the best strategy and was more effective than Western medicine in relieving heat. Shen believed that there was a need to continue research on Chinese medicine treatment to achieve victory in war[37]:

> One's organs depend on nourishment of the blood, preserving vitality, allowing blood flow and strength. Qi is what allows blood flow in the main vein. Loss of blood equates to the diminishing of Qi. What exactly is Qi? Body temperature. A low body temperature equates to a lack of Qi and blood clotting, while blood wounds would lead to low temperature and Qi clotting.

Shen Bochao believed that Western medical research on gunshot wounds achieved an elevated level of accuracy but still did not understand the principle of "treatment of Qi and blood", which required the supplementation of Chinese medicine knowledge[38].

Li Gechen mentioned in the preface to *Advancement in Medical Drugs* that the book's purpose was to enhance the physical health of the nation, protect the peace and prosperity of society, and provide healing to injured soldiers. The compilation of this book was already quite different from the goals of traditional Chinese medicine's "classical' perspectives and reflects the changing perspectives on Chinese medicine brought on by the war[39] . *Advancement of Medical Drugs* had a unique characteristic; the book included "Surgery Treatment"; content rarely seen in contemporary Chinese medicine surgical books. For example, one of the paragraphs reads as follows:

"The essence of liquorice is used to cleanse blood and stains, and the antiseptic and muscle-breeding "surgical dacheng" powder is applied externally, while the cotton yarn made of liquorice is used for covering the wound. The effect of liquorice is to detoxify the blood and stains, which is beneficial to the pores, so that the medicinal gas in the cells can be discharged, the muscle tissues can be brought back to a balanced state, and rapid muscle-generation can take place".

Shen believed that this approach would supplement the deficiencies of Western medicine[40]. He did not call for Chinese medicine physicians to develop Western style surgical capabilities but hoped for them to focus on the development of Chinese medicine's inherent strengths, which were the leveraging of internal organ treatment methods for surgical wounds. He also stated that it was regretful that Chinese medicine gels and pills were, for the moment, not practical for gunshot wounds sustained during the war, as there were no narratives found in traditional Chinese medicine books on surgical wounds due to explosions and gunshots. However, "saving the injured through internal organ management, leveraging the strengths of Chinese medicine to stop blood loss and strengthen the heart in accordance with the gunshot wound severity" is unheard-of ancient Chinese medicine[41]. Shen Bochao also self-manufactured some Chinese medicine prescriptions such as an oral "antiseptic pill for strengthening the heart and stopping blood loss" and an externally applied "antiseptic powder for skin". Most of his prescriptions stemmed from and were inspired by ancient medical books. For example, the *Surgical Encyclopedia* could be used for gunshot wound treatment and proved to be just as effective as Western medicine. He also briefly discussed various other traumatic injuries as well as vein and bone injuries[42].

The Chinese medicine physician Deng Bingxuan felt that "our country's people are reputed to be physically weak and the average annual fatality rate from diseases is much higher than in other countries". Bingx-

uan believed that the Chinese medicine community should make active contributions towards people's health. He was inspired by the National Health Movement launched by the Chinese Health Education Society in 1943 and called on the Chinese medicine community to think about related programs. He proposed that all province, city, and county branches of Chinese medicine, Chinese medicine associations, and Chinese medicine academies should consider the feasibility of related issues, conduct research on Chinese medicine, and quickly cure various diseases. Such developments should then be publicly published in medical journals to spur further improvements. In addition, to advance treatment methods and relevant academic research, he recommended to

> Establish a lecture workshop for Chinese medicine internal and surgical subjects, recruit knowledgeable and highly experienced Chinese medicine physicians and Western medicine doctors to impart necessary knowledge for all doctors such as anatomy, physiology, bacteriology, parasitology, pathology, pharmacology, therapeutics, prescription, and diagnostics. These subjects would be taught outside of normal class times with discretionary tuition fees. All Chinese medicine physicians in operation who felt a need to enhance or revise their knowledge could attend the lectures. (Deng Bingkui 1944,1-2)

In response, Chinese medicine physicians in Chongqing established a "Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Surgical Lecture Workshop", recruited Chinese medicine physicians, provided six months of training, and adopted the "latest scientific methods to impart Chinese medicine surgical academic knowledge" in the hope of treating soldiers and civilians injured due to the war[43]. However, the lecture format was changed so training was delivered solely via mail with no physical lectures. News was released that students would only meet in person after the lecturer's recovery, at which time lectures would cover drug preparation, injections, and other surgery techniques, all of which demonstrate that Western injection techniques were being taught along with Chinese medicine[44]. Teachers Gu Yili, Zhou Xiaozhi, Yan Yifu, Deng Bingxun, Chen Wenbin, Ma Yun, and others compiled lecture notes on physiology, hygiene, bacteria, parasites, bandages, first aid, surgical pathology, pharmacology, and treatment methods, showing that Western medical knowledge had spread within the field of Chinese medicine, a trend that was further accelerated by the war[45].

Related Discussions on Drugs and Preparations

Medical drugs are the staple of medical treatment and the main weapon against diseases. The outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War brought the issue of a "National Defense Economy" to the forefront, especially regarding prescription drugs. One author, Zhang Hongsheng, criticized the government for neglecting the value of Chinese medical herbs, but for even allowing Western medicine doctors to manage Chinese medicine, hence crushing the free economy of Chinese medical herbs (Zhang Hong-sheng 1942, 62-63). Therefore, Chinese medicine physicians at that time widely believed that self-reliance was required to solve existing challenges, such as applying scientific methods, consolidating Chinese medicine, establishing large Chinese medicine pharmaceutical factories to develop new dosage forms, learning from Western methods, and producing convenient medical pills that could be easily transported (Tang Yangchun 1939, 8). For example, the "Yunnan Provincial Government Public Paper" stressed that "the most important mission during the war is to strengthen the rescue industry". Replacing imported medicine with Chinese medicine drugs would lessen the nation's financial burden and alleviate concerns arising from the lack of medical supplies. To prevent the hoarding of prescriptions, the Central Chinese Medicine Academy published the "Call for Traumatology Prescription Gathering" in September 1938. Through local governments such as the Yunnan Provincial Government Administrative Department, the Central Chinese Medicine

Academy hoped that those with secret prescriptions would submit them to the Chongqing Chinese Medicine Academy for collection and manufacturing[46]. This trend for prescription drug self-reliance was an extension of the earlier demands of Chinese medicine traumatology treatment requirements.
"Must-Have Medicine", a book compiled for military doctors, physicians, and regular health workers, classified the effects of Chinese medicine into 26 types, including heat-relieving, astringent, diuretic, and stopping blood loss. The editor stated that this was compiled comprehensively based on reasonable academic solutions. He also classified certain Chinese medicines with no clear ingredients based on their medicinal effect as circulated[47]. The ingredients of traditional Chinese medicine were explained through the concept of Western medicine classification, and a simple preparation method was taught for the dispensers to identify the ingredients.
The scarcity of medical drugs was apparent exceedingly early in the northern Chinese theatre of the war against Japan. According to the Indian doctor Bejoy Kumar Basu in his description of the Eighth Route Army,

> Most areas have established large pharmaceutical factories, producing large quantity of gauzes, bandages, cotton wool, small quantities of Western medical drugs, and massive quantities of Chinese medical drugs, etc. Chinese medicine is effective in treating certain internal diseases and can also cure common surgical diseases. There are, however, still several diseases that cannot be as effectively treated as compared to Western medicine, such as malaria, diarrhea, reunification fever, typhoid fever, and black fever[48].

Li Weizhen pointed out that "the 'Zhuang Er Shen' or 'Red Pill' manufactured by the Eighth Route Army Pharmaceutical Factory was popular amongst the surrounding regions and throughout the entire army. Eight to nine out of every 10 soldiers who suffer from a poor mental state, poor appetite, and jaundice become stronger and sharper after consuming the 'Zhuang Er Shen'". This drug was made by using Chinese medical herbs such as Angelica sinensis, ginseng, and Huang Jie, which by then had been scientifically refined. They believed these phenomena could be referred to "promoting Chinese medicine"[49]. In addition, the "Bu Nao Duo" popular in Yan' and was manufactured by "Gao Yuan Pharmaceutical", and was made of Show Wu, Huang Qu, Angelica sinensis, and wolfberry[50]. In Northern China, the Communist army resourcefully used Chinese medicine to treat diseases during the war[51].
On the home front of the battlefield controlled by the Nationalist government, discourse on Chinese medicine manufacturing was mostly centered on worries about Japan's economic blockade of China since the outbreak of war, which spurred frequent discussions about the use of Chinese medicine. One article pointed out that although Chinese medicine had treatment value, it was not easy to manufacture nor administer, leading to challenges in using them during times of war. The Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital was later shifted to Sichuan, which was an important manufacturing location for Chinese medicine, rather than to Chongqing which was an important distribution center. Chen Lifu, Jiao Yitang and others, through the Chinese medicine committee under the Health Department and the Rejuvenation committee under the Central Chinese Medicine Academy, established the Chinese Pharmaceutical Factory, with Jiao serving as the Preparation Committee Chair, and Feng Zhitong, Director of the Health Department, responsible for the technical aspects[52]. The factory sets up chemical stoves and manufactured equipment such as syringes, lozenges, and cotton gauze. It used scientific methods to refine Chinese medicine and revealed that it would invite specialists to enhance Chinese medicine in the future, although it was mostly focused on supplies. The pharmaceutical factory had hoped from the beginning that the Chinese medicine community would contribute secret prescriptions, pills, gels, or powders for lab testing. Patents could even be awarded if effective medical drugs were invented in a bid to promote and protect scientific research on Chinese medicine[53]. Wu Zhengang, the president of the pharmaceutical factory, reported in 1940 that the finished products included rhubarb powder, sulphur huafen powder, licorice powder, Wuxing pills, Dujun pills, eye drops, Epsom salt, Astor oil, hydrochloric acid, and morphine while other

products were still undergoing experiments. The herbs originated from Xining and Beichuan, but were also from Yunnan, Guizhou, and Sichuan in the South. The herbs were intensively brewed and crushed by force into powder for preparation[54].

The Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital established by the Rejuvenation Committee and Central Chinese Medicine Academy had its own patented medicine, categorized for internal medicine and traumatology use, with open prescriptions, ingredient components, and preparation methods. Prescriptions were not necessarily based upon ancient methods but instead used new preparation methods. These include "Heji Antipyretics", "Biaoji Antipyretics", "Xinweihuo", and medical solutions made from Chinese herbs such as honeysuckle and chrysanthemum for cleansing of wounds, as well as "medical cotton for stopping blood loss" made from pomegranate peel and alum (Shen Zhongkui 1943, 55-60). Supervisory committee member Liu Jueming also established the "Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital" at Luoyang, emphasizing the improvement in medical herbs and enabling them to be used by the military. However, the efficacy of the medicine was unknown[55].

There were calls for the establishment of a standardized pharmacopoeia for Chinese medicine to make it more accurate and reliable, as well as calls for manufacturing medicinal powder for ease during transportation and consumption. More importantly, although physicians prescribed these medications, most of those managing Chinese medicine were merchants who did not possess scientific knowledge. The merchants thought that Chinese medicine was good as long as it was dry, and mistakenly thought that they could use water-damaged and moldy medications as long as these were dried out in the sun. They did not consider the deterioration in quality, and they cut corners, effectively reducing the efficacy, and damaging the reputation of Chinese medicine (Zhang Qinyan 1939, 1-4). There were also calls for traditional Chinese medical herbs to be manufactured into new drugs, for example making "Zhongjiang Soup" from Angelica sinensis, and "Ruosu" from malt (Li Xiyan 1945, 6-7). Newspapers and magazines suggested that new medicine should be manufactured by scientific methods during such challenging times for the nation. However, some Chinese medicines published in newspapers and magazines still seemed to be existing prescriptions with very few changes. For example, Yang Zhuoyin published the "Cholera Rescue Emergency Wine", which was the same recipe as traditional prescribed drugs, except that it was made into medicinal wine for more convenient use. The addition of some scientific explanations, such as for the sterilization of Chinese medicine and the strengthening of the heart, did not propel Chinese medicine above the narratives already in place before the war. The discussion required further in-depth investigation.

Near the end of the war, the author Ao Zheming wrote that even though victory was in sight after seven years of war, Western medicine supplies were still scarce. Chinese medicine physicians should leverage the knowledge learned and treat injured soldiers as well as their family members. There should be a twofold focus on responding to diseases afflicting people from all backgrounds. First, a focus should be on editing teaching notes and establishing Chinese medicine lecture workshops for internal medicine and surgical subjects, as well as teaching Chinese and Western medicine in accordance with the publicized teaching curriculum set by the Ministry of Education by lecturers who are well-versed in both Chinese and Western medicine. This would lay the foundation for the establishment of Chinese medicine specialist schools and further promote Chinese medicine. Chinese medicine research societies should also be established at the provincial, county, city, district, and village levels with meetings taking place once a week for a discussion on treatment methods, submitting prescriptions for research purposes, and publishing these descriptions in magazines to improve the academic standing of Chinese medicine.

Second, the focus should include the manufacturing of pills, powder, gels, and alcohol solutions from researched prescriptions. Experiments should first be conducted at Chinese medicine clinics or by medical service teams located on the home front, and then medications could be mass-produced in factories if deemed effective at treating millions of soldiers. This would solve the lack of Western medical supplies. Ao also cited, for example, rhubarb grinding wine, which could be used to treat swelling and pain, and

rhubarb paste, which could treat wounds and was comparable to Western medicine's iodine. The Jiegu Pill, Qi Li Powder, Yu Zhen Powder, Huisheng Pill, Ruyi Golden Powder, Xianfang Vitality Solution, and Muscle Regeneration powder were effective, tried, and tested medicines. Ao believed military medical units should order more of these medications from the Chinese medicine manufacturers for use on the frontline and at home front hospitals to treat injured soldiers (Ao Zheming 1944, 4).

Other discussions and proposals on the efficacy of Chinese medicine mostly focused on the public prevention of epidemics and poisonings. For epidemic prevention, Wu Hanxian pointed out that Chinese medicine focused on cleansing the air of toxins by burning wormwood and huoxiang or using guanzhong and rhubarb to cleanse toxicity from liquids. Chinese medicine also consisted of many medicinal pills and powders for rescue and emergency response purposes. Their efficacy was not inferior to preventive vaccination. Theses promoters emphasized that Chinese and Western medicines should have equal status in terms of receiving the health administration's funding and support, which would simultaneously benefit nation-building and improve the health of soldiers and civilians (Wu Hanxian 1943, 84-86). The war had brought untold death and suffering. For the soldiers and civilians, however, epidemics that broke out during and after the war were the biggest concern, especially the epidemics of typhoid and malaria in the Japanese occupied areas which were very severe. Unfortunately, "there was a lack of professional Chinese medicine texts on epidemic prevention studies, as well as relevant research conducted". The author further pointed out that Chinese medicine physicians preferred to use thermometers but did not pay attention to sanitizing procedures. He stressed the need for them to keep up with the times vis-à-vis sanitation and hygiene to avoid being shunted aside to irrelevancy (Zhuang Xuren 1940, 1-3).

The efficacy of many prescriptions for the prevention of poisoning was unknown. Guangzhou's Chinese medicine community, upon seeing the use of poisonous gas by the Japanese military during the Battle of Shanghai and the lack of Western medical supplies or gas masks, asked to develop new methods. They discovered that the combination of the three herbs: banana leaf, sweet potato leaf, and evergreen leaf could be used to cover the nose and mouth to prevent entry of the poisonous gas. The covering combination was reportedly sent to soldiers at the front line and was proven to be effective. The medical efficacy was certified with the news being reported by the Central News Agency[56]. There were even journal publications such as the "Compendium of Essential Prescriptions for Anti-Toxicity in Chinese Medicine", which mentioned the "Sizhen Anti-Toxicity Powder" which could be placed in a handkerchief or in a gas mask, as well as others that could be consumed orally or burnt externally for cleansing various poisons. More interestingly was the "Hui Long Soup" (Ren Ni), which, as pointed out by the author, was used by the 19th Route Army in 1932 in Shanghai when faced with poison gas attacks by the Japanese military. This prescription was obtained by one of the advisors in the 19th Route Army[57]. In addition to promoting modern knowledge of poison gas and anti-toxicity, the Chinese medicine community also tried to demonstrate the possible benefits provided by Chinese medicine. For example, upon being attacked by poison gas, one should perform actions such as cleansing, wiping, changing clothes, etc., and then consume the "Chu Hui powder" consisting of Atractylodes, Angelica, Huoxiang, Jiangxiang, Chuanxiong, Calamus, Campanulaceae, and more, which enabled the patient to regain consciousness. The "anti-poison gas prescription" burned the powdered form of the prescription to save patients. It could also detoxify water when placed in a well, another demonstration of Chinese medicine efficacy (Ya Xian 1938).

Conclusion

This work has summarized aspects that have been neglected by past scholars of Chinese medicine's history, namely, the role Chinese medicine played during the Sino-Japanese War. Reviewing a compilation of magazines, journals, and books from that period allows the reader to understand the possible positive

effects of Chinese medicine during the war. The possibilities revealed by these texts are inherently connected to the development of pre-war Chinese medicine. For those who were filled with optimism for the development of Chinese medicine, the merging of Chinese and Western medicine during the war, their combination and substitution, gave the impression that there was no distinction between Chinese and Western medicine, but only "Chinese New Medicine" (Chen Guofu 1939, 15). However, the conflict and debate between Chinese and Western medicine continued, and the sense of emergency and nationalistic fervor amongst the Chinese medicine community was exacerbated with the outbreak of war, which only strengthened the fight for survival that traditional Chinese medicine was embroiled in prior to the war's outbreak. This fight for survival was necessary due to the continued pressure from Western medicine, which evolved along with the pressing needs of war; Chinese medicine faced irrelevance if no meaningful actions were taken.

There was still a huge gap between Western and Chinese medicine. Western medicine had conducted large-scale epidemic prevention measures during the war, such as communication between the government and the League of Nations, and collaboration with the Rockefeller Foundation to implement anti-malarial campaigns in southwest China. Chinese medicine, in the meantime, was still struggling to gain acceptance into the national health system[58]. At the war's outbreak, a rescue team member in the Guangdong Chao'an national rescue team said he was questioned by the provincial governor as to why a national rescue team was not organized. He was exasperated at the lack of initiative in the Chinese medicine community and proposed an active organization effort. However, this led to funding issues, thankfully relieved by the provincial government. The rescue team member hoped for more comprehensive support, but he was not confident in the nation's ability to support such emergency rescue teams in the long term or how to optimally utilize them[59]. The Nationalist government lacked comprehensive planning, signaling to the Chinese medicine community, who looked towards the state for support and assistance through stable supplying and funding, that they could not rely on a functioning system. During this research, we discovered that the Chinese medicine community had built rescue teams, rescue training classes, rescue hospitals, pharmaceutical factories, provisional capital Chinese medicine hospitals, and other medical facilities, while some individuals sought to publish papers and investigate new uses of Chinese medicine in preparation for the impending war.

This thesis emphasizes and introduces the main points, takes stock of the actual circumstances of Chinese medicine in various aspects, and broadens the horizons of existing research on the history of Chinese medicine. Chinese medicine had, at least, the opportunity to be used by modern countries in warfare. Before the war, Chinese medicine was not utilized in the public health system and was denied entry into the epidemic prevention system; however, we see glimpses of opportunities for the development of Chinese medicine during the war. The war forced Chinese medicine physicians to look for ancient knowledge and think about their responses to modern warfare. This was a vertical transmission of knowledge and the method of knowledge accumulation for traditional Chinese medicine. More importantly, Chinese medicine interacted with Western medical knowledge in specific areas such as rescue and the prevention of gas poisoning, which created a horizontal connection of knowledge. This in turn led to changes in Chinese medicine knowledge theory. The definition and imagination of Chinese medicine after the war was transformed and increasingly distanced itself from its traditional image.

While these developments are not revolutionary changes, this thesis aims to point out the several weaknesses of Chinese medicine during the war which prevented it from becoming a more modernized and scientific form of medicine. First, "temporary solutions are not the norm and replacements are not equal to innovations". The government only viewed Chinese medicine as a temporary solution to supplement the lack of Western medical supplies during the war. Even the research and development of Chinese medical drugs served only to replace the scarcity of Western medicine, with no consideration given to Chinese medical drugs' place within the Chinese medicine system. This notion of replacement Chinese medicine

being its own practice made it harder to challenge the status of Western medicine, which was supported by science and regulations in terms of health, epidemic prevention, and the military medicine system.
Second, we see that many provisional institutes were not able to bring about sustainable scientific research and development. The emergence of various training classes and workshops were only a reflection of the lack of proper, high-quality education and training at many Chinese medicine schools and were therefore unable to meet the demands of war. The inability to spur proper education and training would mean that all reforms were temporary and not sustainable. We should search for more materials to understand the post-war situation. However, the post-war situation did not seem optimistic, as the Nationalist government faced internal instability and was soon dragged into the Chinese civil war[60]. Chinese medicine, in the field of military medicine, developed further in the Communist-occupied zones or in the new China that was established (Ling Changquan, Zhu Dezeng, Gu Wei 2014, 26-29).
For pharmaceutical manufacturing, despite the emergence of many innovative ideas and methods, there were strict ratios and manufacturing processes for the development of Western medicines, and there was no need to look for prescriptions. However, the various prescriptions of Chinese medicine were scattered throughout many books, and there were an insufficient number of pharmacologists to develop drugs. Their usage was made more difficult as regular workers could not be equipped with advanced pharmaceutical skills and thus were incapable of making classical prescriptions based on scientific methods. Therefore, most of the convenient drugs were simple substitutes, with few new drugs being developed. The construction of laboratories for the manufacture and development of new domestic pharmaceutical drugs required more time and even more attention and resources.
Many reference books and classical medical books could not be referenced during the war, texts that would have required an undue amount of time to study individually[61]. Therefore, in-depth research into and development of Chinese medicine will herald a fresh start in Chinese medicine history. Such research has already begun, and we will need to carefully evaluate and explore its future developments as we await the next emergence opportunity.

Notes

1 According to research, Chinese medicine at that time leveraged on "national essence", "national heritage", and "national production" and used it as a supporting force for traditional culture, which is in sharp contrast to the image of imperialism and aggression reflected by Western medicine. Such a representation was well accepted by the Nationalist government. For example, in the "Chinese Medicine Public Bulletin", Sun Yat-sen's remarks were attached in the preamble. Dr. Sun had repeatedly stated the need to rejuvenate traditional culture and has also opposed the unequal treatment and discrimination imposed upon China by Western powers. The Chinese medicine community grasped this "national representation" inclination and turned Chinese medicine into a "National Medicine", successfully quelling calls to stop the use of Chinese medicine. Cf. Pi Kuo-Li 2009, 64-77. On the transformation of Chinese Medicine during the ROC period, refer to Sean Hsiang-lin Lei 2014; Bridie Andrews 2014.

2 Editorial Board, Chinese and Western Medicine Research Society, "A Discussion Series on Chinese Medicine Education", Shanghai, Chinese and Western Medicine Research Society Publication Committee, 1939, preface 2-3.

3 Author unspecified, *The Founding of the Chongqing Chinese Medical Association*, in "Chinese Medicine Science", vol. I, n. 9, 1937, 17-19.

4 *Ivi*, 18.

5 Unspecified author, *After the War: The Chinese Medicine Revolutionary Movement Adopts a Scientific Approach to Improvements and has Established a Pharmaceutical Factory in Chongqing*, in "Voice of Medicine", 5, 1938, 45.

6 *Ivi*, 46.

7 Central Chinese Medicine Academy, *Summary of Chinese Medicine Rescue Regulations*, Chongqing, Central Academy of Chinese Medicine, 1938, 8-9.

8 Unspecified author, *Jiao Yitang and others launched the organization of the Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital Hankou Branch*, in "Auspicious Medicine", 19, 1938, 3.

9 Central Chinese Medicine Academy, *Summary of the Chapter Principles of Chinese Medicine Rescue*, Preface by Jiao Yitang, 1-2.

10 Author unspecified, *First Squadron of the Chinese Medicine Rescue Team*, in "China Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 1, 1944, 9.
11 Author unspecified, *Pharmaceutical News: Supervisory Committee member Liu Juemin prepares to improve the quality of herbal medicine and establish the Chinese Medicine Hospital in Luoyang to meet the needs of the war*, in "Auspicious Medicine", March 17, 1938, 3rd edition.
12 Editor, Chinese Medicine Rescue Team, in "Medical Weekly", n. 3, 1938, 1.
13 Central Chinese Medicine Academy, "Summary of Chinese Medicine Rescue Chapter", 17.
14 *Ivi*, 19.
15 *Ivi*, 5-6.
16 *Ivi*, 7.
17 *Ivi*, 21.
18 *Ivi*, 25.
19 Author unspecified, *Opening of the Chinese Medicine Hospital in the Provisional Capital*, in "China Medical Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 1, 1944, 9.
20 Author unspecified, *Case for improving the provisional capital Chinese medicine hospital, establishment of patient wards for the benefit of the public*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 3, 1944, p. 31.
21 Author unspecified, *Chinese Medicine Education Association, Records of the Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital Advanced Research Class*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 5, 1944, 36-37.
22 Author unspecified, *Lectures and Research at the Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 4, 1944, 13.
23 Author Unspecified, *Active Training for the Rejuvenation of Chinese Medicine*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 3.
24 Edited by Zhao Fengjiao and others, *Training notes for Health personnel at the Central Chinese Medicine Academy*, Chongqing, Central Chinese Medicine Academy, 1945, Book 1, Preface, 1-2.
25 *Ivi*, 1.
26 Edited by Chen Boqing, *Health, and Physical Education during War*, Chonqging, Independent Publisher, 1939, 31-32.
27 Author Unspecified, *Pride of Chinese Medicine*, in "Guangdong Medical Journal", II, n. 3-4, 1943, 78.
28 Author Unspecified, *Medical Services Provided by Chinese Medicine Physicians for Injured Soldiers and Family Members of Military Personnel (Promulgated by the Ministry of Military on 9th Mar 1944)*, in "Law Weekly (Chongqing)", I, n. 20, 1944, 1-2.
29 Author Unspecified, *The Chongqing Chinese Medicine Association Warmly Welcomes Outstanding Youth to join the Military*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 6, 1944, 12.
30 Author Unspecified, *Good Results Achieved for the voluntary medical treatment of soldiers' family members*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 1, 1944, 10.
31 Editorial Board of Chinese and Western Medicine Research Society, *A Discussion Series on Chinese Medicine Education*, Shanghai, Chinese and Western Medicine Research Society Publication Committee, 1939, 1-6.
32 Unspecified author, *Medical Education news: Surgical Training for Chinese Medicine Physicians conducted by Jiangsu Province*, in "Auspicious Medicine", n. 8, 1937, Chapter 3.
33 Unspecified author, *Medical Education news: Surgical Training for Chinese Medicine Physicians conducted in batches by Jiangsu Province*, in "Auspicious Medicine", n. 2, 1937, 37.
34 Unspecified author, *Published by Henan Chinese Medicine Advancement and Research Society's Health Report*, in "Auspicious Medicine", n. 8, 1937, Chapter 3.
35 This publication is a referral of a story, of which the main character narrated the treatment process himself, with some differences to the publication, which was widely published in Chinese medicine journals in the initial period of the war.
36 Author Unspecified, *Chinese Medicine Hospital set up by the Central Chinese Medicine Academy to help wounded soldiers during the Sino-Japanese War*, in "Voice of Medicine", n. 4, 1938, 30-31.
37 Edited by Shen Bochao, *Advancement of Medical Drugs*, Xian, Advancement of Medical Drugs Editorial Society, 1942, 68-69.
38 *Ivi*, 67-68.
39 *Ivi*, 2.
40 *Ivi*, 70.
41 *Ivi*, 10.
42 *Ivi*, 71.
43 Author unspecified, *Recruiting Students for Chinese Medicine Surgical Lectures at the Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 1, 1944, 9.
44 Author unspecified, *Conduct of Chinese Medicine Surgical Lectures by Mail*, "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 2, 1944, 9.
45 Author unspecified, *Lectures and Research at the Provisional Capital Chinese Medicine Hospital*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 4, 1944, 13.
46 Long Yun, *Order by Yunnan Provincial Government: Minzi No. 558 (15th September 1938): Administrative Department: Collection,*

reporting and transfer for the Central Chinese Medicine Academy Solution Gathering of Traumatology Prescriptions, in "Yunnan Provincial Government Public Paper", Vol. 10, Issue 81, 1938, 14-15.

47 *The Health Department under the Reserve Company of the Eighteenth Group Army of the National Revolution Army has compiled the "Must-have Medicine"*, Publishing location unknown, Health Department under the Reserve Company of the Eighteenth Group Army of the National Revolution Army, 1943, vol. 1, 247.

48 Authored by Basu, translated by Chen Shu, *My Witnessing of Military Doctors Working in the Eighth Route Army,' edited by the editorial committee of Shaanxi Youth Culture National Defense*, "National Defense Health" (Yan'an: Military Doctor Department of the Eighteenth Group Army, 1941), 83.

49 Li Weizhen, *Angelica Sinensis and Ginseng,' edited by the editorial committee of Shanxi Youth Culture National Defense*, "National Defense Health" (Yan'an: Military Doctor Department of the Eighteenth Group Army, 1941), 87.

50 Edited by the editorial committee of Shaanxi Youth Culture National Defense, "National Defense Health" (Yan'an: Military Doctor Department of the Eighteenth Group Army, 1941), 90.

51 As the situation in Communist-controlled northern China is unique, this work will only articulate the main points and leave out the details.

52 Author unspecified, *Chinese Medicine Academy to establish a Chinese Medicine Pharmaceutical Factory*, in "Sichuan Economic Monthly", 9, n. 5, 1938, 39-40.

53 Author unspecified, *After the war: Improving the Chinese Medicine Revolutionary Movement using Scientific Methods, established a Pharmaceutical Factory in Chongqing*, in "Voice of Medicine", n. 5, 1938, 46.

54 Author unspecified, *Report on the Pharmaceutical manufacturing situation at Shujiangyuan Pharmaceuticals in the war zone*, in "Revolution Drive", vol. 1, issue 3, 1940, 20.

55 Author unspecified, *Pharmaceutical News: Supervisory Committee member Liu Juemin prepares to improve the quality of herbal medicine and establish the Xingdu Chinese Medicine Hospital in Luoyang to meet the needs of the war*, in "Auspicious Medicine", March 17, 1938, 3rd edition.

56 Author unspecified, *Guangzhou's Chinese Medicine Community Discovers Anti Gas Poisoning Herbs*, in "Voice of Medicine", n. 4, 1938, 30-31.

57 Author unspecified, *Compendium of Essential Prescriptions for Anti-Toxicity in Chinese Medicine*, in "Chinese Medical Herbs Magazine", vol. 4, issue 9, 1937, 14-16.

58 Unspecified author, *Yan Fuqing's lecture in the Hong Kong University School of Medicine on Chinese Medicine during the War*, in "Southwest China Medical Journal", vol. 1, issue 3, 1941, 50.

59 Editor, *Chaoan Chinese Medicine Rescue Team*, in "Medical Weekly Journal", n. 17, 1939, 1.

60 This is an interesting observation, demonstrating that the broad trend of history can always be viewed through a narrow lens. The Chinese Communist Party maintained wartime mobility even after the war, and leveraged the experience accumulated during the Sino-Japanese War in the use of Chinese medicine during the Chinese civil war. The Nationalist government, on the other hand, lost their bearings in reforming the system and failed in producing good policies of Chinese medicine reforms. While this was just a minor concern in the broader scheme of things, it demonstrates the Nationalist government's inability to leverage past experiences and to maintain technological reforms, hence being reliant on American assistance. It lost control over all of China due to a lack of innovation and reflection, and failed policies.

61 Author unspecified, *Concluding Remarks of Chief Yang Lizan of the Field Logistics Department of the 18th Group Army at the Work Conference of the Pharmaceutical Material Factory (1941.8.28)*, edited by He Zhengqing, *Yang Lifu, Selection of Liu Deng's Army Health History Materials*, Chengdu, Chengdu University of Technology Publishing, 1991, 27-28.

Bibliography

Andrews B.
2014 *The Making of Modern Chinese Medicine, 1850-1960*, Vancouver, UBC Press.

Ao Zheming
1944 *What Should the Chinese Medicine Community at this time of Crisis*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly" (Chongqing), I, n. 1.

Bin
1938 *Speech for The Chinese Medicine Festival*, in "Auspicious Medicine", n. 21.

Chen Guofu
1939 *Chinese Medicine Education Going Forward*, in "Teaching and Learning", 3, n. 11.

Chen Liyu
1940 *The epiphany of Chinese Medicine Students Regarding the War and Rebuilding the Country*, in "Medical Education", 4, n. 1.

Chen Yu
1944 *My stance on improving Chinese Medicine*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 1.

Deng Bingkui
1944 *How should Chinese Medicine Physicians Respond to the National Health Movement*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 2.

Fan Zhengren
1937 *Chinese Medicine Rescue Personnel organized by Huabei Chinese Medicine College proceed to rescue wounded soldiers at the Suiyuan Front line*, in "China (Shanghai)", n. 50.

Han Spirit
1938 *Military medicine issues during the war: rescue and treatment require military doctors, and the contributions and efficiency of Chinese medicine should not be discriminated against*, in "Auspicious Medicine", 16 January.

He Yingfu
1939 *The Mission of Chinese Medicine*, in "Chinese medicine", I, n. 1.

Li Jianming
2011 *The Hidden Surgery of Hua Tuo- Chinese Medicine Surgical History*, Taipei, Tungta Books Publishing.

Li Xiyan
1945 *My Opinions on the Urgent Improvement and Research on Chinese Medicine*, in "Regulations on Medical Drugs", I, n. 3.

Ling Changquan, Zhu Dezeng, Gu Wei (eds.)
2014 *Military Chinese Medicine, Shanghai*, Second Military Medical University Press.

Ni Shiying
1937 *The Revival of the Nation Relies on the Enhancement of Chinese Medicine*, in "Chinese Medicine Dizhu Monthly", n. 4.

Pi Kuo-Li
2009 *The Connotation of 'National Medicine'. A Brief Discussion on Modern Transformation and Re-engineering of Chinese Medicine*, in "Journal of Sun Yat-sen University", 49, 1.
2019 *'Chinese Medicine' or 'Western Medicine Substitution'? Manufacturing and Research of Domestic Drugs during times of War*, in "Chinese Medicine Journal", 30, 2.
2020 *The Enlightenment of War: Knowledge Transformation of traditional Chinese Medical Traumatology (1937-1949)*, in "Journal of the National History Museum", 63, 89-126.

Ren Qizhi
1937 *Establishment of the traditional Chinese Medicine Committee under the Department of Health*, in "Yi Duo", 1, n. 11.

Ruo Yu
1938 *Urgent Surgical Training of Chinese Medicine Physicians*, in "Auspicious Medicine", n. 21.

Schoppa K.R.
2011 *In a Sea of Bitterness: Refugees During the Sino-Japanese War*, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press.

Sean Hsiang-lin Lei
2014 *Neither Donkey nor Horse: Medicine in the Struggle over China's Modernity*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press.

Shen Zhongkui
1943 *Collection of Chinese Medicine Prescriptions: Attached a list of selected proprietary drugs in the Chinese Medicine Rescue Hospital set up by the Central Chinese Medicine Academy under the former Rejuvenation Committee*, in "Guangdong Medicine Monthly", 2, n. 9-10.

Sun Songjiao
1938 *The Sino-Japanese War and Chinese Medicine*, in "Voice of Medicine", n. 4.

Tang Yangchun
1939 *Necessary Chinese Medicine Research during the War*, in "Essence of Chinese Medicine", I, n. 1.

Tang Zhen
1944 *Proposals to Improve Chinese Medicine*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly (Chongqing)", I, n. 3.

Wang Mingfan
1937 *Where Did the Chinese Medicine Doctors go to During the War?*, in "Chinese Medicine Dizhu Monthly", n. 5.
1937 *Where did the Chinese Medicine Physicians go to during the War?*, in "Chinese Medicine Monthly", n. 5.

Wang Shijie
2012 *Diary of Wang Shijie, Taipei, Institute of Modern History*, edited by Lin Meili, Academia Sinica, vol. II.

Watt J.R.
2013 *Saving Lives in Wartime China: How Medical Reformers Built Modern Healthcare Systems amid War and Epidemics, 1928-1945*, Netherlands, Brill.

Wu Hanxian
1943 *Compiling a guidebook for Chinese and Western Medical Circles*, in "Changsha: Hunan Chinese and Western Hospital".

Ya Xian
1938 *Common health knowledge in times of emergency: identifying and saving yourself from poison gas*, in "Auspicious Medicine. Protection from Gas Poisoning Special Edition".

Ye Yongwen
2013 *History of Traditional Chinese Medicine Development in Taiwan: Medical-Government Relations*, Taipei, Wunan.

Yu Shangren
1939 *Surgical Treatment Research: Understanding Western Medicine Surgery from Crippled Soldiers*, in "New Chinese Medicine Journal", 2, n. 3.

Yuan Junting
1938 *Forum: Responsibility of the Chinese Medicine Community regarding Protection from Gas Poisoning*, in "Auspicious Medicine. Protection from Gas Poisoning Special Edition".

Zemin
1938 *Chinese Medicine, Diseases, the Rise, and Fall of the Nation*, in "Auspicious Medicine", 20, n. 1.

Zhang Hong-sheng
1942 *The Essence of Chinese Medicine*, Hunan, author's release.

Zhang Qinyan
1939 *Improve Chinese Medical Herbs before Improving Chinese Medicine*, in "Chinese Medicine New Voice", n. 6.

Zhang Ziying
1941 *Publication*, in "Rejuvenation of Medicine Journal", n. 1.

Zhou Fusheng
1938a *The Importance of Advocating Chinese Medicine Wound Traumatology in times of War*, in "Spirit of the Warrior", 7, n. 15.
1938b *The Necessity of Promoting Chinese Medicine Traumatology Treatment during Emergency Times*, in "Spirit of the Warrior", 7, n. 15.

Zhuang Xuren
1940 *Discussion on epidemic prevention knowledge urgently required and replenishment of Chinese medicine*, in "Chinese Medicine New Voice", n. 11.

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

A STUDY ON THE COASTAL METEOROLOGICAL SERVICE IN THE CHINESE MARITIME SERVICE

Uno studio sul Servizio meteorologico costiero del Servizio Marittimo Cinese

Wenxin Xu

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723d

Abstract

In 1869, to ensure navigational safety and to develop meteorology, Robert Hart, the Inspector General of the Chinese Customs Service, planned to carry out a meteorological study of the Chinese coast. After the arrival of meteorological instruments, talent, and registers in China, the Customs Service launched large-scale, continuous meteorological observations from January 1st, 1874 until 1950. Through decades of weather services, the Customs Service gradually established a set of unified and standardized workflows including the observation, recording, sending, and receiving of weather data, as well as guidelines on how to display and present weather forecasts in alignment with contemporary international standards. As a result, a complex technical and social network was constructed, with the Customs Service as both the producer and consumer of weather forecasts. This paper draws on documentary archives to discuss how the western knowledge under the management of the Customs meteorological service was stored in traditional China.

Nel 1869, al fine di garantire la sicurezza della navigazione e sviluppare la meteorologia, Robert Hart, ispettore generale delle dogane cinesi, progettò di introdurre l'osservazione meteorologica fra i compiti delle Dogane. Dopo il successivo arrivo di strumenti meteorologici, talenti e registri in Cina, i servizi doganali iniziarono ad effettuare osservazioni meteorologiche continue su larga scala dal 1 gennaio 1874 al 1950 circa. Durante decenni di servizi meteorologici, le Dogane hanno gradualmente stabilito una serie di flussi di lavoro unificati e standardizzati tra cui l'osservazione, la registrazione, l'invio e la ricezione di dati meteorologici, nonché la visualizzazione e la presentazione delle previsioni meteorologiche secondo gli standard internazionali. Di conseguenza, fu costruita una complessa rete tecnica e sociale in cui le dogane erano sia produttori che consumatori di previsioni meteorologiche. Questo lavoro utilizza gli archivi documentari per analizzare come un sapere occidentale, la gestione del servizio meteorologico doganale, si è sedimentato nella Cina tradizionale.

Keywords: Chinese Maritime Customs Service (CMCS), Meteorological Service, code of signals.
Servizio doganale marittimo cinese (CMCS), Servizio meteorologico, codice dei segnali.

Wenxin Xu is a PhD candidate at the School of History and Culture of Science, Shanghai Jiao Tong University. Her major research interests include the transmission and reception of meteorological science and technology in modern China and East Asia. Research for her dissertation, which she is expecting to graduate in 2023, draws on maritime data and archives. E-mail: wxxu0215@163.com.

Wenxin Xu *è dottoranda presso la Scuola di Storia e Cultura della Scienza, dell'Università Jiao Tong di Shanghai. I suoi principali interessi di ricerca includono la trasmissione e la ricezione della scienza e della tecnologia meteorologica nella Cina moderna e nell'Asia orientale. Sta lavorando su dati e archivi marittimi per completare la sua tesi e si aspetta di addottorarsi nel 2023. E-mail: wxxu0215@163.com.*

Introduction

Beginning in the 1840s with the signing of a series of diplomatic treaties, the Qing Dynasty gradually opened its coastal and river ports for trade, and as a result, people and ships from Western countries began to enter China on a large-scale. However, with a large north-south span, a long coastline, foggy springs, frequent typhoons in the summer and autumn, and chilly air in the winter, China's coastal areas were among the most difficult in the world to navigate. Discussions among foreigners about people's health and the safety of navigation relating to the weather often appeared in books and newspapers. At the same time, in 1856, France was the first country to develop storm warning services using weather observations, such as temperature, pressure, and wind speed for weather analysis and forecasting. Therefore, meteorology became a national matter and was soon copied worldwide (Liu Zhao-Ming 1981, 185). One of the most notable influences in this trend was the establishment of the Zikawei（徐家汇）Observatory in Shanghai in 1872, known as the "first meteorological station in the Far East". The Zikawei Observatory was the successor to the French Jesuits' meteorological observations and related activities in Dongjiadu during the 1860s.

Although the Zikawei Observatory's achievements in meteorology were notable, it was the modern Chinese Customs Service that truly established the meteorological network that linked China's coast to the rest of East Asia. Established in 1854, for almost a century, the Chinese Maritime Customs Service (CMCS) functioned in mainland China until the establishment of the People's Republic of China in 1949. As China's foreign relations deepened, in addition to estimating and collecting taxes on foreign trade, the Customs Service duties expanded to include those in the maritime, educational, diplomatic, postal, meteorological, and other fields, becoming a comprehensive organization. Although subordinate to the central government, the Inspector General, a position that had always been held by a foreigner, had complete control over the Customs Service. The Customs Service's authority covered the whole country and even East Asia. In 1869, Robert Hart, the Inspector General, first proposed to establish meteorological stations, and by 1882, the Customs Service was cooperating with the Observatory in Zikawei to support weather observations free of charge and produce scientific results such as weather forecasts. As a result, the Customs Service meteorological stations became one of the key platforms for displaying weather warnings and alerting ships about extreme weather hazards. Over time, a network of meteorological science linking East Asia and the world was established.

The preeminent meteorological work of CMCS has attracted academic attention, especially regarding the issues in the development of the Customs Service meteorological network. Wu Yan used the perspective of the exchange of benefits to discuss the cooperation between the Customs Service and Zikawei Observatory in establishing a network of weather stations. Zhu Marlon discussed how business groups between ports pushed Hart to finally relinquish the Customs Service's dominance and to cooperate with the Zikawei Observatory. Robert Bickers outlined the early development of the modern meteorological infrastructure in China from 1869-1912 and examined the struggles and cooperation between the Customs Service, Zikawei Observatory, and the Hong Kong Observatory as they competed to be the center of meteorological research and weather forecasting in the region. In addition, Cheng Chunshu researched the Customs Service meteorological stations' network, while Wu Zengxiang's study of Customs Service meteorological observation and recording methods demonstrated the spatial and temporal distribution of stations, as well as their main characteristics. To link works from China to surrounding areas, P. Kevin MacKeown made a passing reference to Hart's meteorological work in his study of the role of the Hong Kong Observatory in the recent East Asian storm warning network. Yang Ping and Wang Zhiqiang sorted and discussed the development of the Customs Service meteorological work. Other scholars have collated and examined various local Customs Service meteorological archives for further analysis (Wu Yan 2009, 54-63; MacKeown 2010, 12-15; Zhu 2012, 20-71; Bickers 2016, 180-201; Yang Ping, Wang Zhi-qiang 2019, 24-32).

To further develop the previously mentioned past studies on the topic, this paper uses documentary archives to provide a micro-historical perspective on the management of Customs Service meteorological services, the origins of the Customs Service meteorological work, the observation, recording and transmission of meteorological data, and the evolution of meteorological warning systems in modern times. This research aims to provide a more comprehensive and insightful understanding of Customs Service and to discuss the interaction between modern meteorological science and human society.

The origins and organization of the Customs Service meteorological service

In 1867, Robert Hart, after looking at the maritime accidents off the coast of China over the previous 25 years, concluded that typhoons were one of the most common reasons for the accidents. The other common reason was carelessness on the part of the driver, causing the vessel to collide, catch fire, or run aground. To solve this problem, Hart believed that funds should be allocated to install lighthouses along the coast to alert incoming and outgoing ships[1]. In addition, in 1868, with the provisions of Paragraph 10 of the 1858 Sino-British *Agreement Containing Rules of Trade*, the Marine Department was established by CMCS to improve the access conditions and coastal navigation at China's ports of commerce[2]. After two years of construction, the Customs Service's lighthouse business had developed.

On November 12th, 1869, Hart further issued Circular No. 28, laying out the meteorological business of the Customs Service, "to establish a Meteorological Station in connection with each Office of Customs during the coming year"[3]. Considering that the geographical location of the Customs Service lighthouses differ by about 20 degrees of latitude and 10 degrees of longitude, and that no additional staff was required, it was only necessary to purchase meteorological instruments to start observing and recording the weather. Meteorological observations could reveal the laws of nature and provide the scientific community with a wealth of facts and data from the Chinese region that had hardly been systematically summarized before. Additionally, they could guarantee the safety of navigation and thus facilitate trade and commerce. Therefore, Hart sought the establishment of meteorological stations in some of the ports, and after a few years, the Customs Service weather stations would be put under the control of the weather station of Peking College (T'ung Wen Kuan) in the capital[4]. Moreover, Hart planned to collaborate with other regional meteorology departments "for the publication of meteorological observations, and exchange of weather-news by telegraph along the Pacific Coast of Asia"[5]. Therefore, an international network of scientific meteorological research, with the Customs Service taking the lead, would be established through the cooperation between China and the rest of East Asia.

To achieve these goals, Hart delegated the responsibility to James Duncan Campbell, director of the Customs Service's London Office. From 1873 to 1882, Campbell was appointed by Hart to actively build a scientific network of people, purchasing meteorological instruments and registers and hiring meteorological personnel from abroad to successfully operate the Customs Service meteorological stations (Xu Wenxin 2022, 67-82). The collaboration of the Customs Service with the Zikawei Observatory began because the meteorology business of T'ung Wen Kuan never actually launched. In 1879, due to absence of T'ung Wen Kuan's meteorology business, A.M. Bisbee, the Divisional Inspector and Habor Master of Marine Department, instead presented the meteorological data measured at his port to the Zikawei Observatory for interpretation. In March 1882, to regulate this first collaboration, Hart ordered that meteorological observations at ports should be shared with other institutions with the permission of the Inspector General[6]. In May of that year, Hart also formally authorized the Commissioner to send copies of meteorological records to the Zikawei Observatory in the same form as before; however, in the future, they had to be officially forwarded by the local chief rather than sent directly on behalf of individuals[7].

Consequently, it was institutionally established that the Zikawei Observatory had the right to interpret

the Customs Service's meteorological data. This right was then gradually granted to more meteorological organizations, such as the Hong Kong Observatory and the Central Meteorological Observatory in Tokyo. Subsequently, the Customs Service-led East Asian meteorology network envisaged by Hart evolved into an equal, multi-sectoral collaboration with the Customs Service weather stations providing the basic data that was scientifically processed by the meteorological agencies represented by the Zikawei Observatory to produce weather forecasts that were then released to the public (Xu Wenxin 2022, 67-82).

After this collaboration began, the Customs Service did not slacken its meteorological work and sought to further optimize its organizational structure. Apart from the general control of the Imperial Maritime Customs Service, there was a lack of clarity about the authority of the various ports of entry, which included both the Inspector General and Commissioner, as well as Divisional Inspector and Habor Master. While cooperation between the parties was smooth, Hart became aware that certain issues such as how to improve the Customs Service's ability to record and report on weather observations as the volume of business grew and the demand for professionalism increased would need to be addressed.

In February 1892, Hart ordered a tally of the weather observations sent and received at the ports. For ports where no weather observations were carried out, he deemed it sufficient to just report the facts, while other ports were required to reply with information in the following format: (1) the name of the place, port, or the author of the report; (2) the time and frequency of sending; (3) by what means (e.g., mail, telegram, etc.) the report was sent; (4) whether the report had been published by the port of entry to which it was sent and by what means (e.g., Customs Notifications, Press, etc.); and (5) whether the report was published by the port of dispatch and in what manner (e.g., Customs Notifications, Press...)[8].

Likewise, in the received weather report form, four aspects should also be stated: (1) the name of the place, port, or by whom the report was received; (2) the time and frequency of receipt; (3) the way the report was received; and (4) whether it was published by the port where it was received and in what manner[9]. In this way, the Inspector General had a complete picture of the weather reports sent to and received at the various ports.

By 1903, the meteorological work of the Customs Service was placed under the sole responsibility of the Coast Inspector[10]. The Coast Inspector reported to the Marine Department, and, at that time, was managed by W.F. Tyler, the ex officio Harbour Master of Shanghai[11]. The Coast Inspector was primarily responsible for overseeing the maritime work at ports, for example, examining the "the condition of the local pilotage, the performance of Harbor duties by the local Harbor Masters"[12]. In the field of meteorological work "all new instruments that may be required should be indented for, and will be supplied by, the Coast Inspector's office, which will also see to the repairs of damaged instruments: and generally speaking, all questions of meteorological import, such, for example, as may be raised by Observatories, should be referred to the Coast Inspector". Additionally, the recording of meteorological observations, the sending of telegrams, and the timing of each should be standardized[13].

After a detailed survey of meteorological instruments, log sheets, transmission times, routes and targets, storm warning signals, and more at various ports[14], the Coast Inspector targeted improvement measures. For example, from 1904 onwards, all meteorological returns were to be sent to his office and then distributed from there, with a person later being specifically employed for this task[15]. These improvement measures unified the authority of meteorological reporting and optimized the working procedures, improving the efficiency of the Customs Service meteorological services.

Observation, recording, and transmission of meteorological data

In addition to the centralization and optimization of the administrative organization, the Imperial Maritime Customs Service also carried out a series of weather service workflow improvements, resulting in a

unified and standardized system. The observations and records of specific meteorological devices were eventually recorded on a professional form, called a register. In 1873, regarding the choice of the register, Hart sought the advice of a wide range of professionals to bring the Customs Service in line with international standards[16]. In September of that year at the International Meteorological Conference in Vienna, attendees suggested that the Conference could recommend the universal adoption of a registration form and the recording of items such as "barometric pressure, temperature, humidity, rain, wind, clouds and weather, and special phenomena"[17].

On August 24th, 1885, Colin Jamieson, the Commissioner in Swatow, suggested to Hart that the ports should use a new meteorological return that was prepared by the Commissioner in Amoy to reduce the number of daily observations from eight to four, with the observations being made at 3 a.m., 9 a.m., 3 p.m. and 9 p.m. The four points of time would be authorized by William Doberck, director of the Hong Kong Observatory, and would be "complete and sufficient" for meteorological science, except on typhoon days[18]. The observations in the table included: barometric pressure, air temperature (dry bulb, wet bulb, maximum, minimum, solar radiation maximum, ground radiation minimum), precipitation (the code of the rain gauge with information of height and duration), wind and wind direction, condition of the weather, accompanying notes, signature of the observer, etc.[19] The reduction in the number of observations would not only lighten the workload of the Customs Service staff, but it would also allow for more accurate values to be taken by Customs Services officers who did not specialize in meteorological work.

In 1887, Doberck completed his *Instructions for Making Meteorological Observations*, published by the Statistical Secretary of Imperial Maritime Customs Service, which provided an important professional reference for the Customs Service meteorological observations. The book was intended to be a reference for meteorological observers who recorded weather at Chinese treaty ports as far north as Newchwang and as far west as Ichang and Pakhoi, as well as for captains of ships from the various countries frequently sailing in Chinese waters. These instructions were professional and detailed. The covered the following: (1) the use and precautions of general meteorological instruments (such as barometers, thermometers, psychrometer, thermometer screen, and rain gauges) when conducting meteorological observations; (2) the natural properties of wind, clouds, and weather and recording standards; (3) the timing and frequency of observations for different systems (for example, Customs Service at 3 a.m., 9 a.m., 3 p.m., and 9 p.m.); (4) barometric calibration tables and more[20].

Furthermore, there was the issue of the normalization of observational data units. When the Vienna International Meteorological Conference was held in 1873, the committee strove to unite the English and metric system for meteorology, initially adopting a metric resolution. However, this measure was opposed and eventually both measurement systems were used in tandem[21]. For a long time, the English scale was a widely used and familiar system of measurement for mariners and the Customs Service, and the scales of the weather instruments used at the Customs Service weather stations also displayed imperial units. However, as the metric system became more widely used around the world, the lack in uniformity of the units of measurement caused many difficulties. The last thing presented in the weather record book were measurements in the metric system, and the Customs Service staff had to convert readings from inches and Fahrenheit to millimeters and Centigrade, thus increasing their workload. This problem was not resolved until 1932, when modern machines were introduced at the stations and the instruments were equipped with displays for metric and centigrade readings[22].

The configuration of specialist instruments at each weather station also began to change. Initially, Hart asked G.E. Airey, the Royal Astronomer, to draw up a list of instruments for the Customs Service weather stations, which would then be purchased in England by Campbell[23]. The first shipment of meteorological instruments arrived in China in 1873, including two complete barometers and four broken barometers[24]. Subsequently, as meteorology developed and there was an increased need to observe more, the Customs Service administration also equipped the weather stations with sets of professional meteorological in-

struments. By 1938, each Customs Service weather station was equipped with a complete set of instruments, including: a mercurial barometer with attached thermometer, a dry and wet bulb hygrometer, a maximum thermometer, a minimum thermometer, and a rain-gauge. For certain observation points, the Customs Service would also install the specifically appropriate equipment. For example, some of the uncovered lighthouse stations, namely North Saddle, Peiyüshan, T'urnabout, Lamocks, and Gutzlaff, were also equipped with barographs or anemometers[25]. Also, the meteorological returns were further refined to contain 13 columns and 8 daily observations (3.00, 6.00, 9.00, 12.00 (noon), 14.00, 18.00, 21.00 and 24.00), with a minimum of 4 daily observations being required (6.00, 9.00, 14.00, and 21.00 hours)[26].
There was also the issue of the choice of time zones for meteorological observations. In 1884, the International Meridian Conference was held in Washington, D.C., which adopted the Standard Time system and brought the world into the uniform system of time zones. During that period, the time used by the Zikawei Observatory's Time Ball on the Bund was still the Shanghai local mean time, and it was only in the late 19th-century that standard time was introduced. The standard time system was introduced in China in 1902, and by 1903 it was already in use at the Customs Service office in Shanghai, with other ports soon following suit[27]. In view of the long east-west span of China, in 1938, the timings of meteorological observations were divided into two time zones, UTC +7 and UTC +8, for broadcasting reports.
More precisely, 4 of the 52 weather stations (Chungking, Nanning, Lungchow, and Tengyueh) used the time zone of the seven eastern districts, with Chungking and Tengyueh being responsible for sending telegrams of the weather observations daily at 0500 and 1300 hours (for about 2 months), and an additional telegram at 2000 hours (about every 2 and a half months) during the typhoon season (from June 1st to October 31st). The remaining 50 stations followed the time zone of the eastern eight districts, with 25 stations being selected to send daily weather telegraphs at 0600 and 1400 hours (about every 2 months) and an additional one at 2100 each day during the typhoon season[28]. This measure facilitated the practical operation of the observers, and the observations and meteorologic results gained in accuracy.
From the rather small scale of their observations in 1869, the Customs Service meteorological observations gradually developed, and by 1905, there were 41 stations making regular observations with their records being sent to 5 observatories throughout East Asia[29]. In 1930, there were 61 Customs Service meteorological stations, 44 of which were land stations and 17 of which were lighthouse stations[30]. In 1935, observations were recorded at 46 Customs Service meteorological stations, 20 of which were lighthouse stations. Meteorological telegrams were transmitted from 24 of these stations to nine different addresses, requiring over 270 telegrams per day, or an average of over 40,000 sheets per year[31]. Furthermore, in March 1900, the results of meteorological observations taken by captains and other observers would be received by their local respective Customs Service office and be forwarded to the Zikawei Observatory[32] to remove concerns about postage[33]. This system was also designed to allow the Zikawei Observatory to receive more weather data to make increasingly objective and precise weather forecasts. The large amount of data needed to be sent daily to the different observatories in East Asia to produce scientific products such as weather forecasts had to then be returned to the Customs Service to be broadcast to the public. The telegraph was the main medium used to deliver this data.
After 1837, when Samuel Finley Breese Morse invented the first telegraph that could use code, the telegraph became more popular and technology advanced as it became more widely used. In 1869, the telegraph technology was first introduced to China and was soon applied to the transmission of meteorological information. The Great Northern Telegraph Company, for example, laid out water lines between Shanghai and Hong Kong in 1871, and established a telegraph station at Gatzlaff in 1874 to communicate with the shore and all the incoming and outgoing ships at Shanghai. Furthermore, daily weather forecasts produced by the Zikawei Observatory were sent to Shanghai to inform the shipping industry, and storm warnings were also issued by signals that were hoisted on flagpoles, thus saving countless lives[34]. After that, more telegraph companies joined in and offered the service free of charge.

The Customs Service also set up a process for sending weather telegraphs. For example, in 1904, it was stipulated that weather telegraph observations be made at 6 a.m. and 3 p.m. and be sent to the telegraph office for dispatch as soon as possible. The observations from Pakhoi, Kiungchow, and Canton were sent to the Hong Kong Observatory, Swatow to the Hongkong and Zikawei Observatories, and Amoy, Ningpo, Chinkiang, Kiukiang, Hankow, Ichang, Chungking, Chefoo, and Newchwang to the Zikawei Observatory. Furthermore, the meteorological telegrams were required to be bound and sent to the Coast Inspector monthly[35].
At the same time, the improvement, simplification, and harmonization of meteorological codes also facilitated the efficient transmission of meteorological data. In 1904, the Inspector General established that meteorological telegrams were to be divided into two groups of five characters composed as "BBBDD FWTTM". BBB was the barometer's measurement, DD was for the direction of the wind, F was for the wind speed, W was for the weather conditions, TT was for the temperature, and M was for difference between the wet and dry bulbs[36]. In 1914, the sharing of meteorological data by the Customs Service was further extended with the free transmission of telegrams to Peking Observatory[37]. In 1916, the Observatory of the Ministry of Agriculture and Commerce was added to the network and they changed the code to "BBBTT HDDVA", with BBB representing the barometer's measurement, TT representing the temperature, H representing the humidity, DD representing the direction of the wind, V representing the wind speed in meters per second, and A representing the weather conditions[38]. In 1930, the Hong Kong Meteorological Conference changed the meteorological code to a six-letter code, enriching the meteorological information that was convened.

Receipt and presentation of meteorological forecasts

Based on the meteorological data from the Customs Service land and lighthouse stations, professional scientific institutions, represented by the Zikawei Observatory, produced scientific products, such as weather maps, which were released to the public to alert them of weather conditions. The weather signal was an important vehicle for the presentation of this meteorological public service. As early as 1884, the Zikawei Observatory erected a signal pole on the Quai de France and hung flags on it to convey weather information, providing weather service to the public at the Shanghai port. This was a departure from the previous practice of warning vessels of dangers without informing them of the specific conditions[39]. By seeing the weather signals and with some general meteorological knowledge, the crew would know and then avoid the storm's path.
On January 1st, 1898, due to the Customs Service, the weather warning symbols prepared in 1897 by Louis Froc, the Director of the Zikawei Observatory, were officially applied to all major Chinese treaty ports. This new service, called the Typhoon and Storm Warning Service on the Coast of China, made use of the flags of the International Code and Marryat's Code. The Customs Service used a combination of Arabic numerals and the flags of the International Code to broadcast two weather conditions: typhoons or depressions and storm or gale warnings. For typhoons or depressions, a total of 91 flags displayed the future direction of the wind and other information, covering areas ranging from the Philippines and Vietnam in the south, to the Korean Peninsula and Siberia in the north, to Japan in the east, and to the Yangtze River Basin in the west. For storm or gale warnings, a G flag was used to indicate a storm, with two consecutive Arabic numeral flags to indicate the direction (13 directions). If there was a gale, a V flag was added, signalling that the center was near the place indicated by the code.
This symbol system used semaphores from the International Code of Signals, which was already available from the Customs Service, and was transmitted free of charge by telegraph companies thus providing shipping security at an exceptionally low cost. The system, which had a uniform and simple weather warning signal, had also been adopted by observatories in Manila, Tokyo, and Taiwan.

To extend the service and cater to the fishing vessels and sampans that were more threatened during the typhoon season, the Customs Service decided that the lighthouses along the Chinese coast should repeat the storm warning signals issued by the Zikawei Observatory. However, most lighthouse stations did not have telegraphs and could not directly receive information from the observatory, so they relied on the help of nearby sailing ships who flew signal flags to inform the lighthouse stations and other ships about weather conditions[40]. Due to this situation, the Storm Signal Repeating Code was designed. The new code was an abbreviated version of the previous storm signal. Based on the arrangement and combination of the flags, this code could show six different weather conditions[41].

At the same time, the Imperial Maritime Customs Service also divided the coast of China into seven regions from south to north with each region possessing a specific Repeating Stations. For example, District V's geographical scope was from Nimrod Sound (Lat. 29°30') to Haichow Bay (Lat. 35°) and included the Customs Service Districts: Ningpo (North) and Shanghai. There were five Repeating Stations in this area: Steep Island, Chinhai, Ningpo, North Saddle, and Shaweishan[42]. It was stipulated that a Repeating Station should hoist the corresponding sign in 24 hours unless other ships sent another signal before the 24 hours[43]. However, this was insufficient in practice, and the Zikawei Observatory then changed the requirement to instead repeat within three and a half days for each ship after the time given by the signal station. For example, if the signal were sent the previous day's morning, it could not be transmitted until noon of the current day; if the signal were sent in the previous day's afternoon, it could not be transmitted until after dark of the current day[44]. This activity was supported by many steam ships. Until May 10th, 1907, there were 119 ships assisting this service[45].

Although the two previously mentioned systems brought great convenience to navigational safety, after extensive practice, they were found to have a fatal shortcoming – when there was no wind, it was difficult for people to recognize the shape and color of the flags, foundational to the flag system; this turned out to be a widespread problem. Therefore, in 1909, the Customs Service cooperated with the Zikawei Observatory and decided to replace the flags with geometric shapes. At first, there were six symbols that represented numbers: the sphere, the cylinder, the cone, arrows pointing up and down, and two cones positioned point to point or base to base[46]. This new system was simple and easy to understand and was quickly accepted by crews[47]. However, according to practical experience, the Customs Service Coast Inspector W.F. Tyler believed that the new system had two flaws. First, the location given was too unclear, and he thought that the location range should be expanded by specifying an area or location through latitude and longitude. Second, the visibility of the hanging meteorological symbols was insufficient. To the Customs Service, it was necessary to select the best one from three symbols of the disc, diamond, and square. These were the three geometric shapes in use at the time, but there was not much difference between them. After a long discussion, it was concluded that the diamond was the best choice, and the disc was the least suitable[48].

Based on this, in 1914, Froc and R.P. Gauthier proposed two new types of cylinders (or discs) for a total of 10 symbols to represent information such as latitude and longitude. After two years of experiments by the Customs Service, the optimal size of each symbol was determined, enabling it to be seen clearer at a distance[49]. On February 1st, 1918, the Customs Service officially established the new signal system as the China Seas Storm Signal Code. This new code was implemented in the Storm Signal Stations of the Maritime Customs, the French Municipal Storm Signal Station at Shanghai, and the British Storm Signal Station at Weihaiwei[50]. In contrast to the previous system, the new system used 10 kinds of cylinders as symbols, which increased the recognizability of the symbols. The new system also made the weather warning communication faster and more accurate, expressing the latitudinal and longitudinal information of the storm position in decimal notation. Furthermore, the information of the new code was also richer, and included the time, center position of the typhoon or continental depression, the movement direction, the radius, the intensity, the key elements of gale signals' threat area, the general direction, etc.[51]

The system, according to Froc, and "its consecration by a long experience, since it has been at work in

its essential features, in fact in its actual form, since 1883, and its extreme simplicity, each commanding officer being able at first sight to make out what it means, without referring to a table or a book for the numerous (40 perhaps) different systems of each country in the world[52]". Later, in 1930, when the Conference of Directors of East Asian Weather Services Hong Kong was held, the director of the Hong Kong Observatory suggested that the China Seas Storm Signal Code should be slightly modified and extended to the entire East Asia region. This proposal was approved by the participants and, in subsequent practice, the entirety of East Asia, except Korea, had unified in their display of weather signals.

Conclusion

Beginning with Hart's 1869 proposal of the Customs Service Meteorological Plan to his entrusting Campbell to seek professional advice from overseas, purchase meteorological instruments, and search for meteorological personnel, the configuration of the Customs Service Meteorological Observation Station was gradually put into place. January 1st, 1874 saw the beginning of a large-scale and successful operation to perform systematic weather observation. In May 1882, the Imperial Maritime Customs Service officially issued a circular order to share the Customs Service meteorological observation data with the Zikawei Observatory free of charge, providing an important data source for the latter to make weather forecasts and other scientific products. Subsequently, the Customs Service expanded the entitites with which it shared data, including the Hong Kong Observatory, the Tokyo Meteorological Observatory, Peking's Central Observatory, and the Agricultural and Commercial Weather Observatory. To transfer the data more quickly and efficiently, the Customs Service, through years of cooperation, developed a set of workflows.

First, the observation and recording of meteorological data was closely related to the development of professional meteorological theory. Initially, only temperature, pressure, wind speed, and wind direction were recorded. This was gradually expanded to include measurements such as dryness, humidity, and weather conditions, and with the invention of new meteorological instruments, more accurate weather data could be observed and recorded. Moreover, the deepening of international cooperation in meteorology led to the gradual harmonization of the units of measurement and registers of meteorological observations, foundational to the Customs Service meteorological work. Second, the telegraph became an important medium for the sending and receiving meteorological data. Also, the Customs Service offices were divided into zones according to the geographical location of the various meteorological stations and transmitted their meteorological data to their respective observatories. Additionally, the gradual revision, simplification, and unification of meteorological codes also provided convenience for high-speed data transmission. Finally, the weather data was gathered at the various observatories and interpreted in a specialized way to produce scientific products such as weather forecasts, especially typhoon warnings, which provided important alerts to ships located along the southeast coast of China. Weather alerts were then once again returned to important Customs Service weather stations, which were responsible for displaying specific weather symbols as well as informing people and ships about storms and how to avoid them. In this regard, the Customs Service and the Zikawei Observatory had, after years of practice and experimentation, continually improved sets of meteorological codes, gradually converting from the flag signals to a letter coding system that allowed observers to more clearly see the hanging signals and, therefore, understand their corresponding meanings.

Owing to this rigorous and standardized workflow, the Customs Service established a complex technical and social network in which the Customs Service was both a producer and a consumer of weather forecasts. Through specific technical training and guidance, the Customs Service appointed personnel such as lighthouse keepers to serve as meteorological observers, so that they could learn to use and repair professional meteorological instruments, read, and correct the tables of meteorological instruments, and

follow the unified register. The numbers were recorded in the registers and then forwarded to various observatories throughout East Asia. The weather forecasts that were produced based on the meteorological data observed by the Customs Service became an important platform for displaying the weather symbols after returning to the Customs Service. The influence was mutual; technology can help human society to avoid natural disasters. However, things did not go completely smoothly in this process. For example, due to raging typhoons, there was often a delay when the weather data from each lighthouse station was sent to the observatory. This was disastrous for the observatory, which needed to receive data as quickly as possible. In other instances, due to delays by the staff of the telegraph company, the telegram warnings about the weather situation were often not sent in time.

In sum, through interaction and cooperation, the Customs Service demonstrated its vast organizational and cooperative capabilities, and gradually established a meteorological service system with both scientific and practical benefits. During this process, the Customs Service accumulated a large amount of meteorological data, which not only greatly guaranteed the safety of navigation, but also contributed to the study of historical meteorology in East Asia. The system formed a complex network linking weather data to weather information to science, technology, and, ultimately, human society. Through this process, we can understand the Customs Service as a government agency that, through its diversity and work with scientific institutions, promoted navigation and meteorology from the middle 19th-century to the early 20th-century.

Notes

1 Robert Hart, Circular No. 25, 1870 (first series), 31 Dec. 1870, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1879, 326.
2 *Treaties, Conventions, etc., between China and Foreign States*, vol. 1, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1917, 428.
3 Robert Hart, Circular No. 28, 1869 (first series), 12 Nov. 1869, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1879, 245.
4 *Ibid*.
5 Robert Hart, Documents Relating to, 1. The Establishment of Meteorological Stations in China; And 2. Proposals for Cooperation in the Publication of Meteorological Observations and Exchange of Weather News by Telegraph Along the Pacific Coast of Asia (1874) [Online] Available at: https: //www.bris.ac.uk/history/customs/meteorology.html. [Accessed 17 May 2018], 9.
6 Robert Hart, Circular No. 184, 1882 (second series), 17 Mar. 1882, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai: Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1887, 380.
7 Robert Hart, Circular No. 188, 1882 (second series), 6 May 1882, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1887, 408.
8 Robert Hart, Circular No. 570, 1892 (second series), 13 Feb. 1892, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1893, 462-464.
9 *Ibid*.
10 R.E. Bredon, D.I.G. No. 51, 1903 (second series), 10 Jun. 1903, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1905, 274-277.
11 *Service List*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1903, 121.
12 Robert Hart, Circular No. 10, 1868 (first series), 25 Apr. 1868, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1879, 158.
13 R.E. Bredon, D.I.G. No. 51, 1903 (second series), 10 Jun. 1903, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1905, 274-277.
14 *Ivi*, 277-278.
15 The Maritime Customs. *Instructions Concerning Meteorological Work*, Vol. 4, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1938, 2.
16 Robert Hart, Documents Relating to, 1. The Establishment of Meteorological Stations in China; And 2. Proposals for Co-Operation in the Publication of Meteorological Observations and Exchange of Weather News by Telegraph Along the

Pacific Coast of Asia (1874). Available at: https: / /www. bris. ac. Uk / history / customs / meteorology. html. [Accessed 17 May 2018].

17 International Meteorological Congress. Vienna, 1873, *Report of the Proceedings of the Meteorological Congress at Vienna. Protocols and Appendices*, London, G.E. Eyre, and W. Spottiswoode for H.M. Stationery Office, 1874, 59.

18 Robert Hart, Circular No. 321, 1885 (second series), 28 Dec. 1885, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1889, 12.

19 *Ibid*.

20 The Maritime Customs. *Instructions for Making Meteorological Observations*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1887, 9.

21 International Meteorological Congress. Vienna, 1873, *Report of the Proceedings of the Meteorological Congress at Vienna. Protocols and Appendice*s, London, G.E. Eyre and W. Spottiswoode for H.M. Stationery Office, 1874, 59.

22 The Maritime Customs. *Instructions Concerning Meteorological Work*, vol. 4, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1938, 2.

23 John King Fairbank, Katherine Frost Bruner, and Elizabeth Matheson (eds), *The I.G. in Peking: Letters of Robert Hart, Chinese Maritime Customs, 1868-1907*, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 1975, vol. 1, Letter 49, Hart to Campbell, 14 March 1873.

24 John King Fairbank, Katherine Frost Bruner, and Elizabeth Matheson (eds), *The I.G. in Peking: Letters of Robert Hart, Chinese Maritime Customs, 1868-1907*, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 1975, vol. 1, Letter 70, Hart to Campbell, 6 December 1873.

25 The Maritime Customs. *Instructions Concerning Meteorological Work*, vol. 4, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1938, 497-498.

26 Observation projects: Attached thermometer, Barometer, Dry and wet bulb thermometer, Maximum thermometer, Minimum thermometer, rainfall (millimeters and hours), Wind (direction and force), Clouds (cloudiness, kind, and direction), State of weather, Visibility, Sea (direction and dimensions of waves or swell), Remarks (daily), Remarks (general). The Maritime Customs. *Instructions Concerning Meteorological Work*, Vol. 4, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1938, 498-499.

27 R.E. Bredon, D.I.G. No. 51, 1903 (second series), 10 Jun. 1903, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai: Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1905, 274-277.

28 The Maritime Customs. *Instructions Concerning Meteorological Work*, Vol. 4, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1938, 497, 500.

29 *Ivi*, 1.

30 Conference of Directors of Far Eastern Weather Services Hong Kong 1930, The Royal Observatory, Hong Kong, 1930, 50.

31 The Maritime Customs. *Instructions Concerning Meteorological Work*, Vol. 4, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1938, 1.

32 Robert Hart, Circular No. 938, 1900 (second series), 6 Mar. 1900, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1901, 518.

33 *Ivi*, 519.

34 T. Roger Banister, *The Coastwise Lights of China* Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate-General of Customs, 1932, p. 157.

35 R.E. Bredon, D.I.G. No. 56, 1904 (second series), 2 Jun. 1904, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1905, 589.

36 *Ivi*, 590-591.

37 F.A. Aglen, Circus No. 2265, 1914 (second series), 18 Aug. 1914, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1915, 746.

38 F.A. Aglen, Circus No. 2579, 1916 (second series), 28 Oct. 1916, *Inspector General's circulars*, Shanghai, Statistical Department of the Inspectorate General of Customs, 1917, 768-770.

39 Conference of Directors of Far Eastern Weather Services Hong Kong 1930, The Royal Observatory, Hong Kong, 1930, 57.

40 The Storm Signal Code, *The North-China Herald, and Supreme Court & Consular Gazette (1870-1941)*, 24 May 1907, 462.

41 *Anl-Storm location chart drawn to illustrate the storm signal code issued by Imperial Maritime Customs*, 1 Dec. 1906, Shanghai Library.

42 *Ibid*.

43 *Ibid*.

44 The Storm Signal Code, *The North-China Herald, and Supreme Court & Consular Gazette (1870-1941)*, 24 May 1907, 462.

45 *Ibid*.

46 Conference of Directors of Far Eastern Weather Services Hong Kong 1930, The Royal Observatory, Hong Kong, 1930, 57.

47 International Meteorological Committee. *Report of Proceedings at a meeting of the Commission for Maritime Meteorology and Storm Warnings (17-20 September 1912; London, United Kingdom)*, London, His Majesty Stationery Office, 1912, 19-21.

48 International Meteorological Committee. *Report of Proceedings...*, 24.

49 Conference of Directors of Far Eastern Weather Services Hong Kong 1930, The Royal Observatory, Hong Kong, 1930, 57.

50 Notice to Mariners (NO. 648), *The China Press*, Nov. 29, 1917.
51 *Ibid*.
52 Conference of Directors of Far Eastern Weather Services Hong Kong 1930, The Royal Observatory, Hong Kong, 1930, 57.

Bibliography

Bickers R.
2016 *Throwing Light on Natural Laws: Meteorology on the China Coast1869-1912*, in Bickers, Jackson.

Bickers R., Jackson I. (eds.)
2016 *Treaty Ports in Modern China: Law, Land and Power*, London, Routledge.

Liu Zhao-Ming
1981 *Xiyang qixiangxue shi*, Taibei, China Culture University Press.

MacKeown P.K.
2010 *Early China Coast Meteorology: The Role of Hong Kong*, Hong Kong, Hong Kong University Press.

Wu Yan
2009 *Zi-Ka-Wei Observatory (1873-1950) under the Territorial Expansion of European Modern Science*, Shanghai, Jiaotong University.

Xu Wenxin
2022 *Construction and Transfer of Hart Customs Meteorological Network (1869-1882)*, in "Journal of Customs and Trade", n. 43.

Yang Ping, Wang Zhi-qiang
2019 *Research on Development of Chinese Modern Customs Meteorology and Its Enlightenment*, in "Yuejiang Academic Journal", n. 6.

Zhu M.
2012 *Typhoons, Meteorological Intelligence, and the Inter-Port Mercantile Community in Nineteenth-Century China*, Ph.D. dissertation, State University of New York at Binghamton, Department of History.

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

REDISCUSSION ON THE "SCIENTIFIC" OF MODERN ACUPUNCTURE

Una rilettura della "scienza" dell'agopuntura moderna

Jing Zhao

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723e

Abstract

Acupuncture and surgery are the two main external treatments of traditional Chinese medicine (TCM). In the early stages of their development, both were based on the "muscular anatomy view" of the body and emphasized flesh and bone. Since the Song Dynasty however, literati started to study medicine without requiring a hands-on experience. Subsequently, the external treatment in TCM began to be marginalized. This marginalization continued until the end of Ming Dynasty when Western medicine was introduced. By not combining with Western surgical knowledge, TCM surgery and acupuncture became insignificant. Contemporarily, the meridian theory has caught the attention of scholars, initiated by the interaction between Chinese and Western learning of Chinese medicine. The objective reinterpretation and comprehension of the traditional meridian theory later became the prelude to the modern academic evolution and the scientific development of acupuncture. The gap between TCM acupuncture and surgery therefore became larger. Without modern concepts of "anatomy and physiology" and "disinfection", TCM surgery is still irrelevant while, on the contrary, acupuncture advantageously filled gaps within contemporary medicine.

L'agopuntura e la chirurgia sono stati i due principali trattamenti esterni della medicina tradizionale cinese. Nelle prime fasi del loro sviluppo, entrambi erano basati sull'"esame dell'anatomia muscolare" del corpo e mettevano in evidenza l'importanza della carne e delle ossa. Dalla dinastia Song, tuttavia, si iniziò a studiare la medicina senza richiedere un'esperienza pratica. Il trattamento esterno cominciò ad essere emarginato. Tale situazione continuò fino alla fine della dinastia Ming quando fu introdotta la medicina occidentale. Non dialogando con le conoscenze chirurgiche occidentali, la chirurgia e l'agopuntura tradizionali divennero insignificanti. Contemporaneamente, la teoria dei meridiani iniziò a catturare l'attenzione degli studiosi e avviò l'interazione tra l'apprendimento cinese e quello occidentale basato sulla medicina cinese. Successivamente, la reinterpretazione e la comprensione della teoria tradizionale del meridiano si sono trasformate nel preludio all'evoluzione accademica moderna e allo sviluppo scientifico dell'agopuntura. Il divario fra l'agopuntura e la chirurgia tradizionale si ampliò. Senza i concetti moderni di "anatomia e fisiologia" e di "disinfezione", la chirurgia tradizionale continuava ad essere in difficoltà, mentre, al contrario, l'agopuntura iniziò a colmare il divario con la medicina occidentale.

Keywords: acupuncture, TCM surgery, muscular anatomy view, scientific acupuncture and moxibustion, anatomy and physiology.
Agopuntura, chirurgia cinese tradizionale, esame dell'anatomia muscolare, agopuntura scientifica e moxibustione, anatomia e fisiologia.

Jing Zhao is a licensed acupuncturist in China and a doctoral candidate of the School of History and Culture of Science at Shanghai Jiao Tong University. Her academic interests mainly focus on the history of acupuncture in East Asia. Miss Zhao has several articles on the development and education of acupuncture scientization in Japan and China. Her current research for her dissertation focuses on the standardization of acupuncture in China, Japan, and South Korea. E-mail: zhaojingnzy@163.com.

Jing Zhao *è un'agopuntrice autorizzata in Cina ed una dottoranda della Scuola di storia e di cultura della scienza all'Università Jiao Tong di Shanghai. I suoi interessi accademici vertono principalmente sulla storia dell'agopuntura in Asia orientale. Zhao ha pubblicato diversi articoli sullo sviluppo e sull'insegnamento della scienza dell'agopuntura in Giappone e in Cina. La sua attuale ricerca per la tesi dottorale si concentra sulla standardizzazione dell'agopuntura in Cina, Giappone e Corea del Sud. E-mail: zhaojingnzy@163.com.*

The Body in "Muscular Anatomy"

Ways to understand the body in Traditional Chinese Medicine vary. Early medical practitioners paid more attention to the skin, muscles (sinews), and bones than to the *qi*, meridians, and other impersonal ideas of the configurations of the human body. Early Chinese surgical procedures like "*gepi jieji*" 割皮解肌 (cutting the pi 皮 "skin" and releasing the muscles) and "*juemai jiejin*" 决脉结筋 (severing the channels and tying the tendons) are documented in the *Shiji* (Record of the Grand Historian, completed 91 BCE). To ancient doctors, the skin was the surface of the human body, with the body's continuous depth being made up of "muscle" and "sinew" (Li Jianmin 2007, 3). It is important to note that TCM surgery uses a definition of "muscle" that differs from Western medicine. In TCM, the terms "*ji*" 肌and "*rou*" 肉 are incorporated into the concept of "muscle". The word "skin" was "*ji*", but the word "*rou*" had a different meaning from "muscle", refering to the muscles that can be seen on the body's surface, particularly those that are raised and gathered. Muscles are also referred to by names like "*fenrou*" 分肉 and "*jinrou*" 筋肉in the *Huangdi Neijing* (Yellow Emperor's Inner Classic), each of which had specific forms (Zhao Jingsheng 2014, 255-256, 399). Huang Longxiang coined the term "surface anatomy" to describe the TCM anatomy, which emphasizes the "starting and ending point of muscles" and the body structure that "has muscle function". For instance, local muscles on the surface of the body can be observed and diagnosed to predict internal organs (Huang Longxiang, Huang Youmin 2007, 34, 323). The most basic perspective on the body is one that concentrates on local skin and muscle, known as the "muscular anatomy view". This view is used in acupuncture and surgery, the two main methods of external treatment in TCM (Lin Zhiming, Zhang Wanzhen 2004, 70-75).

Physical Expression of Acupuncture

Acupuncture and moxibustion therapy both treat patients through stimulation of the skin. For instance, the moxibustion technique involves burning moxa directly on the skin. The pricking technique involves rupturing the skin and muscle, poking a vein to cause bleeding, cutting a carbuncle to release the pus, and other techniques (Zhou Zuliang, Fang Yilin 2014, 121-122). Such procedures involve surgical techniques that require knowledge of body tissues and the fundamental structure of the body, including the formation of bone, sinew, blood vessels, and muscle. In addition, with an eye on the living, blood and *qi* are seen as elements that make up the body. The gradual development of *qi*-based medicine is described in texts and figurines that date back to the third and second centuries BCE. These texts again demonstrated the importance of physical, bodily sensations in determining the function, nature, and application of *qi* (Lo, Stanley-Baker, Yang 2011).

Before the *Neijing* 内经 period (roughly 770-221BCE), "skin, muscle, channel (or blood vessels, mai or mo 脉), sinew, and bone" were typically referred to as a relatively solidified whole. For instance, "Weiqi disorder" includes skin parts, muscle clumps, protrusions, blood gas transfusions, and bone affiliations with "Meridian sinew" discussing muscle-related diseases. The "channel" concept, developed and closely associated with acupuncture and moxibustion, emphasized its significance in the structure and operation of the body, giving the "meridian channel" the theoretical central position of the flow of qi and blood and

establishing the theoretical foundation of the meridian system. The introduction in *Neijing* states, "When people are born, they first become an essence, which then forms into brain and marrow; bones serve as a trunk, channels serve as the core, sinews serve as the backbone, muscles serve as the wall, skin is firm, grain enters the stomach, channels are open, blood and qi are in motion". Accordingly, the material and functional foundation of the body for acupuncture and moxibustion is composed of bone, channel, sinew, muscle, skin, blood, and *qi*. Meanwhile, the original text elaborates on the twelve channels that are described as following the physical structure of the body so that their movement, distribution, and connection constitute a full "meridian circulation", serving as the foundation for the justification of bodily functions.

The twelve meridians and the theories of skin, sinew, and muscle served as the foundation for the development of the "channel". Subsequently, there are twelve cutaneous regions, twelve meridian sinews, fifteen collateral vessels, and a skeletal system in the form of bone. Based on this, skin, sinew, muscle, channel, and bone jointly form a theoretical knowledge system for the body that is used to explain and clarify functional activities, pathological mechanisms, and diagnosis techniques, as well as to explain the operations of acupuncture and its distinctive features. A few of the many applications of the various levels of organization lesion needles are the shear needle for skin disease, the round shear needle for muscle diseases, and the lance needle for the chronic malaise in the meridian and collaterals.

Meridians and acupoints are both essential components of the acupuncture and moxibustion theories. In ancient China, acupoints or holes refer to the description of anatomical components connected to muscles. Its structural foundation is the "muscle interspace", or the space between the muscles (*fenrou*). The body's surface can display depressions, which is also the site of acupuncture treatment due it being where qi and blood are most prevalent and where evil qi enters the patient. According to Liu Bing, acupoints are the conceptualized points and crucial components of acupuncture diagnosis and treatment, whereas muscle interspace is the concrete structure of the human body (Liu Bing 2014, 772-774). Acupoints are typically found between muscles, on muscle edges, tendons, bones, and bone edges of the human body. Huang Longxiang also stated that the depressions on the pulsations are often where the acupoints are located (Huang Longxiang 2008, 55). The muscular system is occasionally the primary standard for determining where acupoints are located.

Physical Expression of Surgery

Various TCM surgeries include lancing abscesses, bloodletting, removing projectiles, suturing wounds, repairing hernias, hemorrhoid surgery, castration, and acupuncture were routinely carried out in China even before written records. Fan Xingzhun's statements that "infectious diseases and surgical trauma" are the two major diseases of early human attention demonstrated the importance of surgical history (Fan Xingzhun 1986, 3). Early on, abscess surgeons (yang yi) dealt with conditions such as swollen or sharp wounds, ulcers, and other problems by using a device to scrape off pus and blood from the affected area of the body and removing rotting flesh. Most surgical diseases, primarily muscle ulceration infections, are shown on the skin with distinct physical characteristics that can be seen with the naked eye or felt with the hand.

Many surgical diseases listed in the *Fifty-two-Disease Prescription* are mostly instrument-related injuries, with names like "golden injury", "blade injury" and "wounded person". Fewer injuries are mentioned in *Neijing*, but it does mention surgical body tissues. The blood ceases to flow, followed by successive damage to the muscles, sinews, bones, meridians, pulp and blood, and viscera which will affect the body's structure from the surface to the core. Pathological changes of "cold and heat" cause muscle deterioration

to appear. There is also the early version of the "spleen master muscle" theory, which states that "the absence of the spleen causes the limbs' muscles to have no support for qi and blood to obstruct the channels and render the sinews, bones, and muscles unnecessary". Since surgical diseases are muscle lesions, removing saprophytic muscle is accomplished by paying attention to the "local". The "holistic" perspective, on the other hand, needs to consider and harmonize the body of qi and blood. The Song Dynasty marked a significant turning point in such a limited versus comprehensive understanding of the body.
Before the Song Dynasty, the "local" level of muscle and skin diseases received more attention in surgical treatment. The selection of treatment points, especially the location of acupoints and wound cleaning, was more consistent than the anatomical requirements of acupuncture. The fundamental principles of acupuncture and surgery that were developed during the *Neijing* period persisted until the Song Dynasty and were essentially passed down among the people without being completely set in stone, exhibiting diversification in the characteristics of external treatment.

I. Curing and Declining of External Treatment

Acupuncture and surgery lost ground in the academic tradition as Confucian medicine became steadily more established from the Song to the Ming dynasties (Liang Qizi 2012, 12). Due to the high degree of integration between Confucianism and medical thought, a theoretical connection between the two was established. Neo-Confucianism, which attempted to create a unified view of the world in which all the laws of the universe could be unified in the reasoning system of qi, tai chi, Yin and Yang, and the five elements, was the most prevalent Confucian theory of the Song and Yuan dynasties. The theory of acupuncture gradually unified and solidified in this predominately philosophical environment, and the "meridian theory" came to represent the core premise of acupuncture. Acupuncture aims to emphasize holistic treatment while reinforcing and purging to balance Yin and Yang. Additionally, a key philosophical idea of neo-Confucians is that the theories of the *Gan Zhi* and the five elements, which were initially unrelated to the theory of TCM, naturally evolved into the tools from which the theory of acupuncture could learn. The derived midnight-noon meridian ebb-flow needling technique, which uses a complex calculation and mechanical acupoint selection, gained popularity. Its classical basis is "treatment following seasonal conditions", but it goes against the practical clinical principle (Zhang Shujian 2015, 161-165). Acupuncture and moxibustion's status gradually deteriorated, particularly during the Qing Dynasty.
On the other hand, until the Southern Song Dynasty became an independent entity, Chinese surgery's scope, theory, and treatment changed, trending more to be a "holistic", which increasingly aligned with the pulse diagnosis technology and prescription principles of internal medicine (the so-called "Fang Mai"). Relatively simple superficial surgery started to be replaced by medications or acupuncture therapy at this point, and all external treatments ended except for minor operations (Li Jingwei 1987, 46). The Westerners questioned this, "Strangely enough, they abandoned the lancet after a few centuries but continued to use pulse-feeling and cauterization[1]". Li Gao's 李杲 spleen and stomach theory claimed that a "spleen master muscle" is responsible, which became the foundation of surgical medicine. In this context, TCM surgery also accepted pulse diagnosis and substituted surgery and other related external treatment methods with drug therapy. The history of TCM surgery before the Sui and Tang dynasties was therefore referred to by some scholars as "the age of surgery" and the Song dynasty as "the age of internalization" (Li Jianmin 2011, 13-14). Naturally, surgical trauma and a poor operating environment contributed to a high surgical mortality rate, such as when "muscle is not completely rotten when cut, bleeding till death" (Xu Dachun 2014, 10); The decline in surgery was also a result of a lack of objective knowledge about the human anatomy[2]. As a result, the relationship between anatomy and surgical operation in TCM deteriorated.
Confucian doctors began to practice surgery after the Song dynasty but mainly dealt with suppurative

surgical diseases. Meanwhile, doctors with common folk knowledge were "shunted" aside to learn the skills of trauma, instead relying solely on techniques and experience. In contrast to the emphasis on meridians in internal medicine, for surgery, the most specific part of the human body is the "sinews", or the relationship between bone and bone-muscle groups. "Fall and hit injury, including thickened sinew, ruptured sinew, hypertonicity of the sinews, contracted sinew, and other diseases, is a top priority in the department of injury"[3]. The concept of "sinew" is like that of "muscle", but it differs from Western medicine's definition (Liu Juanzi 1986, 1-2). During Ming and Qing dynasties, the trauma department still failed to get rid of "internal medicine". Current society regarded surgery as a superficial study. Only mediocrities or quacks performed surgery. Such condition inevitably placed internal medicine on a prestigious status.

II. Precursor of Different Situations between Acupuncture and Surgery

Acupuncture and surgery suffered the same fate during the Song Dynasty, showing the signs of "Confucianization" beginning to develop among academics which tended to be conservative in its techniques. Therefore, not only was acupuncture and surgery in a state of decline or even outright disappearance, but the field of treatment covered by the TCM was constantly narrowing. The competition between Chinese and Western medicine took shape from the late Ming Dynasty to the late Qing Dynasty, but for a long time, the two were in a relative balance. At the beginning of Western medicine in China, surgical operations were the most effective, with Peter Parker 伯驾 being well-known for his pioneering surgical career which included the first use of ether anesthesia in China (Chen Qi 2017, 49-54). Later, to gain the Chinese people's full trust and overcome their sense of strangeness and distance, he demonstrated the operation of a small body surface surgery to the public (Yang Nianqun 2006, 47-61). When compared to a surgery which needed anesthesia, the "external display" of the technical characteristics of surgery highlighted the curative effect and superb "craft".

In line with the advancement of western surgery, knowledge closely related to surgery, such as anatomy and bacteriology, was introduced and constantly updated in China. The concepts of "disinfection and sterilization" and "anesthesia analgesia" are the most distinguishing features of Western surgery when compared to traditional Chinese surgery, and they are also key to its curative effect (Ting Yu 1933, 3). Western surgery dominated the medical field. For TCM surgery, the entire concept of in-depth treatment, with internal treatment status rose at this time. The external problems are caused by a discordance between qi and blood. Such interpretation has gradually gained acceptance among doctors. In the end, more external treatments have applied theories of internal medicine. External treatment is therefore limited to minor procedures such as eliminating and expelling, knife and needle cutting, fuming-washing therapy, and medicated wine therapy.

TCM surgery faced the problem of establishing its own historical legitimacy in this context, and Western anatomy was not further combined with surgery-related operations. Furthermore, the rotting of human surface muscles and the possibility of lesions remained the main issues with TCM surgery. As Chinese medicine has the norm "treating the essential issues"（zhi ben), practically "external diseases should be treated by methods from internal medicine" (waibing neizhi) only applies to superficial sores while the real nidus is leaved behind. Yu Yunxiu 余云岫 therefore stated that TCM is based on the "intangible" theories, the opposite of experimental medicine. He insists that it is impossible to groove together the inside and outside nidus as a whole[4].

TCM surgery did not find a reasonable path to integrate "entity anatomy" and "infection treatment" into the discipline. Instead, it became increasingly entangled in the "internal treatment" method, making it difficult to obtain its own legitimacy.

At this time and in contrast to the debate surrounding TCM surgery, acupuncture appeared to be outside the debate between internal and external medicine. A small number of scholars believed that Western knowledge was conducive to "studying the phenomena of nature to acquire knowledge". The scholars appreciated Western medicine's superiority in anatomy and physiology and responded with some degree of acceptance. These doctors, who had previously introduced the physiological anatomy knowledge of zang-fu organs, blood vessels, nerves, and other aspects of Western medicine, also paid attention to the theory of meridians. They focused on investigating the structure of the human body and attempted to reveal the process of meridians' circulation and the movement of *qi* and blood using blood vessels and blood circulation. Wang Honghan 王宏翰, for example, explained the essence of meridians with arterio-venous vessels and believed that meridians run the red fluid (blood) in the four pools in the western half of human body[5]. Wang Qingren 王清任 attempted to observe meridians through dissection and mistook them for the trachea and sanitary duct (Wang Qingren 1956, 17-19). Tang Zonghai 唐宗海 also defined meridians as blood vessels but the conception vessel was the node to control blood flow. He believed that meridians carried both blood and *qi*, and the nutrient and defense intersection was in fact the exchange of breathing gas[6]. Although their efforts did not result in a breakthrough, leaving the interpretation of the meridian theory incomplete, the use of Western medicine's anatomy and physiology to re-interpret and understand the traditional meridian theory from a different theoretical perspective became a prelude to the modern evolution of acupuncture scholarship.

In modern times, when Western medicine was under intense pressure in China, the traditional medical community followed Western medicine's lead by repeatedly clarifying their own "scientific" claims. TCM had been included in the trend of improving, converging, and preserving its essence. TCM surgery, on the other hand, had been reinvented and reintroduced by mainstream scholars and doctors. Just as Huang Meisun 黄眉孙 described, Hua Tuo's technology of extracting marrow from the brain and laparotomizing to flow the intestines had disappeared. Only still dozens of untrustworthy letters of acupuncture kept demonstrating its effectiveness. (Huang Meisun 1914). Sun Yanru 孙晏如 asserted that Western medicine is superior to physical therapy, and that acupuncture is a form of "neo-Confucianism" promoted by Westerners (Sun Yanru 1930, 2). Acupuncture was regarded by Zhang Qian 张謇 as a "consummate skill" and the key to preserving the essence of Chinese culture (Li Mingxun, You Shiwei 2012, 400). Zhang Yunzhong 张蕴忠 also stated that traditional Chinese and western medicine are not incompatible, but that acupuncture represents hidden joints[7]. Acupuncture and surgery, both external treatment methods of TCM, have a disparate status in the debate between traditional Chinese and Western medicine. Why are their circumstances different in modern times? They sought their own rationalization by opposite paths.

III. Modern Acupuncture is Unique

Acupuncture medicine is an effective experiential medicine, despite its historical flaws in anatomy, physiology, and pathology. In this manner, Western surgery, the technology is commonly seen as "operating knife", heavily depends on the advantage of "evidence-based anatomy", "sterilization" which could provide chance for the development of scientific reference of acupuncture. How can the "meridians and acupoints" corresponding to specific anatomy parts and the operation process be incorporated into the disinfection process? The problem's resolution represents the first step towards "scientific" acupuncture. It also adheres to the scientific principle of traditional medicine carried out by the Central Medical Museum 中央国医馆[8]. The "scientification" of acupuncture and moxibustion has gradually become mainstream in modern acupuncture and moxibustion circles. However, this process seemed to be simple but was tortuous instead.

1. Acceptance of Mechanical Body View

By the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the anatomical body of biomedicine had become the sole body in Europe and the United States. Western medicine's anatomy and physiology had the greatest influence on Chinese medical theory and its view of the body in modern times (Pi Guoli 2008, 73). As a famous teaching slogan states that "understanding physiological anatomy can reveal the position of the zang fu, the structure of the organization； Understanding pathological anatomy will know the hidden nidus, the crux of the disease" (Zhu Neiguang 1935, 40-41). Acupuncture works through well-known anatomical structures, which include the central and peripheral nervous systems. After the Meiji Restoration introduced western learning to the study of acupuncture and moxibustion, Japan began comparing meridians and collaterals to the nervous system and attributing the mechanism of acupuncture and moxibustion to the stimulation of nerves. At that time, many relevant Japanese works were translated into Chinese. The introduction of anatomy and physiology played a role in exploring the essence of meridians, positioning of acupoints, interpretation of diseases, and other aspects which is also the requirement of "scientization of TCM" of the Central Medical Museum[9].

The most important step in the "scientization of TCM" is the development of anatomical descriptions of acupoint positioning. This approach first appeared in the book *Latest Practicing Western Acupuncture* 最新实习西法针灸, edited by Aio Okamoto 冈本爱雄 and translated by Gu Mingsheng 顾鸣盛. The book, published in 1900, was the first translation and publication of Japanese acupuncture medicine in China. Gu Mingsheng believes that the decline of acupuncture is due to doctors "only know the meridian points but has no idea of physiology"[10] with "physiology" referring to anatomy. The book discusses acupoints and anatomy, including 32 acupoint and anatomical drawings, to emphasize the importance of anatomy in the study of acupuncture. Words like "muscle", "artery", "vein" and "nerve" are written frequently, whether in pictures or the anatomical descriptions of acupoint location. Meanwhile, according to the disease system of Western medicine, various diseases are classified into the digestive, infectious, systemic, and respiratory categories in the book's "acupuncture and moxibustion treatment" section. Each disease's causes, diagnoses, symptoms, prognoses, and treatments are all detailed. Some critical diseases must be diagnosed by a physician, and surgeons can use acupuncture to explain the causes of diseases based on Western pathology. According to the severity of the disease, "subauricular adenitis" can be divided into Western surgical treatment and acupuncture treatment.

The emergence of "meridian anatomy" disease names in Western medicine, and disease classification injected new ideas into the field of acupuncture. The anatomical structure of acupuncture points in the book directly influenced *the Handout on Acupuncture and Moxibustion of Guangdong Special School of Traditional Chinese Medicine* published in 1927, which had a direct impact on the anatomical structure of acupuncture points in "Chinese Acupuncture and Moxibustion Therapy" compiled by Cheng Dan'an 承淡安. However, the classification of meridian points in this book is still based on the traditional acupuncture standard of twelve main meridians and eight extra meridians. Since the publication of the "warm moxibustion handout" (Zhang Junyi 1928) in 1928 that divided the human body according to anatomy, the meridian point theory has been thoroughly developed to the nerve and blood vessel level to form the "meridian point anatomy". In 1931, Cheng Dan'an went on to say in "Chinese Acupuncture and Moxibustion Therapy" that "every point must be marked with anatomy, to know the content and formation of acupoints" (Cheng Dan'an 1931).

2. Bacteriology and Acupuncture Disinfection

Disinfection is one of the main tasks performed before a surgical procedure. Acupuncture operates similarly to septal acupuncture, which frequently receives cynicism from Western medicine. Acupuncture doctors did not understand the concept of disinfection in ancient times, instead only requiring their ac-

upuncture tools to be clean. There are numerous accounts of "boiling needles" which form the earliest examples of the modern boiling disinfection process; however, they were heated with various drugs as part of the refining process to remove iron toxicity rather than to sterilize the instrument. Prior to acupuncture, some techniques, such as the fire needle, had a disinfecting effect. Another form of disinfection is to warm the needle, mentioned many times by "Suwen" in "On Acupuncture Method", where the acupuncture doctor instructed to "first hold the needle in the mouth to warm it". However, the goal is not to sterilize the needle, but to warm it so that it can harmonize with *qi* and blood, thereby facilitating the movement of *qi* (Zhang Shujian 2018, 303-314).

Only after the theory of "bacteria" was introduced to China did true acupuncture disinfection begin. After its introduction, the bacteria theory was quickly accepted by all classes (Yu Xinzhong 2008, 51-60). Acupuncturists gained a basic understanding of infections caused by acupuncture through newspapers and magazines, so they began to imitate the western technique of disinfection. However, some doctors, such as Zhou Zhongfang 周仲房 and Li Changtai 李长泰, still used the ancient disinfection method of the "mouth warm needle". According to Luo Zhaoju 罗兆琚, "if the terrible bacteria in the blood of the patient would spread to the mouth of the doctor, the doctor's health and life could be difficult to keep" (Luo Zhaoju 1936, 226-227).

The internal driving force for the interest in and application of acupuncture disinfection technology was the awareness of doctors, with the prosperity of acupuncture education playing a key role in its rapid spread. Cheng Dan'an, Luo Zhaoju, Zeng Tianzhi 曾天治, and Zhu Lian 朱琏 attended modern acupuncture and moxibustion schools after receiving a western medical education. They then introduced disinfection knowledge and technology into acupuncture teaching.

The textbook *Lectures on Advanced Acupuncture and Moxibustion* was published by the Yanmeishan Institute of Acupuncture and Moxibustion in Japan and was translated into Chinese by the Oriental Acupuncture and Moxibustion Research Society in 1931. The book *Disinfection* emphasized that "disinfection is the most important subject in the verification test of acupuncture and moxibustion technique" and thoroughly introduced the importance and purpose of disinfection, the strength of viruses, disinfection methods, disinfection types, and more. The highly standardized procedure for the disinfection of acupuncture and moxibustion techniques, involving needles, manipulators, and acupuncture points was also detailed in the book (Miao Zhaoyu 1941). In an article published in the *Journal of Acupuncture and Moxibustion*, Luo Zhaoju stated that "Because acupuncture is a technique that causes damage to the skin and muscle tissues, and our needles, utensils, and fingers are not susceptible to the virus when we come into contact with various patients on a daily basis, it may pose a future hazard if not properly disinfected" (Luo Zhaoju 1936, 226-227). In 1948, Zhao Erkang 赵尔康 stated in the *Outline of the Secret Book of Acupuncture and Moxibustion* that "After the bacteria were discovered under the microscope, more and more attention was paid to the science of disinfection… previously, there was no sterilizing method, prompting the new academic community to try it cowardly. Kampo medicine has fueled the popularity of acupuncture and moxibustion in both eastern and western countries. The most important aspect is disinfection" (Zhao Erkang 1948, 18-19).

Alcohol disinfection, carbonic acid, mercury, formalin and lime, sulfur, acid, and other substances are commonly used in needle disinfection (Luo Zhaoju 1936, 227). The disinfection of acupoints and fingers is also important, as "patients have dirt on the body more than ordinary people, if not in the vicinity of the acupuncture point for disinfection. Dirt can invade the body leading to the occurrence of redness, swelling and ulceration" (Cheng Dan'an 1936, 84). "How should we prepare for clinical surgery? The first step is to clean the hands and fingers of the surgeon, examining the instruments to investigate the patient. After identifying the symptoms, the doctor should determine the course of treatment and the points to be taken, then use clean needles" (Zhang Ruqing, Huang Qi 2013, 44). Acupuncture practitioners advocated for disinfection not only to technically advance the practice, but also to transform acupuncture's identity and to win the respect of Western medicine and the public.

The anatomical and physiological knowledge and the clinical operation of disinfection are basic aspects of Western surgery. In the modern medical field, there have been numerous "debates" between Chinese and Western medicine. Faced with various doubts and the growing influence of Western medicine, the term "disinfection" can now be directly applied to the clinical operation of acupuncture. However, the way Western anatomical and physiological knowledge can be applied to the traditional acupuncture acupoint system does not appear to have been well thought out. Marking the anatomical structure of the acupoints and clarifying the acupuncture sites in imitation of Japanese practices is required for safety reasons, but this method has no substantive integration with the traditional theory of meridian acupoints. To comply with the "scientific" ideological trend, "scientific" acupuncture must be achieved through accordance with the surgical theory and operating rules of Western surgery. This method seems to solve the problem of the "scientific nature" of acupuncture and moxibustion and strives to position acupuncture into the difficult environment dominated by the strong discursive power of Western medicine.

3. Implicit in Traditional Acupuncture

The initial "scientific" practice of acupuncture mainly relied on research from Japan during the Meiji Restoration. Many quotes and translated materials from Japanese acupuncture and moxibustion doctors informed Chinese doctors, allowing acupuncture to respond quickly in the "debate between Chinese and Western medicine" and to not succumb to the same fate the TCM surgery received. When reading books of modern acupuncture and moxibustion medicine, western ideas of anatomy, pathology, physiology, diagnosis, and are independent concepts, providing basic knowledge for any medical discipline to learn from.
The anatomical structure of meridian points is only superficial knowledge of acupuncture. Deeper considerations sought to understand the "meridian theory" and "explain the effect of acupuncture and moxibustion". Some acupuncture doctors made attempts to directly explain the traditional theory of meridians and acupoints with Western medical theory, simplifying acupuncture treatment, concepts, and techniques.
Through the exploration of the essence of meridians and collaterals, doctors first studied blood vessels and then nerves during the time of the early Republic of China. Cheng Dan'an believed that the traditional meridian system of "twelve channels and eight channels" was actually composed of the anatomical system of "vascular lymphatic nerves", and he interpreted the principle of acupuncture as the stimulation and exciting of nerves. The physiological function of 12 meridians flowing *qi* and blood was compared with that of cranial and spinal nerves (Cheng Dan'an 1933, 38, 51). However, after the publication of the *Handout on Chinese Acupuncture and Moxibustion Science* in 1940, he believed that meridians and nerves rarely coincided with each other and instead began "interpreting acupuncture points as stimulus points and meridians as the reflection rays of stimulus points" (Cheng Dan'an 1940, 51). At the same time, the full text of the meridian circulation from *Neijing* was re-inserted into the book, demonstrating a huge change in Cheng Dan'an's beliefs.
The mixing of modern medical knowledge with acupuncture through the process of "scientific" reform also presented complex, contradictory features. During the climax of the TCM and Western medicine argument in the early 1930s, acupuncture was driven by various factors. To find a way out of the debate, acupuncture followed a typical "Westernization" orientation. Acupuncture focused on Japan, copying the experimental results and mechanically adding western medical knowledge to TCM concepts such as the dissection of acupoints.
However, with the establishment of the Central Traditional Chinese Medical Center and the issuance and implementation of the "Regulations on Traditional Chinese Medicine" that treated TCM and Western medicine equally[11], acupuncturists sought to no longer use to Western medical theory to explain acupuncture and moxibustion, instead focusing on the traditional meridian theory. This view sought the

rationality of meridian theory from clinical efficacy and traditional classics. Cheng Dan'an's writing is impressive, reforming the acupuncture and moxibustion apparatus and deleting unreasonable acupuncture operation content, whose omission represents the main "curative effect"[12].
In this way, a convincing theory can be used to legitimize the "unscientific" principles of acupuncture and moxibustion, creating a place for acupuncture in the complicated medical field. Although acupuncture and moxibustion were valued by Westerners for their "scientific" discourse, the fundamental theory of meridians and collaterals did not correspond well with Western medicine's concepts, prompting modern doctors to repeatedly jump between "new knowledge" and "tradition". The therapeutical position and functions of heart are still based on traditional acupuncture and moxibustion. It is obvious that even if some acupuncture and moxibustion theories could omit interpretation on "Yin and Yang and the five elements", the main structure of the "meridian system" still has its supporters.

IV. Summary

Traditional Chinese medicine's two main external treatment methods are acupuncture and surgery. In the early stages of their development, both were based on the "muscular anatomy view" of the body. Observation and palpation were used in diagnosis with pulse diagnosis also being utilized. The distinction between the two main external treatment methods is that surgery required the use of more drugs. Following the Song Dynasty, literati intervened in medicine, promoting medical transformation, focusing on textual knowledge and medical science, preferring academic medicine, such as prescribing pulse diagnosis. The procedures and concepts that required more hands-on medicine experience began to be marginalized. Western medicine was introduced to China at the end of the Ming Dynasty, and its surgical "magic" gradually won over the Chinese people. However, TCM surgery did not integrate with Western surgical operations or concepts, limiting it to minor procedures. Acupuncture's status also deteriorated, especially during the Qing Dynasty, and it was eventually banned. However, some scholars began using meridian theory to introduce Western medicine's physiological anatomy into TCM, such as zangfu organs, blood vessels, and nerves, thereby beginning the interaction between Chinese and Western medicine. The objective reinterpretation and comprehension of traditional meridian theory became the prelude to the modern academic evolution and scientific development of acupuncture.
In modern times, the distinction between TCM acupuncture and surgery is clear. As Western medicine gained preeminence, acupuncture doctors reshaped the academic order of acupuncture. Acupuncture doctors integrated and standardized acupuncture knowledge and concepts to fit with Western medicine, so that acupuncture could be more widely used in clinical treatments, as well as be accepted by people of different identities while also remaining consistent with scientific discourse in theory and practice. However, the evolution of modern acupuncture was not a linear process of "modernization". The initial stage of "scientific" acupuncture was primarily the translation and introduction of Japanese research. Japan had already redefined acupuncture knowledge through modern scientific experiments under the government's leadership during the Meiji Restoration, transforming acupuncture into a modern subject of the medical discipline. This stage was primarily occurred around 1930, when the re-editing of "non-scientific" acupuncture books chose not to focus on traditional acupuncture knowledge, and instead focused on the rare "scientific" works which copied Japan's scientific achievements. During this time, the introduction of "anatomical physiology" and clinical disinfection practices to acupuncture sought to mix acupuncture with the prevailing trend of western medicine, thereby improving the status of acupuncture and quickly completing its "scientific" change in identity. Later, a creative thinking to combine traditional acupuncture knowledge with western medicine of phenology arose. Questions like "what kind of scientific transformation of acupuncture is suitable for acupuncture" and efforts to integrate traditional theories

of human body into modern anatomy and pathology are widely circulated and formed some integrating knowledge for scientific acupuncture (Zhao Jing & Zhang Shujian 2020, 147-157, 298-299). At this point, the TCM survival crisis was resolved with an effort to restore traditional Chinese acupuncture. Traditional medical knowledge was reintegrated into acupuncture to improve the effectiveness of therapeutic practices, objectively and rationally stripping away irrelevant knowledge. This led to the reconstruction of the classical context of acupuncture to prove its unique value.

Acupuncture's modern "scientific" achievement is not a passing fad; it is still in use today in teaching and clinical practice. However, TCM surgery and acupuncture find themselves in different circumstances in modern times. TCM surgery's disappearance can be explained by the lack of "anatomy and physiology" and "disinfection". In contrast, acupuncture bridged this gap in knowledge and practice. According to sociology, acupuncture was forcibly withdrawn from official medical practice in the late Qing Dynasty, instead relying on unofficial folk acupuncturists and ordinary people as daily health care providers without the concern and control of official organizations. Education and scientific experiments for the blind, like acupuncture during the Meiji Restoration, were carried out with the assistance of official welfare policies. Acupuncture's survival is due to it finding a place outside the orthodox medical order to operate in and not being suppressed by the government's special attention.

Notes

1 Chinese and Foreign Medicine [N]. The North-China Herald and Supreme Court & Consular Gazette (1870-1941), 1891-01-09(008版).

2 "In the earlier ages there were some progresses in anatomy, but for the last 1000 years, at least, there has some been practically no advance. The profound respect for the dead has interfered with dissecting and the performing of autopsies", Medicine as Practised by the Chinese [N]. The North-China Daily News, 1917-01-10 (008版).

3 Hu Yanguang 胡延光, *Collection of Traumatology* 伤科汇纂, 1815.

4 Yu Yunxiu, Preface to General Surgery. in Sun Liuxi, Ge Chengxun, *General Surgery* 外科总论, 1-2.

5 Wang Honghan 王宏翰; Chen Yi, Ed. Primitive Medicine, Shanghai Science and Technology Publishing House, 1989.

6 Tang Zonghai 唐宗海, *Chinese and Western Huitong Medical Classics Jingyi*, Qianqingtang Book Company, 1892.

7 Zhang Yunzhong, *Opposing the Melting Theory of Chinese and Western Medicine*, Tianjin Ta Kung Pao, February 1, 1930, 14th edition.

8 Huang Zhuzhai 黄竹斋, *Acupuncture and Moxibustion Meridian Points*, in "Postscript", 2a-2b.

9 *The outline of academic standards of Chinese medicine compiled by the Central Chinese Medical Center*, National physician bulletin 国医公报, 1932, n. 6, 1-6.

10 Aio Okamoto 冈本爱雄，*The latest practice lucifer acupuncture* 最新实习西法针灸, Shanghai Bookstore Publishing Progress, 1915, "Preface", 1-2.

11 *Medical news, The Fifth National Congress Proposed that the Government should treat traditional Chinese and Western medicine equally to benefit People's Lives by virtue of academic benefits*, in "Zhengyan of Traditional Chinese Medicine", n. 21, 1936, 9-41.

12 Some traditional acupuncture techniques have been screened, and many ancient prohibitions on acupuncture points, acupuncture time and indications have been lifted. In this way, part of traditional acupuncture and moxibustion knowledge is preserved and reduced in modern acupuncture teaching materials, which is the inevitable result of the introduction of new knowledge.

Bibliography

Cheng Dan'an

1931 *Chinese Acupuncture Therapy*, China Acupuncture Research Association.

1933 *Revised Chinese Acupuncture and Moxibustion Therapeutics*, Shanghai, Qianqingtang Book Company.

1936 *Questions and Answers on Acupuncture and Moxibustion*, in "Journal of Acupuncture and Moxibustion", 2, n. 3.

1940 *Handout of Chinese Acupuncture and Moxibustion Science*, Wuxi, Chinese Acupuncture and Moxibustion Academic Research Society.

Chen Qi
2017 *The suspicion of the first case of ether anesthesiology*, in "Chinese Journal of Medical History", n. 1.

Fan Xingzhun
1986 *History of Chinese Medicine*, Beijing, Ancient Books of Traditional Chinese Medicine Publishing House.

Huang Longxiang, Huang Youmin
2007 *Surface anatomy of Experimental Acupuncture and Moxibustion. Combination of acupuncture and moxibustion science and surface anatomy and imaging*, Beijing, People's Medical Publishing House.

Huang Longxiang
2008 *Huang Longxiang watching Acupuncture*, Beijing, People's Medical Publishing House.

Huang Meisun
1914 *On Acupuncture and Moxibustion as the Quintessence Suitable for Preservation*, in "Journal of Chinese Medicine", 2, n. 7.

Li Jianmin
2007 *Discovering Ancient Veins: Chinese Classical Medicine and Digital Body View*, Beijing, Social Sciences Academic Press.
2011 *Hua Tuo's Hidden Operation. The History of Chinese Medicine in Surgery*, Taiwan Dongda Books Co. Ltd.

Li Jingwei
1987 *Development of Traditional Chinese Surgery*, in *Chinese Medical Encyclopedia. History of Medicine*, Shanghai, Science and Technology Publishing House.

Li Mingxun, You Shiwei (eds.)
2012 *The Complete Works of Zhang Qian*, Vol. 6, *Miscellaneous Works of Art*, Shanghai, Dictionary Publishing House.

Liang Qizi
2012 *Medicine in the Song and Ming Dynasties, in Facing Disease: Medical Concepts and Organization in Traditional Chinese Society*, Beijing, China Renmin University Press.

Lin Zhiming, Zhang Wanzhen
2004 *The Misreading of TCM Anatomy [M]. Essence or nudity*, Taipei, Laurel Books Company.

Liu Bing
2014 *Discussion on "Valleys" and Connotation of Acupoints*, in "Chinese Acupuncture and Moxibustion", 34, n. 8.

Liu Juanzi
1986 刘涓子, *Liu Juanzi's Ghost Prescription* 刘涓子鬼遗方, People's Medical Publishing House.

Lo V., Stanley-Baker M., Yang D. (eds.)
2011 *Routledge Handbook of Chinese Medicine*, London, Routledge.

Luo Zhaoju
1936 罗兆琚 *Acupuncture and Moxibustion Disinfection Method, Journal of Acupuncture and Moxibustion*, 2, n. 4.

Miao Zhaoyu
1941 缪召予 *Lectures on Advanced Acupuncture and Moxibustion Science. Disinfection*, Shanghai, Oriental Medical Book Company.

Pi Guoli
2008 *The Body View and Thought Transformation of Modern Chinese Medicine: Tang Zonghai and The Times of Integrative Chinese and Western Medicine*, Shanghai: Life · Reading · New Knowledge Sanlian Bookstore.

Sun Yanru
1930 *Acupuncture and Moxibustion must be Advocated to Revitalize Chinese Medicine*, in "Annals of Medical Circles", n. 54.

Ting Yu
1933 *Discussion on Urgent Improvement of Surgical Technique*, in "Changshu Medical Association Monthly".

Wang Qingren
1956 王清任, *Correction of Errors in Medical Works*, Shanghai, Health Publishing. House.

Xu Dachun
2014 徐大椿. *Xu Ping Authentic Surgery* 徐评外科正宗, China Traditional Chinese Medicine Press.

Yang Nianqun
2006 *Reinventing the "Patient". Political Space under the Conflict between Chinese and Western Medicine (1832-1985)*, Beijing, Renmin University Press.

Yu Xinzhong
2008 From epidemic prevention to epidemic prevention: the evolution of epidemic response concepts in *the Late Qing Dynasty*, in "Journal of Central China Normal University (Humanities and Social Sciences Edition)", n. 2.

Zhang Junyi
1928 *Lectures on Warm Moxibustion*, Ningbo, Oriental Society of Moxibustion.

Zhang Ruqing, Huang Qi (eds.)
2013 *Collection of Speeches of Famous Modern Chinese Doctors. Acupuncture and Moxibustion. Lecture Notes*, Shanghai, Science and Technology Publishing House.

Zhang Shujian
2015 *Analysis on the Theory of "Meridian Flow" acupuncture and on the solidification of Jin Yuan Acupuncture Theory*, in "Journal of Acupuncture Research", vol. 40, n. 2.
2018 *History of acupuncture disinfection: Twists and turns and social reactions since Modern times*, in "Studies in the History of Natural Science", n. 3.

Zhao Erkang
1948 赵尔康 *Outline of Acupuncture and Moxibustion Secrets*, Wuxi, Chinese Society of Acupuncture and Moxibustion, 1948.

Zhao Jing, Zhang Shujian
2020 *From institutionalization of Education to institutionalization of knowledge: The modern transformation of traditional acupuncture and moxibustion*, in "Chinese Social and Historical Review", n. 1.

Zhao Jingsheng
2014 *Basic concepts and terms of acupuncture*, Beijing, People's Medical Publishing House.

Zhou Zuliang, Fang Yilin
2014 *Bamboo slip and Silk Medical Literature Proofreading*, Beijing, Academy Press.

Zhu Neiguan
1935 朱内光, *The Will of Mr. Yu Ziwei Autopsy and the number of words* 余子维先生遗嘱解剖敬书数语, in "Journal of Medical Affairs", vol. 7, n. 4.

LABORATORIO

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

LA LETTERATURA SULLE RELAZIONI FRA "UOMO E NATURA" PRIMA DELL'ONDA AMBIENTALISTA (1869-1960)

Literature on the relations between "man and nature" before the environmental wave (1869-1960)

Federico Paolini

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723f

Abstract

Questo intervento presenta i risultati di un esperimento empirico il cui obiettivo era quello di verificare quali esiti avesse restituito una ricerca bibliografica condotta utilizzando i soggetti "uomo e natura" e "uomo e ambiente naturale" nel catalogo Opac, con un arco temporale limitato al 1960. È stata individuata una produzione editoriale esigua, ma già in linea con le tematiche che caratterizzano il dibattito odierno sulla "crisi ecologica". I criteri applicati hanno permesso di individuare opere scritte da alcuni autori che, travalicando i confini del pensiero ecologico, non sono citati dalla letteratura storico-ambientale in quanto sostengono interpretazioni difformi dai paradigmi utilizzati da quella storiografia.

This intervention presents the results of an empirical experiment whose objective was to verify what results had returned a bibliographic research conducted using the subjects "man and nature" and "man and natural environment" in the Opac catalogue, with a time frame limited to 1960. A small editorial production has been identified, but already in line with the issues that characterize today's debate on the "ecological crisis". The criteria applied have made possible to identify works written by some authors who, going beyond the boundaries of ecological thought, are not mentioned in the historical-environmental literature as they support interpretations different from the paradigms used by that historiography.

Keywords: storia dell'ambiente, bibliografia, rapporti fra uomo e natura, Italia, primo Novecento.
Environmental history, bibliography, relationships between man and nature, Italy, first half of the Twentieth Century.

Federico Paolini è professore associato di Storia contemporanea presso l'Università di Macerata. I suoi interessi di ricerca vertono sulla storia dell'ambiente, sulla storia dei consumi e sulla storia globale; in passato si è occupato di storia del movimento sindacale. È Fellow della Royal Historical Society (London) e membro del Committee dell'Association for East Asian Environmental History (Aeaeh).

Federico Paolini *is associate professor of Contemporary history at the University of Macerata. His research interests focus on the history of the environment, the history of consumption and global history; in the past he has dealt with the history of the trade union movement. He is a Fellow of the Royal Historical Society (London) and a member of the Committee of the Association for East Asian Environmental History (Aeaeh).*

Questo intervento presenta i risultati di un esperimento empirico riguardante la letteratura sulle interazioni fra gli esseri umani e l'ambiente naturale edita in Italia fra gli ultimi decenni dell'Ottocento e il 1960, cioè in un arco temporale anteriore al big bang dell'ambientalismo di massa: l'obiettivo era quello di verificare quali risultati avesse restituito una ricerca bibliografica condotta utilizzando i soggetti "uomo e natura" e "uomo e ambiente naturale" del Catalogo del Servizio bibliotecario nazionale redatto dall'Istituto centrale per il Catalogo unico delle biblioteche italiane (https://opac.sbn.it/web/opacsbn).
La scelta del termine ad quem (1960) è stata basata sull'evidenza che la storiografia (Merchant 2002, 177-182; McNeill 2002, 429-433; Torgerson 2004, 475-482; Radkau 2008, 265-280; Stradling 2012; McNeill, Engelke 2014, 173-192) è concorde nell'indicare gli anni compresi fra il 1960 e il 1972 come il momento in cui cominciò ad emergere l'ambientalismo moderno, originato dalla sovrapposizione di sei processi: la progressiva affermazione dell'ecologia politica che considerava i problemi ambientali strettamente correlati al modello di sviluppo imperniato sull'industrializzazione e sull'urbanizzazione (Carson 1962; Ehrlich 1968; Hardin 1968; Commoner 1971; Goldsmith, Allen 1972; Meadows *et al.* 1972); il pacifismo nucleare che, a partire dalla seconda metà degli anni '60, iniziò a disapprovare anche l'utilizzo civile dell'energia atomica (Howard 2000; Herring 2005; Milder 2017); la nascita di organizzazioni non governative che operavano a livello internazionale (il World Wildlife Fund nel 1961; i Friends of the Earth nel 1969; Greenpeace nel 1971); l'esordio di un ecologismo istituzionalizzato promosso dall'Organizzazione delle Nazioni Unite che, nel giugno 1972, riunì a Stoccolma i rappresentanti di 113 paesi industrializzati e in via di sviluppo (Selcer 2018); l'avvio di un movimento di massa – il cui esordio è comunemente indicato nella celebrazione del primo Earth Day, il 22 aprile 1970 – che sosteneva la necessità di una radicale trasformazione degli stili di vita e del sistema economico per arginare la progressiva devastazione della natura (McCormick 1989; Pepper 1996; Wapner 1996; Rome 2013; Montrie 2018; Warde, Robin, Sörlin 2018); la costituzione di nuovi soggetti politici costruiti intorno a programmi incentrati sulla tutela dell'ambiente (Dobson 2007).
Benché i suoi tratti peculiari siano profondamente secondo-novecenteschi, l'ambientalismo moderno affonda le proprie radici nella seconda metà dell'Ottocento quando si svilupparono, prevalentemente negli Stati Uniti, due visioni filosofico-culturali del rapporto fra uomo e natura che si possono sintetizzare sotto i nomi di preservazionismo e conservazionismo. Il primo riteneva indispensabile preservare le porzioni di natura rimaste ancora inviolate per arginare il saccheggio del territorio provocato dallo sviluppo industriale e dall'urbanizzazione; il secondo aveva come obiettivo quello di promuovere azioni volte a razionalizzare gli interventi umani sugli ecosistemi al fine di conservarne gli equilibri biologici. Gli anni Trenta del Novecento segnarono una svolta fondamentale nella storia del movimento per la tutela ambientale, poiché la progressiva affermazione dell'idea che la salvaguardia della natura costituisse un imperativo etico piuttosto che un mero strumento per la gestione centralizzata e produttivistica delle risorse naturali incrinò la credibilità di cui aveva goduto il conservazionismo progressista. Alcuni autori iniziarono a sottolineare la fallacia dell'impostazione economicistica della conservazione ambientale e tentarono di superare la prospettiva antropocentrica fino ad allora dominante elaborando una concezione ecocentrica ed olistica della natura, intesa come un sistema in grado di autoregolamentarsi armoniosamente. Queste idee incontrarono una vasta fortuna tanto che il termine conservazionismo iniziò ad essere utilizzato per indicare quella particolare concezione della tutela ambientale, il cui obiettivo era la massima riduzione della pressione antropica su un ambiente naturale al fine di conservarne gli equilibri ecologici (Worster 1977; Flander 1994; Miller 2001; McMurry 2003; Stradling 2004; Newman 2005; De Steiguer 2006).
Tornando all'oggetto del presente intervento, i criteri applicati hanno permesso di individuare opere scritte da alcuni autori che, travalicando i confini del pensiero ecologico, non sono citati dalla letteratura storico-ambientale in quanto sostengono interpretazioni difformi dal paradigma dell'ambientalismo *mainstream*. È interessante notare come la produzione editoriale individuata, per quanto esigua (Huxley 1869; Marsh 1870; Marselli 1879; Ficalbi 1894; De Lorenzo 1912; Pestalozzi 1926; Daring 1936; von Frisch 1938; Missenard 1940; Guardini 1954; Ghigi 1955; Missenard 1956), affrontasse già quegli argomenti che, ancora

oggi, continuano a dividere quanti partecipano al dibattito sulla "crisi ecologica". Le tematiche affrontate dagli autori sono essenzialmente due: la questione del rapporto fra l'uomo e la natura; la distruzione degli ambienti naturali per opera degli esseri umani.

L'uomo appartiene alla natura?

Nel 1869, l'editore Treves pubblicò *Prove di fatto intorno al posto che tiene l'uomo nella natura*[1] dello zoologo inglese Thomas Henry Huxley, fra i maggiori critici del creazionismo finalistico e – insieme allo zoologo tedesco Ernst Heinrich Haeckel[2] – uno dei principali interpreti del darwinismo. L'autore – ricordando il fascino esercitato su di lui dalle teorie darwiniane, per quanto inizialmente accolte con prudenza – sosteneva convintamente l'origine animale dell'uomo giudicando "infantili" le obiezioni alla dottrina dell'evoluzione ed affermando che "l'evoluzione non [rappresentava] più una speculazione, ma l'esposizione di un fatto storico" che "[trovava] il suo posto tra quelle verità accettate, di cui [dovevano] tener conto i filosofi di ogni scuola" (165-166).
La questione dell'influenza della natura sullo sviluppo delle civiltà umane venne affrontata nel 1879 da Niccola Marselli[3] in un pamphlet intitolato *La natura e l'incivilimento*. Secondo l'autore, le "forme dell'incivilimento" erano influenzate da elementi "geografici, etnografici, storici" quali il suolo e i suoi prodotti, il clima, "la configurazione geografica e la struttura topografica, la relativa posizione geografica, l'aspetto della natura, il carattere fisiologico e psicologico [della] razza". La riflessione di Marselli era fortemente imbevuta della retorica positivista dell'epoca e della convinzione dell'esistenza di una gerarchia razziale; nel suo discorso – alquanto debitore allo storico inglese Henry Thomas Buckle e al fisiologo tedesco Emil Heinrich Du Bois-Reymond[4] – la supremazia dei popoli europei aveva delle motivazioni di tipo geografico-naturalistico:

> Anche per configurazione geografica, l'Europa è la parte del mondo più favorevole al movimento vitale della civiltà. [...] La natura è fatta più umana, essa offre più facili passaggi, più agevolezza agli scambi; è più mite, si lascia dall'uomo percorrere, abbracciare, domare. La grande catena alpina forma la sua maggior separazione: alta e maestosa, non mai fu priva di valichi, che diedero passaggio alle correnti ascendenti della civiltà, la quale, partita dalle regioni mediterranee invase a poco a poco, mediante l'opera dei Latini, le contrade nordiche. Se le condizioni di suolo, di clima, di alimentazione, di configurazione assoluta predisposero il mezzogiorno di Europa a salutare i primi albori del nostro incivilimento, la relativa posizione della Grecia e dell'Italia, prossime agli scali delle civiltà asiatiche ed africane, determinò il viaggio del massimo astro dell'umanità (66-67).

L'aspetto della "natura esterna", concetto mutuato dal Buckle, contribuiva a determinare l'esito del processo di "incivilimento":

> Quando la natura si presenta all'uomo sotto forme gigantesche; quando i suoi fenomeni sono terribili, cioè spesseggiano tremoti, eruzioni vulcaniche, uragani, tempeste; quando la sua forza interna produce animali mostruosi e feroci, malattie pestilenziali, allora ella tende a sovraccitare l'immaginazione a scapito dell'intelletto, a destare quel ribrezzo, quella meraviglia, quel terrore che svegliano la superstizione, ed apparisce come un colosso che rende tapino l'uomo. Tale fu la condizione, vorremmo dire geologica e meteorologica, delle civiltà tropicali; dove più che la più mite natura dell'Europa permise all'uomo di analizzarla e maneggiarla, di sollevarsi al sentimento di sé (54-55).

Marselli, inoltre, aveva letto *L'uomo e la natura* di George Perkins Marsh ed era ben consapevole degli impatti ambientali prodotti dalle attività antropiche:

> Ma l'uomo appartiene sempre alla natura [...]. Vi appartiene quando la distrugge, perché in codesta opera obbedisce alla tendenza della propria conservazione, comune a tutti gli esseri organici, e se la distrugge più che l'animale non faccia, egli è perché il suo egoismo è stato raffinato, sebbene da prima mal diretto, da un pensiero più acuto, che ha per base un cervello più sviluppato. Quando l'uomo dimentica di esser figlio della terra, quando pieno di gioia guarda compassionevolmente la natura abbattuta a' suoi piedi, allora questa si solleva e, scuotendo le membra, si vendica di lui con lo sprigionare malanni che lo riconducono a più miti consigli e a più modesto sentire. Le distrutte foreste lasciano all'umidità accumulata la cura della vendetta, e l'umidità si trasforma in vapore acqueo, che ritorna alla terra sotto forma di piogge dirotte e non sempre amiche. Le colline boscose ed umide divengono rocce, che sui piani abitati dall'uomo lanciano pietre a guisa di nemico che scocca lo strale dopo aver teso l'agguato. Le frane gl'ingombrano il passo, le paludi emanano quell'aria pestilenziale che toglie nerbo a' più robusti e li costringe a meditare sulla umana fralezza. Salutare è però questa vendetta della vilipesa natura; essa e il lume della scienza insegnano all'uomo a ristabilire le anomali perturbazioni e a dirigere la sua attività secondo concetti più razionali. Tale è la storia di ogni umano processo: i primi movimenti della libertà non sono tutti benefici; ma l'uomo impara dalle sventure, e così avviasi a conciliare la libertà con la legge, e giunge a comprendere quello che un gran filosofo osservò, cioè che il solo modo per comandare la natura sta nell'obbedire alle sue leggi (83-84).

Nonostante questa evidente consapevolezza, Marselli, inevitabilmente assorbito dal contesto tardo ottocentesco, invitava a sottomettere la natura rispettandola, senza mettere in discussione il fatto che l'azione umana avesse l'obiettivo di trasformare la "natura esterna in più acconcia dimora, ma anche la società in più degna persona". Insomma, gli impatti ambientali prodotti dagli esseri umani non si potevano considerare un'azione "spietatamente e ciecamente malefica", ma erano una sorta di effetto collaterale tributato al progresso:

> Se molte foreste furono improvvidamente distrutte, altre ne vennero piantate; se i diboscamenti furono causa di piogge più dirotte e d'inondazioni più rovinose, d'altro canto i lavori di arginazione limitarono l'azione devastatrice degli straripamenti. I torrenti furono sviati e diretti a fecondare le basse terre; i terreni paludosi dissodati e bonificati; i terreni esposti alla marea vennero protetti da dighe; le dune istesse conquistate dalla vegetazione; le sabbie dei deserti trasformate da' pozzi artesiani; si aprirono canali, tagliarono istmi, forarono montagne, e fili e rotaie avvilupparono la terra in guisa da far sì che il pensiero circolasse per essa e ne accelerasse le pulsazioni. E noi uomini moderni siamo venuti al segno di non potere neanche immaginare ove si arresteranno gli effetti dell'umana attività, diretta dalla scienza. Chi sa se a quel modo che noi siamo giunti ad incanalare la potenza di alcuni movimenti elettrici, a concentrare ed immagazzinare il calore solare, non potremo un giorno neutralizzare e forse anche utilizzare le più terribili forze meteorologiche, geologiche, cosmiche? [...] E così noi potremo a poco a poco andare trasformando le povere e inospiti contrade delle genti selvagge, le decadute dimore delle antiche civiltà, i futuri alberghi delle crescenti popolazioni in Europa. Havvi nel viaggio ascendente della umanità un cerchio più alto di quello da cui si gode delle vittorie sulla natura, ed è quello in cui l'uomo riposa nell'armonia con la natura. Lassù la scienza è Beatrice. La scienza viene dall'uomo applicata a' fenomeni del mondo morale, e ivi pure, anzi che voler costringere il fiume dell'incivilimento a ritornare alla sua sorgente, è più savio consiglio andarne sgombrando il letto e rettificando le sponde, quando non sia opportuno deviarne addirittura il corso. Una società va sottoposta allo stesso trattamento di qualunque fenomeno naturale: quando la causa del male è scoperta, si può accorrere a combatterla. Or combattere il male sociale non suona violentare e tanto meno spegnere l'attività sociale, come vanno farneticando i poveri sostenitori del cieco dispotismo; ma vuol dire educare i popoli con l'aprire più nobili sbocchi alle malvage passioni, con lo svolgere e dirizzare a migliori porti la indistruttibile attività umana, col far rendere più proficuamente i capitali o male impiegati o che giacciono nascosti. In codesta opera di redenzione l'uomo afferma la sua nobile vittoria sulle eredità selvagge e brutali; ma anche qui, anzi che schiacciar la natura,

> meglio è il farsela amica, anzi che uccidere i sensi, meglio è il menare ad armonia i diritti della materia con quelli dello spirito (84-86).

Una visione affine a quella di Marselli la troviamo nel saggio *La Terra e l'uomo* del geologo Giuseppe De Lorenzo[5]. Dopo aver offerto ai lettori una descrizione degli elementi fisici del pianeta costruita dialogando eruditamente con i saperi umanistici (Aristotele, Dante, Goethe, Kant, Leopardi, Omero, Orazio, Wagner, il buddismo, le dottrine filosofiche orientali...), l'autore, citando l'Amleto shakespeariano, parlava dell'uomo in questi termini:

> Così il genio di Shakespeare, con pochi dei suoi soliti tratti essenziali, esprime, per bocca del pensoso principe, una grandiosa, per quanto pessimista, concezione del mondo. In questa concezione l'uomo è considerato come una quintessenza di polvere: della polvere quindi prodotta dalla stessa crosta della terra altrice; ma come il più sublime aggregato di tale polvere e quindi come il più evoluto degli animali, che concede bellezza al mondo ed è al tempo stesso un fattore, un angelo del mondo per la sua azione ed un dio per la sua comprensione (321-322).

Per questa produzione editoriale, si può individuare un comune denominatore in quello che definirei un "antropocentrismo temperato": gli autori avevano assimilato le idee darwiniane, citavano diffusamente le opere di Ernst Heinrich Haeckel e la loro idea della superiorità dell'uomo sulle altre specie animali non derivava né dal creazionismo finalistico di matrice cristiana, né dal meccanicismo seicentesco di Johannes Kepler o di René Descartes. La posizione apicale della specie umana era spiegata con l'evidenza che l'uomo fosse il solo animale in grado di elaborare saperi multiformi (tanto scientifici quanto umanistici) e di applicarli in sistemi complessi che si sostanziavano in una particolare forma di evoluzione sociale (il "progresso"). Questo evidente antropocentrismo era "temperato" da una altrettanto palese consapevolezza che l'uomo – nonostante le sue capacità intellettuali – non potesse sfuggire alle leggi naturali, né governare a suo assoluto piacimento le forze della natura, le quali restavano comunque imprevedibili.

La guerra contro la natura

Nel 1870, la pubblicazione di *L'uomo e la natura* del diplomatico e naturalista statunitense George Perkins Marsh (Curtis, Curtis, Lieberman 1982; De Steiguer 1997; Dorman 1998; Lowenthal 2000) inaugurò una narrazione dei rapporti fra l'uomo e la natura destinata ad avere una significativa fortuna tanto all'interno quanto all'esterno del movimento ambientalista. Alla base di questa narrazione vi era una visione rigidamente dicotomica in cui le attività antropiche erano sempre considerate un irreparabile danno per gli equilibri naturali del pianeta, mentre le piante e gli animali rappresentavano gli elementi da tutelare in quanto portatori di una positività intrinseca alla loro natura. Il libro di Marsh conteneva un'approfondita analisi dell'azione perturbatrice della specie umana verso l'ambiente che serviva all'autore per fornire argomentazioni utili al tentativo di dare una risposta alla domanda centrale del suo lavoro, ovvero se l'uomo potesse essere considerato una parte della "natura fisica" o, invece, fosse di "essenza superiore". La risposta appariva evidente fin dall'introduzione: nella sua visione, l'uomo era un "perturbatore" degli equilibri naturali e un'entità estranea alla Terra che, "nelle condizioni naturali", sarebbe stata adatta solamente al "sostentamento" delle piante e degli animali:

> L'uomo ha troppo dimenticato che la terra gli è stata concessa soltanto perché egli ne tragga frutto ma non la esaurisca, e tanto meno la devasti spensieratamente. [...] Ma l'uomo è in ogni luogo un agente perturbatore. Ovunque egli posi il piede, le armonie della natura si cangiano in discordia. Le proporzioni ed i compensi che

> assicuravano la stabilità delle disposizioni esistenti vengono rovesciate. I vegetali e gli animali indigeni sono estirpati, e sostituiti da altri di origine straniera; la produzione spontanea è impedita o limitata, e la faccia della terra è interamente spogliata, o coperta di una nuova e forzata vegetazione, e di estranee razze di animali. Questi mutamenti fatti con proposito deliberato e queste sostituzioni costituiscono, invero, grandi rivolgimenti; ma per quanto grandi ne siano la estensione ed importanza, sono però insignificanti, come vedremo, in paragone degli effetti imprevisti e casuali che ne sono derivati. Il fatto che, di tutti gli esseri organici, l'uomo solo dev'essere considerato come forza essenzialmente distruggitrice, e che egli possiede tale energia contro la quale la natura – quella natura a cui tutta la vita materiale e tutte le sostanze inorganiche obbediscono – è quasi impotente a resistere, tende a dimostrare che, sebbene vivente nella natura fisica, egli non le appartiene, che egli è di origine più elevata, e di un ordine di esistenza più nobile di quella degli esseri più umili che sono nati dal suo grembo e si sono sottomessi senza resistenza al suo comando. [...] La terra non era, nelle sue condizioni naturali, adatta perfettamente all'uso dell'uomo, ma solamente al sostentamento degli animali e dei vegetabili selvatici. Questi vivono, moltiplicano le loro specie in proporzioni giuste e raggiungono il loro più alto grado di forza e di bellezza senza indurre o richiedere verun mutamento nelle disposizioni naturali della superficie, o nelle vicendevoli tendenze loro proprie, tranne quella mutua repressione di eccessivo accrescimento che serve ad impedire la distruzione di una specie per opera della usurpazione di un'altra. In poche parole, senza l'uomo, la vita animale inferiore e la vita vegetale spontanea sarebbero state quasi costanti nella forma, nella distribuzione, nella proporzione, e la geografia fisica della terra sarebbe rimasta sostanzialmente inalterata per lunghissimi periodi, e soggetta solamente ai rivolgimenti che possono venire cagionati da ignote cause cosmiche o da azioni geologiche (40-43).

Nel 1936, Bompiani pubblicò *Sfruttatori della natura* di Thomas Daring (un procacciatore di materie prime). Per Daring, lo sfruttamento dell'ambiente era dovuto essenzialmente alla competizione fra gli stati che si contendevano le risorse necessarie per alimentare la crescita delle loro economie:

> Da quando Henry Wickham, rubando le piante dalle quali nacquero le immense piantagioni degli Straits Settlements, strappò al Brasile il monopolio del caucciù, l'Inghilterra ha nelle sue mani tre quarti del caucciù di tutta la Terra. L'America, che produce i tre quarti di tutte le automobili del mondo e possiede la più grande industria di pneumatici, deve pagare i prezzi che Londra impone. E l'America non vuole. Ford manda specialisti nel Sud America con il compito di sviluppare nuove piantagioni; Firestone compra un intero paese – la repubblica negra di Liberia – per piantarvi la sua gomma; da vent'anni Washington e Londra lottano per ogni nuova sorgente petrolifera, per il cotone e, prima di tutto, per i minerali: rame e zinco, nichelio e platino [...]. No, non avrei potuto girare il mondo con il denaro altrui se una lotta spietata per le materie prime e l'oro non scuotesse il mondo, la lotta tra Wall Street e la City londinese, la lotta gigantesca tra il dollaro e la sterlina, alla quale partecipano di quando in quando Berlino e Parigi, Tokio e L'Aia. Fui per dieci anni un soldato di questa battaglia, uno dei tanti che cercano tesori e nuove possibilità (9-11).

Daring era conscio che la lotta per le risorse fosse esacerbata dalla consapevolezza della loro finitezza. Il concetto di limite, evidentemente, era presente nelle riflessioni sulla crescita economica e sulla sua stretta dipendenza dal metabolismo terrestre assai prima che questo fosse reso universale dal rapporto del System Dynamics Group del Massachusetts Institute of Technology per il progetto del Club di Roma sui "dilemmi dell'umanità":

> è possibile estendere le piantagioni ed aumentarne la produzione, ma ogni tonnellata di minerale estratto diminuisce le riserve della Terra. Non si possono concimare le miniere di zinco esaurite. Non si possono seminare le miniere di rame. E allora si vuole sopraffare l'avversario, a qualunque costo. Gli Stati Uniti consumano il 55% della produzione mondiale di zinco. Ogni grammo deve essere importato. L'Inghilterra possiede un

> monopolio di fatto, lo possedette finché gli Americani conquistarono economicamente la Bolivia e si assicurarono il possesso delle più ricche miniere della Cordigliera: rame, nichelio, bauxite, tutti fronti di una lotta titanica che viene condotta quasi sempre silenziosamente e di rado esplode in conflitto aperto, ma che non per questo è meno crudele e meno terribile di uno scontro sanguinoso (10).

Daring, inoltre, si mostra avvertito del fatto che lo sfruttamento della natura (Ponting 1992, 180-215; Meyer 2006; Bainbridge 2020) dipendeva, in buona parte, dalla necessità di soddisfare i consumi di beni di lusso che, a partire dal Settecento, erano stati de-moralizzati perché considerati un contributo significativo alla crescita delle attività economiche in quanto favorivano lo sviluppo del commercio internazionale e la produzione di merci raffinate e sofisticate (Pocock 1985; Boltanski, Thévenot 1991; Sassatelli 2004, 53-68):

> È facile comprendere perché si lotti per i metalli che sono alla base di tutte le maggiori industrie, per le materie prime che muovono automobili ed aeroplani, flotte e motori Diesel, per il cotone che veste i nove decimi dell'umanità. Ma si lotta con lo stesso accanimento per cose che non hanno nessun valore reale: le pietre preziose e l'oro. L'Africa del Sud vive quasi esclusivamente dei suoi giacimenti di diamanti e delle sue miniere d'oro. La forza finanziaria dell'impero britannico fu creata in gran parte sulla credenza dell'umanità che l'oro e i diamanti siano cose preziose quantunque non servano a nulla. E perché l'umanità civilizzata crede a ciò, così come il negro dell'Africa centrale o l'indigeno delle isole dei Mari del Sud credono ai loro feticci, migliaia di cercatori di tesori corrono il mondo alla ricerca dell'oro e delle pietre preziose. L'Inghilterra vigila con la massima attenzione che i nuovi rinvenimenti vadano nelle mani della sua gente, e l'America si affanna a giungere prima, tenta di vincere i diamanti del Capo con quelli brasiliani, gli smeraldi dell'India con quelli columbiani, l'oro del Transvaal con quello della Nuova Guinea (10-11).

L'opera di Daring, infine, è significativa perché, al racconto dello sfruttamento della natura, l'autore sommava quello delle popolazioni autoctone e dei lavoratori, un'impostazione che, anche nel tempo presente, non è molto diffusa nella letteratura dedicata alle questioni ambientali:

> Tutta la regione è sbarrata con reticolati e posti militari. Si può entrare nella zona delle miniere soltanto se accompagnati da un impiegato. [...] Quando gli Spagnoli cominciarono a sfruttare le miniere di smeraldi, si adoperavano macchine del tutto primitive. Si prendevano soltanto le pietre grosse trascurando le schegge e le pietre più piccole. [...] I polli di Muzo beccano da secoli queste schegge, quasi tutti i gozzi sono pieni di piccoli smeraldi. Questi "smeraldi del gozzo" vengono utilizzati da quando possono essere lavorati e da quando le pietre grosse sono diventate rare. Punizioni draconiane puniscono chiunque rubi pollame della regione di Muzo o uccida qualche capo senza permesso. [...] Ecco alcune miniere abbandonate: buche profonde dalle pareti a picco e il cui fondo è coperto da uno strato d'acqua grigio verde. Accanto ad esse si aprono cave nelle quali possono lavorare soltanto i negri più tenaci perché il calore che domina durante il giorno e il freddo glaciale della notte, l'acqua melmosa e la polvere sollevata dalle macchine che spezzano le pietre, rendono la vita un martirio. [...] Novecento uomini lavorano attualmente nelle miniere di Muzo, sventrano il terreno, abbattono la foresta con la dinamite, frantumano le rocce con la nitroglicerina [...]. Torrenti di tumultuosa acqua gialla che serve per lavare la preziosa sabbia corrono nelle condutture. Uomini mezzo nudi e accanto a loro mitragliatrici.
> [...] L'acqua viene raccolta in un vecchio bidone per la benzina e la sabbia in una grande cesta. Macchine? Impianti moderni? Qui il progresso non serve a niente, gli uomini costano meno. Gl'indigeni lavorano quattordici ore al giorno. Da noi essi hanno, alle dieci e alle cinque, una pausa di mezz'ora per rifocillarsi; in molte altre miniere non hanno neanche questo riposo. Un sorvegliante bianco siede sotto un tetto di bambù all'ingresso della galleria e non abbandona con gli occhi gli operai che lavorano alle carrucole, in sei per ognuna di queste. Essi devono raccogliere cinquanta ceste di sabbia all'ora e l'acqua non deve mai raggiungere l'orlo del-

> le gallerie, nelle quali lavorano altre dodici persone [...]. Gli operai soffocano nei buchi di sabbia di Amoulè, annegano se la fune dell'"impianto di pompe" si spezza o se il sorvegliante è ubriaco: gli assassinii e le liti per qualche metro quadrato di questo ricco terreno si ripetono senza sosta (23-25, 31-34).

Nel 1955, Studium pubblicò *La natura e l'uomo* dello zoologo Alessandro Ghigi, uno dei pionieri dell'ambientalismo italiano (Lama 1993; Spagnesi, Zambotti 2001). Da naturalista, la prospettiva di Ghigi ricalcava quella rigidamente dicotomica di Marsh: dopo quattro capitoli dedicati ai "doni della natura vivente", all'ambiente fisico, agli animali e agli ambienti biologici, lo zoologo esaminava i danni prodotti dall'uomo senza allargare lo sguardo ai contesti economici, politici e sociali. Come in Marsh emergeva l'idea di un'umanità in guerra contro la natura, impegnata principalmente a distruggere e a sterminare:

> L'influenza che l'uomo ha esercitato sulla fauna grossa si può sintetizzare come segue. L'uomo, comparso sulla faccia della terra nel momento in cui le più colossali specie di mammiferi avevano raggiunto il loro apogeo, dovette in un primo tempo lottare contro gli animali per difendere la propria vita e per conquistare nutrimento e vestiario. A poco per volta l'uomo, colla sua intelligenza, fabbrica e perfeziona armi e mezzi di difesa e di offesa contro gli animali, alcuni dei quali (cane e cavallo) trasforma in ausiliari propri per la caccia, tanto che fra esso e le belve si stabilisce uno stato di equilibrio. Ultimi perfezionamenti nelle armi accrescono la potenza dell'uomo, che vince ogni battaglia contro le fiere, le respinge e le distrugge. Non v'è più scampo per loro: esse sono alla mercé dell'uomo e l'esistenza di ogni specie dipende dalla sua volontà. L'aumento della popolazione umana e l'estendersi della coltura agraria, lo sviluppo dei mezzi di trasporto e la facilità di spostamento, fa sì che i cacciatori debbono ormai temere seriamente che la loro passione sia destinata ad esaurirsi per mancanza di oggetto. Ma la responsabilità è loro perché, sia nella caccia sportiva che in quella a scopo di commercio, essi non hanno mai avuto la previdenza di salvaguardare i riproduttori ed hanno cercato di uccidere tutto ciò che loro serviva nel momento, senza preoccuparsi del domani (91-92).

Ghigi indicava nell'affermazione delle pratiche agricole l'avvio della depredazione della flora:

> Nella coltivazione delle piante, l'umanità ha compiuto progressi enormi, sia imparando a scegliere ed a selezionare, fissandole, razze maggiormente produttive, sia esaltandone la produttività col miglioramento artificiale delle condizioni di ambiente, che consiste in appropriate concimazioni e adatte lavorazioni del terreno. Così è avvenuto che la vegetazione spontanea della maggior parte delle regioni del globo, ha ceduto e cede il passo ad una vegetazione cosmopolita che tende [...] a rendersi uniforme in tutto il mondo. [...] La vegetazione primitiva è in tal modo gradualmente eliminata [...]. Le devastazioni prodotte dall'uomo sulla flora, non sono certo inferiori a quelle che hanno depauperato la fauna; forse sono anche superiori. L'agricoltura infatti, sostituendo, come abbiamo già accennato precedentemente, la coltura di una determinata ed unica specie in un territorio, dove prima se ne trovavano centinaia, ha condotto a lungo andare a sopprimere numerose specie a vantaggio di poche. [...] L'agricoltura ha inoltre soppresso dovunque ambienti e stazioni vegetali; con esse quelle piante che potevano prosperare solo in quelli (117-118, 121).

Ghigi concludeva rammaricandosi dell'impossibilità di "ricondurre" la flora e la fauna "allo stato primitivo", ma considerava necessario "nell'interesse della scienza, salvare i relitti dell'una e dell'altra". La tutela della natura, a suo dire, era "imposta" anche da ragioni estetiche ed economiche. Gli strumenti per raggiungere l'obiettivo erano indicati nella creazione di territori "sottratti allo sfruttamento umano" (riserve di sfruttamento, riserve integrali, parchi nazionali), nell'approvazione di legislazioni volte a tutelare le risorse naturali e nelle attività educative.

Note

1 Le citazioni, per la difficoltà a visionare l'edizione del 1869, sono tratte dall'edizione del 1961.
2 I lavori di Haeckel iniziarono ad essere pubblicati in Italia a partire dal 1890, quando l'Unione Tipografico-Editrice pubblicò a Torino *Storia della creazione naturale: conferenze scientifico-popolari sulla teoria dell'evoluzione in generale e specialmente su quella di Darwin, Goethe e Lamarck*.
3 Sulla biografia di Marselli si veda la voce curata da Raffaele Romanelli nel volume 70 del *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*, https://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/niccola-marselli_%28Dizionario-Biografico%29/, consultato il 2 agosto 2022.
4 Nel 1864, l'editore G. Daelli & C. di Milano aveva pubblicato *L'incivilimento* di Buckle. La prima traduzione di Du Bois-Reymond uscì invece nel 1928 quando l'editore Athena di Milano pubblicò *Sui confini della scienza della natura; i sette enigmi del mondo: due conferenze*. In precedenza, nel 1883, era apparso un breve estratto sul numero 11-12 del "Giornale Internazionale delle Scienze Mediche" con il titolo *I sette enimmi del mondo, conferenza fatta da Du Bois-Reymond, esposizione sommaria del Dott. Meyer Vincenzo*.
5 Sulla biografia di Giuseppe De Lorenzo si veda la voce curata da Bruno Accordi nel volume 38 del *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*, https://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/giuseppe-de-lorenzo_%28Dizionario-Biografico%29/, consultato il 2 settembre 2022.

Bibliografia

Bainbridge D.A.
2020 *Fur War: The Political, Economic, Cultural and Ecological Impacts of the Western Fur Trade, 1765-1840*, San Diego, CA, Rio Redondo Press.

Boltanski L., Thévenot L.
1991 *De la justification. Les économies de la grandeur*, Paris, Gallimard.

Carson R.
1962 *Silent Spring*, Cambridge, MA, Riverside Press.

Commoner B.
1971 The Closing Circle. Nature, Man, and Technology, New York, Knopf.

Curtis J., Curtis W., Lieberman F.
1982 *The World of George Perkins Marsh: America's First Conservationist and Environmentalist*, Woodstock, Vt. Countryman Press.

Daring T.
1936 *Sfruttatori della natura*, Milano, Bompiani.

De Lorenzo G.
1912 *La terra e l'uomo*, Napoli, R. Ricciardi.

De Steiguer E.J.
1997 *The Age of Environmentalism*, New York, McGraw-Hill.
2006 *The Origins of Modern Environmental Thought*, Tucson, University of Arizona Press.

Dobson A.
2007 *Green Political Thought*, New York, Routledge.

Dorman R.L.
1998 *A Word for Nature: Four Pioneering Environmental Advocates, 1845-1913*, Chapel Hill, University of North Carolina Press.

Ehrlich P.R.
1968 *The Population Bomb*, New York, Ballantine Books.

Ficalbi E.
1894 *Rapido sguardo sul posto dell'uomo nella natura: conferenze*, Cagliari, Tip. del commercio di Felice Muscas.

Flander S.
1994 *Thinking Like a Mountain: Aldo Leopold and the Evolution of an Ecological Attitude Toward Deer, Wolves, and Forests*, Madison Wis, University of Wisconsin Press.

Ghigi A.
1955 *La natura e l'uomo*, Roma, Studium.

Goldsmith E., Allen R.
1972 *A Blueprint for Survival*, London, Tom Stacey Ltd.

Guardini R.
1954 *Il potere: tentativo di un orientamento*, Brescia, Morcelliana.

Hardin G.
1968 The Tragedy of the Commons, in "Science", 162, n. 3859, pp. 1243-1248.

Herring H.
2005 *From Energy Dreams to Nuclear Nightmares: Lessons From the Anti-Nuclear Power Movement in the 1970s*, Charlbury, Jon Carpenter Publishing.

Howard M.
2000 The Invention of Peace. Reflection on War and International Order, New Haven CT-London, Yale University Press.

Huxley T.H.
1869 *Prove di fatto intorno al posto che tiene l'uomo nella natura*, Milano, Treves.

Lama L.
1993 Da un secolo all'altro: profilo biografico e scritti di Alessandro Ghigi, 1875-1970, Bologna, Clueb.

Lowenthal D.
2000 *George Perkins Marsh: Prophet of Conservation*, Seattle, University of Washington Press.

Marselli N.
1879 *La natura e l'incivilimento*, Torino-Roma, Ermanno Loescher.

Marsh G.P.
1870 *L'uomo e la natura, ossia La superficie terrestre modificata per opera dell'uomo*, Firenze, Barbera.

McCormick J.
1989 *Reclaiming Paradise: The Global Environmental Movement*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press.

McMurry A.
2003 *Environmental Renaissance: Emerson, Thoreau and the System of Nature*, Athens, University of Georgia Press.

McNeill J.R.
2022 *Qualcosa di nuovo sotto il sole. Storia dell'ambiente nel XX secolo*, Torino, Einaudi.

McNeill J.R., Engelke P.
2014 *La Grande accelerazione. Una storia ambientale dell'Antropocene dopo il 1945*, Torino, Einaudi.

Meadows D.H., Meadows D.L., Randers J., Behrens W.W.
1972 *The Limits to Growth; a Report for the Club of Rome's Project on the Predicament of Mankind*, New York, Universe Books.

Merchant C.
2002 *The Columbia Guide to American Environmental History*, New York, Columbia University Press.

Merlini G.
1950 *Rapporti fra società umane e paesaggio*, Bologna, Zuffi.

Meyer S.M.
2006 *The End of the Wild*, Somerville and Cambridge, Boston Review/MIT Press.

Milder S.
2017 *Greening Democracy: The Anti-Nuclear Movement and Political Environmentalism in West Germany and Beyond, 1968-1983*, New York, Cambridge University Press.

Miller C.
2001 *Gifford Pinchot and the Making of Modern Environmentalism*, Washington D.C., Island.

Missenard A.
1940 *L'uomo e il clima*, Milano, Bompiani.
1956 *Alla ricerca dell'uomo*, Roma, Edizioni Paoline.

Montrie C.
2018 *The Myth of Silent Spring: Rethinking the Origins of American Environmentalism*, Oakland, University of California Press.

Newman L.
2005 *Our Common Dwelling: Henry Thoreau, Transcendentalism, and the Class Politics of Nature*, New York, Palgrave Macmillan.

Pepper D.
1996 *Modern Environmentalism: An Introduction*, New York, Routledge.

Pestalozzi J.H.
1926 *Mie indagini sopra il corso della natura nello svolgimento del genere umano*, Firenze, Vallecchi.

Pocock J.G.A.
1985 *Virtue, Commerce, History*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Ponting C.
1992 *Storia verde del mondo*, Torino, SEI.

Radkau J.
2008 *Nature and Power. A Global History of the Environment*, Cambridge-New York, Cambridge University Press.

Rome A.
2013 *The Genius of Earth Day: How a 1970 Teach-In Unexpectedly Made the First Green Generation*, New York, Hill and Wang.

Sassatelli R.
2004 *Consumo, cultura e società*, Bologna, il Mulino.

Selcer P.
2018 *The Postwar Origins of the Global Environment: How the United Nations Built Spaceship Earth*, New York, Columbia University Press.

Spagnesi M., Zambotti L.
2001 *Alessandro Ghigi: la sua azione di promozione per la conservazione della natura attraverso la Società emiliana Pro montibus et silvis e la Commissione per la conservazione della natura del C.N.R.*, Ozzano dell'Emilia, Istituto Nazionale per la Fauna Selvatica Alessandro Ghigi.

Stradling D. (ed.)
2012 *The Environmental Moment, 1968-1972*, Seattle, University of Washington Press.

Torgerson D.
2004 *Environmentalism*, in Krech S., McNeill J.R., Merchant C. (eds.), *Encyclopedia of World Environmental History*, Vol I., New York, Routledge.

Von Frisch K.
1938 *Noi e la vita: biologia moderna per tutti*, Milano, U. Hoepli.

Wapner P.
1996 *Environmental Activism and World Civic Politics*, Albany, State University of New York Press.

Warde P., Robin L., Sörlin S.
2018 *The Environment: A History of the Idea*, Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press.

Worster D.
1977 *Nature's Economy: A History of Ecological Ideas*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

PERCORSI

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

RIFLESSIONI SU STORIOGRAFIA E MEMORIA DELLA PERSECUZIONE ANTIEBRAICA
A partire dagli studi recenti di Giorgio Fabre e Michele Sarfatti

Reflections on historiography and memory of Italian anti-Jewish persecution after reading Giorgio Fabre's and Michele Sarfatti's recent studies

Andrea Avalli

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723g

Abstract

L'articolo recensisce e discute due recenti lavori sulla persecuzione antiebraica varata dal fascismo: *Il Gran Consiglio contro gli ebrei. 6-7 ottobre 1938: Mussolini, Balbo e il regime* di Giorgio Fabre e *I confini di una persecuzione. Il fascismo e gli ebrei fuori d'Italia (1938-1943)* di Michele Sarfatti. Considerandoli come approcci storiografici diversi ma complementari, l'articolo avanza alcune considerazioni su storiografia e memoria della persecuzione.

This article reviews and discusses two recent books on the history of fascist anti-Jewish persecution: Giorgio Fabre's Il Gran Consiglio contro gli ebrei. 6-7 ottobre 1938: Mussolini, Balbo e il regime *and Michele Sarfatti's* I confini di una persecuzione. Il fascismo e gli ebrei fuori d'Italia (1938-1943). *By interpreting them as two different but complementary historiographic approaches, the article provides some considerations on historiography and memory of the persecution.*

Keywords: fascismo, antisemitismo, Olocausto, storiografia, memoria.
Fascism, antisemitism, Holocaust, historiography, memory.

Andrea Avalli è insegnante della scuola secondaria superiore e ricercatore post-dottorale presso la Scuola Superiore di Studi Storici di San Marino. E-mail: avalliandr@gmail.com.

Andrea Avalli *is a secondary school teacher in Italy and a post-doctoral researcher at the Scuola Superiore di Studi Storici in San Marino. E-mail: avalliandr@gmail.com.*

L'inizio del 2023 ha visto la pubblicazione di due nuovi e significativi libri sulla storia politica della persecuzione antiebraica varata dal regime fascista nel 1938. Può essere interessante discuterli insieme, prima di tutto perché i loro autori – Giorgio Fabre e Michele Sarfatti – sono tra i principali interpreti della fase storiografica che a partire dalla fine degli anni Ottanta ha arricchito e messo in discussione la ricostruzione dell'antisemitismo fascista elaborata in precedenza, a partire dal 1961, da Renzo De Felice, e in secondo luogo perché i due lavori affrontano il medesimo fenomeno storico da due prospettive metodologiche opposte: una più strettamente italiana, e caratterizzata da un approccio "micro" all'analisi di un singolo ma significativo documento politico del 1938, e una internazionale, volta a riassumere il quadro "macro" della persecuzione degli ebrei nello spazio imperiale italiano fra il 1938 e la caduta del regime nel 1943[1]. Credo inoltre che, nella loro complementarità, tali opposti punti di vista possano stimolare considerazioni complessive e attuali su storia e memoria della persecuzione.

Iniziamo da Giorgio Fabre. In questi ultimi anni, insieme ad Annalisa Capristo, Fabre ha dimostrato come sia ancora possibile ritrovare documenti d'archivio significativi per aggiornare la storia della persecuzione antiebraica. Anche la sua ricerca più recente parte da un nuovo ritrovamento: quello del testo completo della prima versione ciclostilata della cosiddetta *Dichiarazione sulla razza* – una serie di direttive programmatiche per la legislazione antiebraica in corso di applicazione – preparata da Mussolini per essere sottoposta all'approvazione del Gran consiglio del fascismo nella seduta della sera del 6 ottobre 1938. Il testo è stato ritrovato nella copia commentata a mano da Italo Balbo, di cui alcuni estratti scelti erano stati divulgati dalla famiglia Balbo tra 1960 e 1961 per difendere la memoria del gerarca, e che solo oggi è leggibile per intero in un nuovo fondo dell'Archivio centrale dello stato donato dagli eredi. Fabre confronta questo documento con le altre versioni conosciute dell'elaborazione della *Dichiarazione*, oltre che con quelle che all'indomani della riunione del Gran consiglio ne vennero pubblicate da diversi giornali e dall'agenzia Stefani, e con quella ufficiale poi diffusa il 25 ottobre 1938. Il lavoro filologico sulle numerose varianti tra le diverse stesure della *Dichiarazione* – riprodotte in appendice al volume – ha permesso infine a Fabre di riscrivere la storia di quella seduta del Gran consiglio, già analizzata da De Felice e Sarfatti, chiarendo ulteriormente quali intenzioni politiche e persecutorie si possano attribuire individualmente in quella fase a Mussolini, Balbo e ad alcuni singoli gerarchi. In una storia del razzismo fascista quasi sempre guidata "dall'alto" da Mussolini in quanto duce e ministro dell'Interno, la seduta del Gran consiglio del 6 ottobre 1938 appare infatti come un momento unico – benché, e forse non a caso, privo di potere legislativo diretto – di discussione politica relativamente "orizzontale" in merito alla persecuzione tra il capo e i più alti responsabili del regime. Come nota Fabre (p. 78), se da un lato ciò costrinse Mussolini a un confronto collegiale inaspettatamente lungo, dall'altro egli ottenne, con il coinvolgimento del Gran consiglio nell'elaborazione di una sintesi politica contro gli ebrei, l'esplicito sostegno alla persecuzione da parte delle gerarchie politiche ed economiche del Paese.

In particolare, Fabre torna documenti alla mano sulla discussa questione del ruolo di Balbo, interpretandolo come un sostanziale allineamento del governatore della Libia alla persecuzione antiebraica, pur con alcuni distinguo (p. 69). Fu ad esempio probabilmente Balbo, insieme ad Acerbo, a spingere il duce a eliminare dalla *Dichiarazione* il richiamo iniziale al cosiddetto *Manifesto della razza*, pubblicato quasi tre mesi prima e già criticato per la sua connotazione biologista e arianista da alcuni degli scienziati cooptati come firmatari (pp. 79-87). Forse tenendo conto delle stesse obiezioni, Mussolini alla fine eliminò dal testo anche l'unica delle diciture "razza ariana" riferita agli italiani (pp. 164-169). Fabre sottolinea invece come non esistano prove di un intervento pubblico di Balbo a favore degli ebrei libici durante la riunione del Gran consiglio, a differenza dei passi che egli fece in privato presso Mussolini nei mesi successivi (pp. 106-113, 148). Si può forse ipotizzare un ruolo del gerarca nell'estensione delle "discriminazioni" alle famiglie di ebrei fascisti: nel corso dell'elaborazione della *Dichiarazione*, si stabilì infatti che tra queste rientrassero anche quelle dei "fascisti iscritti al Partito" (e non solo degli "squadristi") fino al 1922 e nel "secondo semestre del '24": ciò avrebbe permesso l'esenzione dalle misure antiebraiche dell'ex-podestà

di Ferrara, a lui vicino, Renzo Ravenna (pp. 155-157). In generale, Balbo resta inquadrabile all'interno di una fazione antiebraica moderata e vicina alle posizioni del re (comprendente almeno anche De Bono, Federzoni e De' Stefani), contrapposta a una più intransigente (composta in particolare da Starace, Buffarini Guidi, Farinacci e Bottai). Tale posizionamento di Balbo sembra risultare dai dubbi da lui espressi sull'esclusione dalle scuole medie statali dei bambini ebrei ancora sottoposti a obbligo scolastico, e che lo videro di fatto contrapposto al ministro competente dell'Educazione nazionale, Bottai. Su questo punto, Mussolini trovò un equilibrio: se da un lato inserì nella *Dichiarazione* il permesso per l'istituzione di scuole medie per ebrei (pp. 211-215), dall'altro vi aggiunse la pubblica lode a Bottai – che nella riunione sostenne la necessità di non tornare indietro sull'esclusione degli ebrei dall'insegnamento – per aver istituito le "cattedre di razzismo" nelle università (pp. 202-208, 220). La stessa contrapposizione tra moderati e intransigenti, con il medesimo esito di compromesso politico, emerse in modo anche più evidente nella discussione sulle "discriminazioni" da concedere ad alcune categorie di ebrei militari e fascisti. Durante la seduta, se da un lato i moderati – tra cui Balbo – riuscirono a far estendere le esenzioni dalla persecuzione alle famiglie dei combattenti ebrei "insigniti della Croce al merito di guerra" e non solo di quelli con "medaglie al valor militare o dell'Ordine Militare di Savoia", dall'altro vennero escluse dalle discriminazioni le "famiglie di mutilati, invalidi, feriti" ebrei, se non dei pochi per la "Causa fascista". In termini di proiezioni numeriche, il compromesso tra le due fazioni fu favorevole a quella intransigente: secondo il calcolo di Fabre basato sui dati disponibili ai gerarchi, infatti, la stima complessiva degli ebrei a quel punto "discriminabili" diminuì rispetto al prospetto iniziale (pp. 134-149). Non è l'unico caso in cui le interpolazioni della *Dichiarazione* intervenute durante la riunione o al suo termine dimostrano che il Gran consiglio – o almeno la sua fazione più intransigente – riuscì ad aggravare le direttive contro gli ebrei inizialmente preconizzate da Mussolini: lo stesso accadde con la decisione di estendere il divieto di matrimoni misti non solo ai dipendenti statali, ma anche a quelli degli enti pubblici (pp. 88-91); con la scelta di espellere dal paese gli ebrei stranieri fino ai 65 e non 60 anni, inclusi quelli – inizialmente esentati – con problemi di salute e figli minorenni (p. 97); con l'espunzione dal testo mussoliniano dell'ipotesi di "accordi con i dirigenti dell'ebraismo mondiale" in merito alla possibilità di un'immigrazione di ebrei europei in Etiopia, che venne peraltro ridefinita solo come "controllata" e non più "libera", evitando impegni precisi sul tema (pp. 185-202).

A conferma del fatto che l'ultima parola tra antisemiti moderati e intransigenti spettò comunque a Mussolini, Fabre osserva che non sempre le ricadute legislative della *Dichiarazione* nei mesi successivi corrisposero a quanto stabilito dal Gran consiglio. Al momento della traduzione delle indicazioni politiche in termini giuridici, infatti, vennero inclusi tra i combattenti "discriminati" anche gli ebrei "mutilati, invalidi, feriti" nelle guerre, benché ciò contraddicesse le indicazioni della *Dichiarazione*, e, nonostante ciò, si arrivò comunque, alla fine del 1938, alla messa a riposo di tutti i militari ebrei, compresi i "discriminati" (pp. 150-151). Neanche i dubbi sul Manifesto della razza e sulla dicitura "razza ariana", espressi nella seduta del Gran consiglio, trovarono in seguito un'applicazione legislativa, e – al di là della rivalità politico-ideologica e scientifica tra razzisti – la normativa antiebraica continuò a basarsi su categorie razziali arianiste (p. 173). Tutto ciò non può che dare l'impressione che la riunione del 6 ottobre 1938 avesse per Mussolini soprattutto un valore strumentale: il capo del regime aveva bisogno dell'approvazione politica della persecuzione da parte del Gran consiglio, ed effettivamente adottò nell'azione legislativa successiva diverse proposte, moderate o radicali, emerse in quella faticosa riunione, ma riservò sempre per sé – prima, durante e dopo l'elaborazione della *Dichiarazione* – un arbitrio decisivo sul piano politico, legislativo ed esecutivo.

Sul piano storiografico, la sfida di un libro come questo mi sembra proprio quella di tenere insieme nell'interpretazione del razzismo fascista l'egemonia di Mussolini con la più ampia dialettica di fazioni politiche, culturali, religiose ed economiche che aderirono all'antisemitismo di Stato. In questo senso, la ricerca permette di riconoscere la responsabilità diretta di una larga parte della classe dirigente fascista.

Lo stesso Balbo, di fatto, si allineò alla persecuzione antiebraica e si sottomise alle decisioni di Mussolini: Fabre insiste sulla difficoltà di verificare gli effettivi fondamenti della memoria postuma del gerarca come oppositore del razzismo di Mussolini, trasmessa nel dopoguerra dalla famiglia e da Renzo Ravenna, e sostiene invece la necessità di calare i documenti in un contesto che vide il governatore collaborare alla stesura della *Dichiarazione* e approvarla pubblicamente, sia nella riunione del Gran consiglio, sia tramite il quotidiano di sua proprietà (pp. 221-228). È difficile ormai non riconoscere che le memorie post-belliche delle persone vicine a Balbo, così come quelle di Federzoni, risentirono del tentativo di scagionare dall'accusa di antisemitismo i gerarchi, dipingendone retrospettivamente l'immagine di oppositori di Mussolini se non addirittura di antirazzisti. Come nota Fabre, non è probabilmente un caso che nessuno dei partecipanti alla riunione del Gran consiglio del 6 ottobre 1938 abbia mai parlato in seguito delle decine di varianti tra le versioni della *Dichiarazione*, la cui stessa esistenza ne conferma la redazione collettiva e non solo mussoliniana (p. 252). Allo stesso modo, non può essere un caso che il ciclostilato commentato da Balbo sia ad oggi l'unica copia a noi pervenuta tra le 23 dei membri del Gran consiglio presenti, insieme a Mussolini, la sera del 6 ottobre 1938, e che per poterla leggerla interamente – non solo nelle parti che possono suggerire la "moderazione" di Balbo – ci siano voluti più di ottant'anni (p. 43). Evidentemente, documenti di questo tipo sono stati a lungo considerati compromettenti per una classe dirigente che, già all'indomani del 25 luglio 1943, insieme alla monarchia e agli Alleati, ha cercato di scaricare su Mussolini e sui tedeschi tutta la responsabilità del razzismo, al fine di legittimare la propria transizione post-fascista. Come mostra Fabre, invece, non solo il Gran consiglio collaborò attivamente all'elaborazione delle direttive per la persecuzione, talvolta radicalizzando le stesse intenzioni di Mussolini, ma in tale processo non risultano né ingerenze naziste, né imitazioni di norme tedesche – se non, forse, nel caso delle pensioni e in quello dei figli di matrimoni misti, su cui però, a differenza che in Germania, venne significativamente considerata determinante la conversione al cattolicesimo (p. 233).

Il rapporto tra Mussolini e le gerarchie italiane e il confronto con le politiche tedesche coeve sono temi che attraversano anche il nuovo libro di Sarfatti. A differenza di quello di Fabre, questo si muove su coordinate spazio-temporali più ampie: si tratta di un'estensiva ricerca che sintetizza e aggiorna le conoscenze attuali sulla gestione della persecuzione antiebraica nelle aree occupate o annesse dall'Italia fascista, tra il 1938 e il 1943. La legislazione varata nel 1938 per perseguitare e spingere all'emigrazione gli ebrei italiani e stranieri che si trovavano nella penisola, infatti, non venne automaticamente applicata dal regime al di fuori di essa, ma fu invece soggetta a differenziazioni territoriali, dubbi politici e assestamenti in un contesto europeo e africano in via di evoluzione, caratterizzato dallo scoppio della Seconda guerra mondiale, dai suoi sviluppi militari e soprattutto dall'avvio, nel 1941, dello sterminio degli ebrei da parte dell'alleato nazista. Con il passare del tempo, come dice Sarfatti, "la questione per il fascismo passò progressivamente da 'come e quando allontanare gli ebrei' a 'cosa fare degli ebrei'" nei propri territori (p. 178).

Nell'impero italiano, ad esempio, l'antisemitismo andò a sovrapporsi a regimi discriminatori preesistenti, caratterizzati da altre forme di razzismo alle quali poté risultare subordinato. Nelle colonie dell'Africa orientale, finché esse furono sotto controllo italiano, l'applicazione delle misure contro gli ebrei si intersecò con una normativa razziale che, in nome della priorità politica del dominio imperiale, continuò a basarsi prima di tutto sul discrimine tra cittadini italiani e sudditi coloniali, e perciò gli ebrei italiani e locali videro i loro diritti stabiliti in prima istanza in base alla loro provenienza (pp. 29-35). Anche in Libia, la persecuzione degli ebrei – alcuni dei cui aspetti vennero modificati in loco dai governatori e dal ministero dell'Africa italiana – non fu l'unico dispositivo discriminatorio tra la popolazione: dal 1939, essa si inserì in un contesto segnato dal conferimento a tutti i libici di una forma di cittadinanza italiana di second'ordine, con alcuni privilegi riservati ai musulmani. Tra 1941 e 1942, però, di fronte alle gravi difficoltà militari dell'Asse in Nordafrica, la Libia venne fatta oggetto di una legislazione speciale, con l'allontanamento degli ebrei stranieri, l'internamento – spesso letale – di circa tremila ebrei in campi di concentramento in Tripolitania, e l'entrata in vigore di un'ulteriore stretta persecutoria (pp. 35-42). Una

sostanziale estensione della normativa antiebraica metropolitana, pur con qualche adeguamento, riguardò invece il Dodecaneso (pp. 42-44).
Altrettanto differenziata, ma forse più complessa, è la situazione dei territori che l'Italia annetté successivamente all'avvio della persecuzione del 1938, trovandosi a dover amministrare nuovi gruppi di ebrei e a dover scegliere come considerarli e perseguitarli. È il caso dell'Albania e poi del Montenegro, dove non si arrivò mai a una legislazione antiebraica speciale, salvo il divieto agli ebrei locali di far parte dell'esercito e, significativamente, del partito fascista albanese (pp. 44-49). Qualcosa di simile sembra essere avvenuto nel caso, numericamente più consistente, degli ebrei delle province ex-jugoslave invase e annesse nel 1941, dove sembra essersi sviluppata una tensione tra il ministero dell'Interno di Mussolini, propenso a non conferire loro la cittadinanza italiana per non aumentare il numero di cittadini ebrei, e quello degli Affari esteri di Ciano, interessato invece a considerare anche gli ebrei ex-jugoslavi come cittadini – benché sottoposti a misure persecutorie – per farne strumenti degli interessi imperiali italiani. Di fatto, anche se non di diritto, essi vennero infine considerati, fino al crollo del 1943, come cittadini italiani (pp. 26-27). Si può dunque dire con Sarfatti che, nei Balcani come in Africa orientale e altrove, "in certe situazioni la politica imperiale fascista poteva prevalere sulla politica razziale fascista" (p. 55). Ciò creò quelli che possono ancora oggi apparire dei paradossi. Se Sarfatti ha riscontrato che a Corfù, Mentone, Lubiana (e Bolzano) le autorità italiane cercarono di allontanare gli ebrei locali, o quantomeno di impedire che vi tornassero per cercare rifugio (pp. 28, 170), allo stesso tempo egli rileva che il regime cercò, a partire dal 1940, di tutelare gli interessi economici e le stesse vite degli ebrei italiani – in quanto cittadini italiani e non in quanto ebrei – in zone estere sotto controllo tedesco come la Francia, l'Austria e la Grecia, ma anche nella Tunisia e nel Marocco controllati dal regime di Vichy (pp. 56-63). Quando poi, il 22 settembre 1942, la Germania chiese al regime italiano – nell'arco dei suoi accordi con tutti i paesi alleati o neutrali – di permettere la deportazione dei suoi cittadini ebrei dai paesi occupati dai tedeschi, o in alternativa di rimpatriarli tutti nella penisola, Mussolini dapprima prese tempo in nome della difesa degli interessi economici italiani all'estero, e infine, nel gennaio 1943, ordinò il rimpatrio degli ebrei italiani, allontanando momentaneamente dal pericolo dello sterminio – ma non dalla persecuzione – almeno 1800 persone (pp. 141-151. Sulla base di documentazione del ministero degli Affari esteri risultata priva di riscontri, De Felice aveva invece parlato di "circa 4000").
Per quanto riguarda invece gli ebrei di cittadinanza straniera, oltre a internare quelli ancora presenti in Italia al momento dell'entrata in guerra, e poi quelli trovati nelle zone occupate (pp. 153-161), il regime vietò progressivamente nuovi ingressi nella penisola (pp. 81-88) e poi nelle zone di occupazione francese e croata, ostacolando l'afflusso di profughi in fuga dalla violenza di tedeschi e ustascia (pp. 97-121). Ciononostante, anche in questo caso le circostanze della guerra fecero sì che alcuni gruppi di ebrei stranieri – principalmente provenienti da Libia e Jugoslavia – fossero evacuati nei campi di internamento della penisola o, nel 1943, in un campo apposito dell'isola croata di Rab. Ciò avvenne per allontanare da aree recentemente occupate, o vicine al fronte bellico, gruppi considerati politicamente inaffidabili (pp. 89-95) o, fino all'ottobre 1942, per favorire pochi profughi dotati di mezzi finanziari reputati utili all'Italia (pp. 109, 177).
Pur tra continui assestamenti, fino al 1943 la politica italiana di internamento e respingimento degli ebrei stranieri coesistette con una differenziata persecuzione degli ebrei locali e con la paradossale protezione all'estero, nel nome della difesa degli interessi nazionali, dei beni e delle vite degli ebrei italiani che in patria e nell'impero erano invece sempre più vessati. Tale complessa e contraddittoria tendenza proseguì anche dopo l'autonomo avvio da parte della Germania nazista, nel 1941, del programmatico sterminio degli ebrei nei territori occupati. Delle uccisioni di massa da parte tedesca, come ricorda Sarfatti con una rassegna di testimonianze e documenti, Mussolini e i suoi collaboratori politici, diplomatici e militari appaiono informati fin dall' autunno del 1941, risultando anche a conoscenza dell'uso omicida dei gas almeno dal novembre 1942 (pp. 65-79). Ma al di là della violenza esercitata sugli ebrei in Libia, e del respingimento dei profughi stranieri in fuga dallo sterminio, quali furono prima del 25 luglio 1943 i margini di

collaborazione dell'Italia fascista all'Olocausto europeo e – per usare la nota espressione di De Felice – al suo "cono d'ombra"? La risposta di Sarfatti è nuovamente complessa e regionalmente diversificata. Nel Kosovo annesso all'Albania, il 17 marzo 1942, le autorità italiane di occupazione consegnarono ai tedeschi 51 ebrei profughi dalla Serbia, condannandoli così allo sterminio. Testimonianze della prima metà del 1942, inoltre, riferiscono di centinaia di ebrei consegnati dai militari italiani ai tedeschi, e da questi uccisi, nei territori sovietici invasi (pp. 123-126). Un ulteriore episodio di collaborazione dell'Italia allo sterminio è la concessione del permesso per il transito ferroviario attraverso il Kosovo, nel marzo 1943, di due treni con 4806 prigionieri ebrei macedoni, deportati da Skopje a Treblinka (pp. 163-167).
Più esitanti furono invece le decisioni italiane in zone occupate ma non annesse come la "seconda zona" dello Stato Indipendente di Croazia (1941-43) e la Francia sud-orientale (1942-43). Nel primo caso, la richiesta tedesca dell'agosto 1942 di consegnare alle autorità croate le migliaia di ebrei della "seconda zona" – parte della più ampia collaborazione tra Germania e ustascia allo sterminio – trovò inizialmente favorevole Mussolini ma contrari, per "ragioni di prestigio politico e umanità" oltre che di ordine pubblico, il ministero fascista degli Affari esteri e le autorità militari occupanti. D'altra parte, l'alternativa proposta dal regime ustascia che gli ebrei della "seconda zona", previa la perdita dei beni e della cittadinanza croata, fossero accolti dall'Italia venne invece subito esclusa dal ministero degli Affari esteri. Alla fine, tra ottobre e novembre 1942 Mussolini temporeggiò ordinando l'internamento di tutti gli ebrei della "seconda zona", in vista di una consegna degli stranieri alle autorità croate che venne dapprima rimandata alla primavera del 1943, e poi non attuata entro la caduta del regime (pp. 127-138). Per quanto riguarda invece la richiesta da parte nazista, del 10 luglio 1943, di consegnare gli ebrei tedeschi presenti nella zona di occupazione italiana della Francia sud-orientale, Sarfatti ha ritrovato un telegramma del 15 luglio 1943 con cui il capo della polizia Renzo Chierici – probabilmente d'accordo con il ministero dell'Interno di Mussolini – ordinò al Regio Ispettorato di polizia razziale, con sede a Nizza, di aderire alla richiesta. Sembra che l'Ispettorato abbia perciò preso contatti con la polizia tedesca di Marsiglia, fornendo agli alleati anche delle liste di ebrei presenti in Costa Azzurra, ma con la caduta del regime la collaborazione venne interrotta (pp. 138-140).
Come dal libro di Fabre, anche da quello di Sarfatti emerge un funzionamento del fascismo in cui, a fronte dell'egemonia decisionale di Mussolini in quanto duce, ministro dell'Interno, della Guerra e da ultimo anche degli Affari esteri, alla gestione politica della persecuzione antiebraica fuori dalla penisola italiana concorsero diversi attori, sia a livello centrale (su tutti, il ministero degli Affari esteri di Ciano) che locale (governi coloniali, autorità militari d'occupazione), che non sempre ebbero un ruolo di mera applicazione passiva delle decisioni del capo del regime. Quando queste apparivano troppo allineate alle richieste genocidarie tedesche, o comunque controproducenti rispetto agli interessi politici italiani sul territorio, come in Libia fino al 1941, o a partire da quell'anno nelle province ex-jugoslave annesse e nella "seconda zona" dello Stato Indipendente di Croazia, il ministero degli Affari esteri e le autorità locali provarono talvolta – con successo – a convincere Mussolini a dare la priorità agli interessi del dominio imperiale rispetto a quelli strettamente antiebraici. Tale linea dovette prevalere anche nel caso della difesa degli ebrei italiani all'estero, che portò infine Mussolini – messo esplicitamente di fronte alla possibilità di lasciarli deportare, e quindi uccidere, dai tedeschi – a rimpatriarli nel 1943, nonostante avesse fatto di tutto per farli emigrare e tenerli lontani dall'Italia. Ciò, evidentemente, fu fatto senza mettere mai in discussione l'egemonia del duce, l'antisemitismo o la persecuzione in sé, che anzi nel corso della guerra venne progressivamente radicalizzata in Italia e soprattutto – fino a raggiungere connotati genocidari – in Libia, né venne mai revocata la scelta di respingere o internare gli ebrei stranieri. In diversi casi poi, come si è visto, tra 1942 e 1943 le autorità militari italiane consegnarono gruppi di ebrei stranieri ai loro assassini. Nel luglio 1943, del resto, le ultime (e inattuate) decisioni nel merito di Mussolini, ormai anche ministro degli Affari esteri, come quella di consegnare gli ebrei tedeschi in Francia o quella di trasferire i prigionieri ebrei dalla Calabria (troppo vicina all'avanzata alleata) a Bolzano, sembrano da questo punto di vista significare un più completo allineamento al modello nazista. Com'è noto, ciò si sarebbe poi realizzato pie-

namente a partire dal mese di settembre con l'occupazione tedesca dell'Italia e delle zone controllate dal suo esercito, e con l'esperienza – ormai non più imperiale, ma di fatto limitata a una parte della penisola – della Repubblica Sociale Italiana, a tutti gli effetti un'entità non più solo persecutoria, ma attivamente collaborazionista rispetto allo sterminio degli ebrei.

Come nel caso di Fabre, anche questo libro stimola considerazioni sulla memoria dell'Olocausto nell'Italia post-fascista. Credo infatti che si possa affermare che la (mal digerita) perdita delle colonie e dei territori adriatici e balcanici ha permesso, nel dopoguerra e fino a oggi, la costruzione di due tipi di memorie istituzionali: da un lato, una memoria positiva della presenza militare italiana in Africa e in Europa orientale – costruita per contrasto rispetto al modello tedesco, dalla cui violenza genocida si cerca di smarcare le responsabilità nazionali; dall'altro, una memoria dell'Olocausto concentrata sulla penisola e sugli ebrei italiani, che tende a dimenticare i risvolti della persecuzione nello spazio imperiale e nei confronti degli ebrei stranieri. In entrambi i casi, il rimosso è l'imperialismo italiano con i suoi interessi e la sua violenza. Ma anche quando, in sede storiografica, si è affrontato il tema del rapporto fra Italia ed ebrei fuori dalla penisola, ciò ha potuto produrre ricostruzioni assolutorie del ruolo dei militari e dei responsabili italiani, in contrapposizione esplicita o implicita all'operato di tedeschi e francesi, che ad oggi vanno problematizzate – è stato, ad esempio, il caso di Léon Poliakov, Michael Marrus, Robert Paxton e dello stesso De Felice. Il problema, come conclude Sarfatti (p. 189), è che il peso preponderante e paradigmatico dello sterminio degli ebrei da parte tedesca, nella realtà dei fatti come nella memoria italiana, europea e globale, "ha finito (ed è stato utilizzato) per mettere in ombra" quanto fatto dal fascismo, non solo nella penisola italiana, fin dal 1938. Come nel caso della *Dichiarazione sulla razza* studiata da Fabre, ancora una volta ciò è risultato funzionale alla legittimazione della transizione post-fascista e post-coloniale della classe dirigente italiana, e tuttora – quando l'Olocausto è ormai uno dei punti di riferimento storico dell'identità europeista – produce effetti sul piano della memoria istituzionale.

Dal punto di vista storiografico, i nuovi libri di Fabre e Sarfatti dimostrano come, a fronte di nuovi ritrovamenti documentari e di un allargamento internazionale del raggio delle ricerche, l'approccio politico-istituzionale e militare alla storia del fascismo e della persecuzione antiebraica abbia ancora molto da dire. Esso dimostra infatti una propria vitalità interna, giocando su proprie coordinate metodologiche (un'analisi "micro" sulla filologia di un singolo documento, oppure una sintesi "macro" su un contesto spazio-temporale più ampio), geografiche (l'attenzione per il contesto centrale e nazionale oppure per i suoi esiti periferici, coloniali e internazionali) e sociologiche (il rapporto tra l'egemonia di Mussolini e gli interessi delle élite politiche e militari), per produrre ricerche di tipo diverso e originale. Per il futuro si possono auspicare una maggiore fruibilità pubblica dei patrimoni archivistici privati (sull'esempio degli eredi di Balbo) e un crescente investimento di energie nell'approfondimento della dimensione internazionale del razzismo fascista – dal rapporto con il colonialismo al confronto con gli altri modelli di legislazione antiebraica in Europa, alla comparazione con le scelte di altri regimi dell'Asse rispetto all'avvio dello sterminio degli ebrei da parte tedesca nel 1941. In questo senso, penso si possa dire che c'è ancora molto da studiare, nella speranza che i risultati riescano poi effettivamente a incidere sul piano dell'istruzione pubblica e dell'elaborazione delle politiche della memoria in Italia.

Nota

1 Giorgio Fabre, *Il Gran Consiglio contro gli ebrei 6-7 ottobre 1938: Mussolini, Balbo e il Regime*, il Mulino, Bologna, 2023; Michele Sarfatti, *I confini di una persecuzione. Il fascismo e gli ebrei fuori d'Italia (1938-1943)*, Roma, Viella, 2023.

DIDATTICA

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

LA STORIOGRAFIA NAZIONALE GRECA DELL'OTTOCENTO: Il caso di Sp. Zabelios*

19th century national historiography in Greece: the case of Sp. Zabelios

Theodosio Nikolaidis

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723h

Abstract

Fino alla metà dell'Ottocento, la storiografia greca era articolata attorno al concetto del "rinascimento", della "palingenesia" della Grecia classica nello Stato greco fondato nel 1830. Questo modello lasciava fuori dalla storia greca il periodo medievale. Sp. Zabelios fu il primo da elaborare un nuovo modello storiografico nel quale ha incluso l'età bizantina. L'articolo presenta i punti fondamentali del modello zabeliano e prova di collocarlo nel contesto della politica espansionista della Grecia a partire dal 1850.

Up to the 1850s, Greek historiography was based on the concept of the "renaissance", the "palingenesis" of the classical Greece in the form of the Greek state, founded in 1830. In the historiographical model there was no room for the Middle Ages. Sp. Zabelios was the first one who came up with a new model in which the medieval period was included. The article presents the main points of Zabelios' model and tries to place it into the context of the expansionist policy Greece adopted from 1850 onwards.

Keywords: Grecia, storiografia nazionale, Sp. Zabelios, filosofia della storia, Bisanzio.
Greece, national historiography, Sp. Zabelios, philosophy of history, Byzantium.

Theodosio Nikolaidis insegna Storia Europea Moderna (XVI-XVIII sec.) presso il Dipartimento di Lingue Straniere, Traduzione e Interpretazione dell'Università Ionica di Corfù. Ha pubblicato articoli e libri sulla storia della storiografia francese, sulle ricezione del Machiavelli nella Francia dei secoli XVI e XVII e sul suo pensiero. Recentemente ha tradotto le sue *Istorie Fiorentine* in greco. E-mail nikolai@ionio.gr.

Theodosio Nikolaidis *Professor of Early Modern European History at the Foreign Languages, Translation and Interpretation Department of the Ionian University in Corfu. He has pubblished articles and books on the French historiography, the reception of Machiavelli in 16th and 17th c. France and on his thought. Recently he translated the Florentine Histories into Greek. E-mail nikolai@ionio.gr.*

A Spyridon Zabelios (1815-1881) è attribuita l'invenzione del cosiddetto schema "tripartita" della storia greca – vale a dire della sua sostanziale continuità[1] (Dimaras 1986; Koubourlis 2005) dall'Antichità classica fino all'epoca moderna, passando – e in questo consiste la novità – per Bisanzio[2]. In effetti, fino ad allora, quantomeno da parte degli intellettuali che si riconoscevano nel movimento illuminista[3], la questione della continuità della storia greca non veniva posta o, per essere più precisi, essa seguiva una linea obliqua che passava per l'Occidente. In seguito alla battaglia di Cheronea[4], che marcherebbe la fine dell'antichità classica, lo spirito greco sarebbe stato conservato dai macedoni e dai romani – nel novero dei quali, nella scia di Montesquieu e di Gibbon, venivano altresì inclusi i bizantini – fino al Rinascimento, allorché gli eruditi bizantini l'avrebbero trasportato in Occidente. Qui esso avrebbe dato avvio alla lunga marcia dell'Europa verso l'Illuminismo per infine rientrare, verso la metà del Settecento, al suo paese natale e, in tal modo, rigenerarlo. Questo schema – secondo il quale né i macedoni né i bizantini avrebbero fatto parte della storia greca – si deve a personaggi come Adamantios Korais (Korais 1803) e ai suoi amici[5], i quali vedevano nella Rivoluzione del 1821 e nella creazione dello Stato greco una rottura se non con il passato ortodosso quantomeno con il Patriarcato di Costantinopoli. E forse non è un caso se il momento in cui Bisanzio entra nella storia greca coincide con il momento in cui lo Stato greco tenta di riconciliarsi con il Patriarcato in seguito alla crisi provocata dalla dichiarazione d'indipendenza della Chiesa greca.
È questa, quantomeno, l'ipotesi[6] che intendo verificare nelle pagine seguenti: se si vuole comprendere appieno quali fossero i propositi di Zabelios allorché incorporava Bisanzio nella storia greca, è necessario innanzitutto leggere la sua opera sia nel contesto del dibattito sull'indipendenza della Chiesa nazionale greca sia in quello dei dibattiti su altre questioni religiose, dibattiti sorti fin dalla fondazione dello Stato nel 1830. Inglobando Bisanzio, Zabelios inseriva nella storia nazionale il cristianesimo[7] nel tentativo di farne un elemento essenziale dell'identità greca, allo scopo, come vedremo, di rinforzare gli argomenti di coloro che speravano di risolvere la questione d'Oriente dando vita a un impero greco-ortodosso alleato con la Russia[8].
Prima di esaminare il modo in cui Zabelios inserisce Bisanzio nell'ellenismo e la maniera in cui, attraverso lo schema da lui proposto, egli ha saputo far progredire i dibattiti aperti alla sua epoca, cominciamo dunque con l'analizzare il contesto in cui quei dibattiti politico-religiosi ebbero luogo.

I.

Nel 1833 la Reggenza proclamò la Chiesa di Grecia come "autocefala", sottraendola così alla giurisdizione del Patriarcato di Costantinopoli (Mavromoustakoy 2003). Agli occhi del governo e di Theoklitos Pharmakidis – il quale, amico di Korais e ispiratore del progetto, era altresì segretario del Consiglio ecclesiastico creato dalla Riforma per gestire gli affari della Chiesa greca – la posta in gioco era doppia: da un lato sottomettere la Chiesa al controllo dello Stato secondo il modello dell'Europa protestante e dell'Inghilterra e, dall'altro, proteggere l'indipendenza greca dall'influenza della Russia ortodossa (Mavromoustakoy 2003, 35). Nel campo opposto, ovvero in quello dei partigiani del Patriarcato e della Russia, Konstantinos Oikonomos, il loro capo incontrastato, riteneva che la creazione dello Stato greco non fosse che una tappa verso l'incorporazione in esso, con l'aiuto della Russia, di tutti gli ortodossi dell'Impero ottomano. In quest'ottica, la rottura col Patriarcato costituiva evidentemente una ferita per l'unità della nazione (Matalas 1998, 49-50).
Tra il 1833 e il 1850 le relazioni tra Costantinopoli e Atene si interruppero senza per questo arrivare a uno scisma[9]. Dopo il 1833 le sedi dei vescovi che, nominati dal Patriarca, erano nel frattempo deceduti erano rimaste vacanti[10]. Poiché il problema era andato via via aggravandosi, nel 1849 il governo greco inviò degli emissari a Costantinopoli nel tentativo di trovare una soluzione. Alcuni mesi dopo, nel 1850, grazie soprattutto agli sforzi della diplomazia russa, che all'epoca esercitava una grande influenza sugli ambienti

fanarioti, il Patriarca pubblicò un decreto (Tomos) con il quale, facendo come se la proclamazione del 1833 non fosse mai avvenuta, "creava" in Grecia una Chiesa indipendente (Mavromoustakou 2003, 36).
Il decreto patriarcale diede luogo a dei lunghi dibattiti che si protrassero fino al 1852, quando Zabelios diede alle stampe i Canti popolari. In questo dibattito si opponevano due concezioni differenti della nazione e della sua storia. Due mesi prima dell'apparizione dei Canti, Pharmakidis pubblicava *Il decreto conciliare*[11]. In questo libro scriveva che la nazione greca era venuta a costituirsi come tale durante la rivoluzione del 1821 e che essa si identificava con lo Stato e non con la religione: in epoca bizantina essa era stata qualcosa di indeterminato e di esistente soltanto in potenza, perduta com'era all'interno di una Chiesa e di un impero multinazionali (Matalas 1998, 111). In un altro testo, Pharmakidis fece notare che "la nazione greca non è mai stata identificata con tutta la razza greca, con tutti gli abitanti dell'impero che hanno creduto nel Cristo al modo ortodosso" (Matalas 1998)[12].
La risposta degli oppositori fu che "la Grecia ha da sempre formato un tutto [...] grazie all'indissolubile legame della religione". Fin dall'inizio del XIX secolo, ovvero dai tempi di Rigas Ferraios e della Società degli Amici (= Philiki Etaireia), tutti gli ortodossi "greci, bulgari, serbi daci e albanesi [...] si sono votati alla difesa della Fede e della Patria". Il fatto che la Tessaglia, la Macedonia e la Dacia non fossero riuscite a liberarsi non significava affatto che la guerra d'indipedenza fosse stata una guerra locale, ristretta al Peloponneso, alla Rumelia e alle isole: essa era stata una guerra "nazionale e greca". Il suo scopo non era stato "il regno di Atene ma l'impero di Costantinopoli. [...] Il regno di Atene è un prodotto [...] delle circostanze, di diverse avventure e della diplomazia". Aggiungevano inoltre che l'indipendenza della Chiesa era stata opera della Reggenza straniera, la quale "mal rappresentando il re minorenne, [...] non agiva come Grecia bensì come Occidente"[13].
Quello dell'indipendenza ecclesiastica non fu l'unico conflitto politico-religioso al quale il giovane Stato greco dovette far fronte al momento della sua nascita. Ve ne furono infatti anche degli altri, come per esempio il conflitto riguardante la traduzione delle Sacre Scritture in neogreco effettuata da Neophytos Vamvas e messa all'indice dal Patriarcato; la persecuzione condotta su richiesta del partito di Oikonomos nei confronti del prete Theofilos Kairis, accusato di insegnare l'ateismo nella sua scuola ad Andros; i dibattiti sul rapporto Stato/Chiesa condotti in occasione del voto sulla costituzione nel 1844; le discussioni sulla Grande Grecia (la Grande Idea), lanciata nel 1844 dal francofilo Ioannis Kolettis e respinta dai partigiani del Patriarcato e della Russia con il pretesto che, essendo di ispirazione occidentale, essa mirava, nei fatti, a ristabilire l'unione tra cattolici e ortodossi; l'affare delle pseudo-reliquie di San'Andrea donate dalla Russia alla città di Patrasso e denunciate come un imbroglio dai partigiani di Pharmakidis – a loro volta accusati di "luterocalvinismo"; la questione Pacifico-Parker[14], la quale rafforzò l'atteggiamento di rifiuto nei confronti dell'Occidente, laddove dopo il 1850 il movimento religioso-populista di Papoulakos rinfocolerà i sentimenti russofili; la nuova condanna di Kairis e, infine, il processo intentato contro il missionario americano Jonas King. Agli occhi dei russofili tra Pharmakidis, Kairis e i missionari protestanti non c'era nessuna differenza: erano tutti strumenti di una cospirazione inglese mirante a "separare la Grecia combattente dal resto della nazione e dall'Ortodossia perché è solo così che si può neutralizzare lo spirito Greco in Oriente, annullare gli obiettivi del 1821 e sottomettere la Grecia all'Occidente" (Matalas 1998, 97 e Liakos 1983).
Questo breve schizzo dei conflitti e dei dibattiti politico-religiosi che ebbero luogo tra il 1833 e il 1852 varrà, spero, a dare un'idea del contesto all'interno del quale va situata l'opera di Zabelios. Lo schieramento di Oikonomos era caratterizzato da uno stretto legame con la Russia, da un atteggiamento di rifiuto nei confronti dell'Occidente e, soprattutto, dall'identificazione della Grecia con l'Ortodossia – identificazione intesa come fondamento di un progetto politico: la creazione di un vasto Stato greco esteso dal Danubio a Creta e dalle Isole Ionie all'Asia Minore, con Costantinopoli come capitale.
L'altro schieramento, invece, prediligeva l'Occidente e, pur senza arrivare a una rottura totale con l'Ortodossia, intendeva subordinare la Chiesa allo Stato. In maniera analoga ai liberali occidentali, alcuni dei sodali di Pharmakidis consideravano la religione come una questione privata e pensavano che l'attaccamento alla legge e la consapevolezza degli interessi reciproci bastassero a fondare la coscienza nazionale[15].

II.

Possiamo ora rivolgere la nostra attenzione ai *Canti di Zabelios*, la cui "Introduzione" costituisce, come già accennavamo, il primo tentativo di riflessione sistematica sulla questione della continuità storica dell'ellenismo. Zabelios stesso qualifica la propria opera come "storionomica" (Zabelios 1852, 19)[16]. La storionomia è la scienza che studia le leggi del divenire storico nella fattispecie, della storia dell'ellenismo[17] – progetto ispirato a Hegel, di cui Zabelios aveva seguito alcuni corsi in Germania (Michalopoulos 1950, 37). Frutto in gran parte della lettura di cronachisti bizantini, l'"Introduzione" si presenta come un piano per delle ricerche future da condurre secondo le linee-guida tracciate dall'autore. Però l'Introduzione trova la sua ispirazione non soltanto in Hegel ma anche nella storiografia romantica francese e in Walter Scott, e questo in un duplice senso: da un lato, infatti, Zabelios dirige la propria attenzione verso la "nazione", e non verso lo Stato; dall'altro, egli stesso ammette l'esistenza, all'interno della società bizantina, di una dualità nazionale analoga a quella di franchi e galloromani o di normanni e anglosassoni nelle opere di Augustin Thierry, François Guizot e Walter Scott (Nikolaidis 2003-04)[18].

All'inizio del suo testo Zabelios scrive che ogni nazione è dotata di una propria particolare inclinazione: l'una inclina verso l'industria, l'altra verso il commercio ecc.; l'inclinazione propria della nazione greca è l'isonomia (Zabelios 1852, 31) – ossia l'uguaglianza di fronte alla legge, vale a dire una delle conquiste principali della Rivoluzione francese e una delle caratteristiche distintive dei regimi politici moderni, ivi incluso quello fondato dalle prime Assemblee nazionali della rivoluzione greca[19]. Il punto di partenza della ricerca di Zabelios è dunque lo stesso degli storici francesi della Restaurazione e di Hegel: il presente deve includere il passato, il presente deriva dal passato; di conseguenza, una giusta interpretazione della storia deve partire dal presente e ritrovare i suoi elementi costitutivi, trasformati ma non alterati, nel passato[20]. In Francia, Augustin Thierry e François Guizot pensavano di poter capire il Medioevo a partire dal 1789. In particolare, collocavano le origini della nazione e del Terzo stato urbano in quelle città alto-medievali dove, secondo loro, i galloromani si erano rifugiati dopo la conquista del loro paese dai franchi. Le municipalità erano sfuggite dalle gerarchie feudali e organizzavano la vita pubblica secondo i principi dell'uguaglianza giuridica ereditata dal diritto romano. I bourgeois delle città medievali, vale a dire quelli che facevano parte delle municipalità, avevano conservato lo spirito dell'isonomia il quale, nel 1789, fu esteso in tutto il paese.

In Grecia, Zabelios parte anche lui dall'isonomia intesa come principio politico fondamentale stabilito dalle Costituzioni rivoluzionarie e cerca di ritrovarla nel passato. Il periodo dell'Antichità classica non poneva particolari problemi: era generalmente ammesso che i regimi politici della modernità, democratici e isonomici, seguissero l'esempio della Grecia classica. I problemi sorgevano in riferimento all'epoca successiva e, in particolare, al Medioevo: per stabilire un legame, una continuità storica tra isonomia classica e isonomia moderna occorreva passare per il Medioevo[21]. La soluzione proposta da Zabelios è una lettura democratica del Cristianesimo o, meglio, dell'Ortodossia – lettura che non sfuggì alla critica di Oikonomos[22].

L'antichità classica, argomenta l'autore, porta con sé non soltanto l'isonomia ma anche la ragione e le scoperte scientifiche. Dal canto suo, la religione ebraica ignora sia la scienza sia la ragione: "Tra il Creatore e le creature, tra la Causa e l'Effetto si elevava un muro invalicabile"; "Essendo il Dio-Padre infinito e l'Uomo minuscolo [...], l'umanità era ridotta a un niente rispetto all'idea assoluta della Divinità". Ciononostante, in quanto prodotto dello spirito greco, "l'umanità in sé e per sé" (=η καθόλου ἀνθρωπότης) esiste. Occorre dunque che "le conquiste intellettuali, le scoperte scientifiche [...] e, soprattutto, l'istituzione dell'eguaglianza [...], verso la quale, seguendo la Grecia, oggi si muovono tutte le società, [...] ricevano da Dio-custode, autorità, santificazione e benedizione". Tale bisogno è stato soddisfatto dall'incarnazione (=ἐνανθρώπισις) di Dio (Zabelios 1852, 59-60)[23]. Il fatto che Dio sia divenuto uomo e abbia fatto la propria comparsa nel bel mezzo della Storia santifica infatti il cammino dell'umanità e le sue conquiste e, so-

prattutto, "santifica l'uguaglianza e insegna l'emancipazione universale". "Tutti uguali, tutti Fratelli, tutti liberati", scrive Zabelios, cristianizzando in tal modo il motto della Rivoluzione francese e riconciliando cristianesimo e modernità politica (Zabelios 1852, 61)[24].

Secondo Zabelios, però, il cristianesimo non si è limitato ad adottare l'isonomia greca ma l'ha anche fatta progredire: infatti, mentre, a dispetto della propria adesione al principio di uguaglianza, l'ellenismo non aveva saputo risolvere il problema della schiavitù, il cristianesimo ha proclamato che "tutti gli esseri umani sono stati riscattati": "Si spiega dunque in altro modo l'ardente zelo con cui il popolo democratico (=δημοτικός) della Grecia ha accolto fin dall'inizio questa filosofia umanitaria, liberale e preziosa" (=φιλάνθρωπος, φιλελεύθερος και πολυτελής) (Zabelios 1852, 27).

Questa impostazione conduce l'autore alla conclusione che il Medioevo non ha decretato la fine dell'ellenismo: quest'ultimo avrebbe anzi fatto il proprio ingresso nel Medioevo senza perdere i propri tratti essenziali, salvo il fatto che, durante quest'epoca, a incaricarsi di preservarlo sarebbe stata la Chiesa. Zabelios constatava infatti, nella società bizantina, una dualità analoga a quella rilevata dagli storici francesi del primo Ottocento: così come, in seguito alla battaglia di Hastings (1066), in Inghilterra il regno era stato diviso tra conquistatori normanni e gli anglosassoni conquistati; così come la Francia era stata divisa tra franchi e galloromani, allo stesso modo a Bisanzio l'impero era stato diviso tra romanismo ed ellenismo. A Roma appartenevano l'impero e l'aristocrazia; all'ellenismo il popolo e la Chiesa[25]. Si trattava di due schieramenti opposti l'uno all'altro i quali, fino alla caduta dell'impero, erano sempre stati in conflitto.

Queste dunque le nozioni basilari per mezzo delle quali Zabelios passa in rivista dodici secoli di storia bizantina, da Costantino il Grande a Costantino Paleologo. Le questioni principali di cui si occupa sono la soppressione di Copidermo[26], l'Ippodromo e la pressione esercitata sugli imperatori dall'elemento popolare per suo tramite, i costumi mortuari, l'Iconoclastia (che egli considera come un attacco portato dalla monarchia contro la Chiesa e il popolo)[27], l'evoluzione della lingua e della poesia, lo scisma, l'occupazione latina dopo il 1204 e la questione della riunificazione delle chiese avanzata dagli Ottomani alla vigilia della presa di Costantinopoli.

In questa sede sarebbe impossibile affrontare tutti questi temi. Ai fini della nostra discussione sarà tuttavia opportuno dire qualcosa sullo scisma, sull'occupazione latina e sulla riunificazione delle Chiese.

Lo scisma interessa l'autore in quanto fu grazie a esso che l'Ortodossia prese coscienza della propria singolarità. Secondo Zabelios, in Occidente, la Chiesa cattolica volle sostituirsi al potere politico e farsi monarchia in quanto nel Medioevo quel potere politico era debole. In Oriente, al contrario, dove il potere politico romano era rimasto ben saldo, l'ambizione politica del clero era stata sottoposta a dei limiti – ciò che spiega perché la Chiesa fosse rimasta a fianco del popolo. Fu questa differenza, secondo Zabelios, la causa profonda dello scisma del 1054. Effettivamente il famoso filioque – la dottrina cattolica sull'emanazione dello Spirito Santo non solo dal Padre ma anche dal Figlio, di cui il successore di San Pietro, ossia il papa, fungeva da vicario in terra – conduceva a un rafforzamento del potere papale che per la Chiesa d'Oriente era inconcepibile (Zabelios 1852, 321-323)[28].

Lo scisma fu salutare per la nazione in quanto all'epoca dell'occupazione latina fu la barriera religiosa che separava i conquistatori dai conquistati a impedirne la fusione o, per meglio dire, l'assimilazione dei greci conquistati ai latini/franchi. Fu durante questo periodo che, attraverso il contatto con i crociati, la nazione prese coscienza della propria particolarità. Pare peraltro che anche gli stranieri abbiano sentito questa evoluzione perché è a partire di questo periodo che nelle lingue occidentali la parola "greco" ha sostituito il termine "romano" (Zabelios 1852, 423, 438).

In seguito alla partenza dei latini dalla capitale bizantina, il potere imperiale comincia ad ellenizzarsi. Il processo viene tuttavia interrotto dalla questione della riunificazione delle Chiese. Di fatto, poco prima dalla presa di Costantinopoli per mano ottomana, la riunificazione decisa dal concilio ecumenico di Ferrara-Firenze pose gli "elementi nazionali" – vale a dire la Chiesa e il popolo – di fronte a un dilemma: schiavitù o rinuncia alla propria religione (Zabelios 1852, 495)? Tanto più che i Paleologi, ovvero i rappre-

sentanti di un potere romano che cercava di nazionalizzarsi, consideravano loro nemici la "nazione" e gli ottomani e loro amico l'Occidente (Zabelios 1852, 505). Naturalmente la nazione scelse di rimanere fedele alla propria religione e di abbandonare un imperatore amico dei suoi nemici.
È qui, alla fine di questa lunga introduzione, che Zabelios arriva ad affrontare le questioni di attualità della sua epoca. La presa di Constantinopoli – la quale rappresenta a suo avviso il momento in cui la questione d'Oriente è giunta a una soluzione definitiva (Zabelios 1852, 497) – è presentata come il frutto di una specie di negoziato tra gli ottomani e la nazione greca: quest'ultima, dice Zabelios, ha acconsentito all'occupazione del trono imperiale fatti salvi però i suoi diritti futuri; essa ha lasciato il trono bizantino nell'attesa di riuscire a riprenderlo al momento in cui "sarebbe costruita la sua nazionalità" (= της οἰκοδομηθησομένης ἐθνικότητός του) (Zabelios 1852, 500). La "nazionalità che verrà costruita" rimanda, penso, non tanto alla secolarizzazione della nazione, che fino a quel momento era esistita unicamente in quanto Chiesa, quanto alla conquista del potere politico, al momento dell'identificazione della nazione con lo Stato sognata da tutta la storiografia romantica.
Ma questo sogno era già stato realizzato nel momento in cui Zabelios scriveva?

> La lotta per il riscatto ecclesiastico e politico è giunta alla fine? Ci basta quello che i consigli reali hanno previsto per noi e per i nostri fratelli? Siamo liberi e indipendenti di prendere decisioni sugli interessi più vitali del nostro avvenire in maniera libera e senza essere influenzati? Possiamo dirci politicamente Greci – Greci secondo i nostri diritti e i nostri obiettivi – se tre milioni di confratelli ortodossi soffrono nella servitù? [...] No. La servitù del trono ecumenico deve essere, per coloro che oggi chiamiamo Greci liberi, simbolo delle lotte future, messaggio della costituzione futura, obiettivo e fine di ogni sforzo pio e patriottico. Così, invece di cercare un modo per sfuggire all'asse comune dell'Ortodossia allo scopo di abbandonare egoisticamente la lotta nel momento stesso in cui questa ha luogo col pretesto del bisogno di una indipendenza falsa, effimera e irrealizzabile, in un territorio che non gode di vera indipendenza politica ma obbedisce piuttosto ai consigli di persone straniere per religione e per nascita (= εἰς ἀλλοθρήσκων και ἀλλογενῶν ἐπίρροιας) sarebbe meglio cercare il modo di rafforzare i legami familiari fino al momento tanto atteso e proteggere la nostra casa ancestrale minacciata dalla servitù e dalla diplomazia (Zabelios 1852, 551-52).

III.

Il lungo paragrafo con cui termina l'introduzione dei Canti offre a mio avviso una chiave per comprendere a quale scopo mirasse Zabelios nello scrivere questo testo. Attraverso questo paragrafo, infatti, Zabelios si schierava chiaramente nel campo di Oikonomou[29] e di tutti coloro che sognavano un impero greco che accogliesse assieme tutti gli ortodossi dai Balcani all'Asia Minore, grecofoni o meno che fossero. È tenendo bene a mente questo aspetto che si comprende il senso del capitolo LXXVII, intitolato *Ellenismo e slavismo*. Per molto tempo, infatti, si è creduto che la storiografia greca ottocentesca avesse adottato una posizione "difensiva" e che il suo scopo principale fosse quello di respingere la visione dello storico tedesco Fallmerayer il quale sosteneva che i greci moderni non fossero etnicamente puri ma mescolati con delle popolazioni di origine slava[30]. Questo però ha fatto sì che si lasciasse fuori dal campo visivo una versione importante del nazionalismo greco – quella che identificava la nazione con l'Ortodossia e che mirava ad inglobare nella nazione greca tutti gli ortodossi a sud del Danubio, ovvero soprattutto i bulgari. Pure, allorché Zabelios scriveva che "la naturale tendenza all'autonomia dimostrata dall'elemento slavo installato in Grecia" era la causa "della sua identificazione con l'elemento greco autoctono" e, un po' più avanti, che "lo spirito Greco [...] soprattutto attraverso l'Ortodossia [...] ha a poco a poco consumato e mangiato (=κατέφαγε) gli elementi barbari non educati (=ἀκατέργαστα), privi di storia e di religione che erano venuti verso di lui", (Zabelios 1852, 395, 396) egli aveva in mente l'in-

clusione – auspicata da Oikonomos e dai membri del suo schieramento –, di un altro popolo "fratello" ma "non educato", ossia i bulgari[31]. Quello che Zabelios e gli altri non avevano previsto era lo sviluppo – in risposta al nazionalismo greco e alla creazione dello Stato nazionale greco – di un nazionalismo bulgaro il quale, proprio in quanto i greci si identificavano con l'Ortodossia e con il Patriarcato, doveva anch'esso passare per l'indipendenza ecclesiastica.

Restano la questione dell'isonomia e il rimprovero mosso a Zabelios da Oikonomos a proposito dell'introduzione della democrazia all'interno del cristianesimo[32]. In realtà, l'isonomia costituisce il filo rosso e l'elemento distintivo del discorso di Zabelios rispetto a quello degli altri partigiani del Patriarcato. Zabelios non era né un prete né un devoto[33]: egli era un liberale che aveva studiato in Occidente e che, quantomeno nel suo testo del 1852, non aveva sacrificato nulla del suo credo liberale. Ciò che tuttavia lo separa dagli storici liberali francesi è il fatto che egli volle fare della religione un elemento fondamentale dell'identità nazionale[34]. Questa particolarità si comprende grazie ai progetti di espansione dello Stato di cui sopra. I partigiani del Patriarcato volevano incorporare nello Stato delle popolazioni che, pur non essendo necessariamente grecofone, erano tuttavia ortodosse[35]. Secondo la bella espressione di Paraskevas Matalas, la lingua non era un criterio di appartenenza nazionale ma un obiettivo. Andava insegnata agli ortodossi non grecofoni (Matalas 2000, 29)[36]. In altre parole, l'identificazione di religione e nazione non era una fatalità, era una scelta legata a un preciso progetto politico.

Si potrebbe tuttavia avanzare la seguente obiezione: la religione è, secondo Zabelios, parte integrante del concetto di nazione o una fase passeggera mirante a preservare il proprio carattere essenziale (l'isonomia) e di cui ora potrebbe sbarazzarsi? Non si potrebbe dire che la nazione si è servita della religione fino al momento in cui essa ha conquistato il potere politico e imposto un regime isonomico, e che ora non ne ha più bisogno? Il lungo paragrafo sopra citato è sufficiente, mi sembra, a smentire questa ipotesi. Di più. Nel suo tentativo di spiegare "storionomicamente" la sconfitta dell'Iconoclastia, Zabelios afferma che la religione ortodossa ama i simboli (=φιλοσύμβολος) in quanto, contrariamente ad altre religioni[37], essa non è una religione dell'individuo ma una religione sociale che, in quanto tale, ha bisogno di simboli per forgiare un sentimento di comunità tra i fedeli (Zabelios 1852, 312 e 143). È dunque in quanto religione della collettività che essa può identificarsi con la nazione. Proprio in quanto, di contro, la loro religione è rivolta all'individuo e non alla collettività, i protestanti non hanno nessuna difficoltà a dire che la religione è una questione "personale e privata".

Giungiamo in tal modo a toccare con mano i limiti del liberalismo di Zabelios. Attraverso gli strumenti della dialettica storica, Zabelios è riuscito a combinare assieme isonomia e religione, modernità politica e una certa visione dell'ortodossia[38]. Egli non è riuscito però a incorporare nel proprio pensiero l'altro versante del liberalismo – quello che cerca di garantire non solo l'uguaglianza ma anche l'autonomia dell'individuo, le libertà individuali[39]. Zabelios non fu in grado di trovare un compromesso tra nazione egualitaria[40] e indipendenza individuale.

Concludiamo: la nazione è una forma simbolica composta da elementi variabili ma coerenti. I limiti geografici iniziali dello Stato greco non erano casuali: esso comprendeva, oltre le Cicladi, il Peloponneso, l'Attica, la Beotia, la Phitia, l'Etolia e l'Acarnania vale a dire gran parte di ciò che il XIX secolo riconosceva come Grecia classica . Tra questi confini da una parte e, dall'altra, le prime costituzioni liberali, la decisione del 1833 che mirava ad un tipo di rapporto tra Stato e Chiesa sostanzialmente moderno, le idee di Athanasiou sulla religione come affare privato, la linea obliqua della storia greca che metteva l'accento sui rapporti con l'Occidente liberale c'era coerenza: la Grecia moderna era figlia dell'antichità ma in maniera indiretta; l'Occidente liberale era la sua madre surrogata, quella che aveva raccolto e conservato i semi classici prima di partorirla e di installarla nei luoghi dove aveva vissuto la sua madre naturale. Zabelios propone una concezione diversa ma anch'essa coerente: l'idea che le caratteristiche democratiche dell'antichità non avevano abbandonato l'Oriente ma erano rimaste sul suolo natale trasformando l'ebraismo in una religione universale e la Chiesa orientale in una istituzione democratica si combina nell'opera del no-

stro storico con l'identificazione degli ortodossi dell'impero ottomano con la nazione greca e la progettata espansione dell'elemento greco. Questo progetto, i cui primi segni erano apparsi alla fine del Settecento quando il Patriarcato aveva abolito gli arcivescovati di Peja e di Ocrida e proibito l'uso della lingua "slavonica" nella liturgia imponendo quella greca, fu in gran parte realizzato durante le guerre balcaniche con l'espansione territoriale dello stato greco verso nord. Nello stesso tempo questo progetto è riuscito a dare alla forma simbolica della nazione e alla sua storiografia una fisionomia che oggi pare indiscutibile. È utile però non dimenticare che verso la metà dell'Ottocento questa concezione dell'identità e della storia nazionale era solo una delle alternative possibili.

Note

* Vorrei ringraziare Giacomo e Gigi Corazzol che hanno tradotto il mio testo dal francese all'italiano.

1 Più precisamente Zabelios fu il primo che ha voluto fondare su principi filosofici la continuità storica della Grecia. Di continuità – ma letteraria non storica – avevano parlato altri, per esempio Anthimos Gazis nel suo dizionario biografico della letteratura greca [*Biblioteca greca*, 1807 (*Ελληνική βιβλιοθήκη*)]nel quale ci sono voci su autori sia dell'antichità classica sia dei periodi ellenistico, romano e bizantino. (Kitromilides 1996, 486). Lo stesso Kitromilides, pur accettando che Zabelios "ha risolto il problema della continuità", scrive che nell'opera dell'illuminista D. Katartzis si trovano le prime espressioni della teoria della continuità storica (*ivi*, 105).

2 Zabelios ha presentato il suo schema nella lunga introduzione, di oltre 600 pagine, alla raccolta di canti popolari pubblicata da lui a Corfù nel 1852. Nel 1857 Zabelios è tornato sulla storia bizantina con un libro meno interessante del primo, intitolato *Studi bizantini*. Lo studio più recente e completo su Zabelios è quello di I. Koubourlis (Koubourlis 2005). Sulla sua biografia si veda l'articolo di F. Michalopoulos (Michalopoulos 1950).

3 Nei circoli intellettuali stambolioti fin dall'ultimo quarto del XVIII secolo, si pubblicavano cronache sul modello dell'*Histoire Universelle* di Bossuet. Si trattava però di cronache di storia ecclesiastica nelle quai non si parlava dell'antichità (Politis 1998, 1-14).

4 Per gli storici del XIX secolo, Cheronea segnalava la fine dell'antichità e l'inizio di un lungo periodo di servitù (Zakynthynos 1980, 312-328).

5 Korais scrive che due altri fattori hanno contribuito al "risveglio": la partecipazione dei greci al commercio del Mediterraneo e le guerre russo-ottomane del Settecento (*ivi*, 59). Si veda anche, tra gli altri, Iakovakis Rizo-Neroulos il quale ha conservato sentimenti anti-bizantini fino a tardi (Rizo-Neroulos 1827). Nel 1841, nella veste di presidente della Società Archeologica, dichiarava: "La storia bizantina è una lunga e quasi coerente serie di sciocchezze e di violenze oscene [...] è l'esempio vergognoso dell'avvilimento dei Greci" (Gazi 2000, 68). L'ostilità nei confronti di Bizanzio si è prolungata anche dopo la pubblicazione delle opere di Zabelios e di Paparigopoulos. Tra gli altri, Teodoro Manoussi, professore all'Università di Atene, sostenne che la storia bizantina non faceva parte della storia greca mentre il giurista Pavlos Calligas si opponeva all'introduzione del diritto bizantino nel regno di Gracia perché questo avrebbe potuto bloccare la società greca in un passato ormai chiuso (Argyropoulou 2001, 44-47; su Calligas, Masson-Vincourt, 1997).

6 Ho potuto formulare questa ipotesi solo grazie all'eccellente libro di Paraskevas Matalas (Matalas 2002) cui devo molto. Anche il libro di Sia Anagnostopoulou (Anagnostopoulou 1998) mi è stato di grande aiuto.

7 "In altri termini l'antichità deve perdere lo splendore che si vede in essa mentre il periodo di mezzo, levandosi dalla cenere e dal buio deve ritrovare il posto che gli appartiene e nel quale l'ha messo il cristianesimo. Questo lo dobbiamo fare con coraggio senza tener conto di quello che diranno a destra e a sinistra i pedanti, gli antiquari (=οί ἀρχαιολάτραι) e quelli che pensano come gli occidentali (οί δυτικόφρονες)".

8 La storia ecclesiastica, alla quale abbiamo già accennato (nota n. 3), viene "nazionalizzata" in questo periodo. Nel maggio 1849, un articolo del giornale russofilo *Aion* invitava i suoi lettori a studiare "la storia bizantina che voi ignorate senza nessun motivo. [...] Lì [...] troverete sia delle virtù grandi ed uniche sia il destino della nazione" (Matalas 2002, 149).

9 Quarant'anni dopo invece il Patriarcato ha reagito contro l'indipendenza della Chiesa bulgara dichiarandola scismatica.

10 I successori dei vescovi deceduti dovrebbero essere nominati dalla Chiesa autocefala greca e non dal Patriarcato.

11 *Il decreto conciliare ovvero della Verità* fu pubblicato anonimo ma è indubbiamente opera di Pharmakidis.

12 Testo inedito pubblicato da G. Metallinos in *Ellenismo sospeso* (Ελληνισμός μετέωρος, Αθήνα 1992, citato da Matalas 2002, 115).

13 Si veda la serie di articoli pubblicati nel giornale "Aion" sotto i titoli *Antitomos 3*, *Antitomos 4*, *Antitomos 5* il 10, 17 e 21 maggio 1852 (Matalas 2002, 112).

14 Nel 1850 le autorità invitavano gli ateniesi a non procedere al tradizionale "falò dell'ebreo" che si faceva il giorno della Pasqua, e ciò a causa della visita del barone Rotschild. Gli ateniesi reagirono mettendo il fuoco alla casa di Pacifico, un ebreo che aveva la cittadinanza inglese. Il governo di Londra chiese a quello greco un risarcimento. La richiesta fu sostenuta dal blocco del porto del Pireo da parte di alcune navi della flotta.

15 È il caso di Giorgio Athanassiou, traduttore delle opere di Jeremy Bentham e avvocato di Th. Kairis (Athanassiou, 40).

16 L'autore sottolinea che la materia della storia è razionale ed è questo che rende possibile di estrarne le leggi del divenire storico. Altronde (Zabelios 1852, 9) scrive che la conoscenza delle inclinazioni della nazione e delle leggi che hanno governato il suo divenire è indispensabile per la creazione di istituzioni "permanenti, adatte a essa [...] utili" (=διαρκείς, ἰδιορρύθμους ... ἑλληνωφελεῖς).

17 Sul termine "ellenismo", forgiato dallo storico prussiano Gustav Droysen (Droysen 1828) si veda il bello studio di N. Sigalas (Sigalas 2000 e 2001). Ma l'introduzione del termine ha incontrato delle difficoltà. Dionyssios Therianos sostenne che "il termine di ellenismo non possa essere applicato che all'antichità". Therianos, scrive Argiropoulou, "vuole sottolineare che ogni altra applicazione del termine risulta una creazione artificiale e pare voler amalgamare due fenomeni storicamente diversi" (Argiropoulou 2000, 46).

18 Sul tema della dualità nazionale nella storiografia francese Nikolaidis, 2003-2004. Augustin Thierry si ispirava ai romanzi di Walter Scott. Qualcosa di simile alla dualità nazionale francese ed inglese proponeva Alessandro Manzoni nel suo *Discorso sopra alcuni punti di storia longobarda*, 1822. Il tema è presente anche nell'*Adelchi*. Zabelios cita l'*Histroire de la conquête de l'Angleterre par les Normands de ses causes et de ses suites jusqu'à nos jours* di Augustin Thierry in un articolo sulla poesia popolare pubblicato nella rivista francofona "Le Spectateur de l'Orient" (Koubourlis 2000, 124).

19 Zabelios, pubblicando in allegato la prima Costituzione greca, quella del 1822, scrive che la Rivoluzione greca è "la più democratica (δημοτική) al mondo" (Zabelios 1852, 111).

20 Sulla nascita della dialettica nel discorso filosofico si veda Foucault 1997. Sul concetto di "Aufhebung" che Zabelios prende in prestito da Hegel si veda Sigalas, 2001, 26. Hegel utilizza il termine "Aufhebung" dello Spirito, per descrivere il passaggio del umanità da uno stadio all'altro. Zabelios al posto dell'umanità (=lo Spirito) mette l'ellenismo e gli fa attraversare diversi stadi storici.

21 Si doveva evidentemente risolvere prima il problema dei Macedoni. Zabelios sostiene che "la presenza dei Macedoni in Grecia sia stata pensata erroneamente come una conquista, una violenza straniera" (Zabelios 1841, 45). I Macedoni dopo aver domato i "demagoghi" (=ὀχλαγωγοί), si sono alleati al partito democratico che voleva "l'isonomia totale" vale a dire l'unificazione politica della Grecia (*ivi*, 47). Ma riprende anche un' idea di Oikonomos che fu il primo a sottolineare il ruolo dei Macedoni nella storia greca. Essi furono importanti perché estendendo verso Oriente lo spazio in cui si parlava la lingua greca, hanno preparato l'incontro tra l'ellenismo e il cristianesimo (Oikonomos 1844). Zabelios, nel suo linguaggio hegeliano, scrive che i Macedoni hanno lavorato per "universalizzazione" (=καθολίκευσις) dell'ellenismo e il suo incontro con l'Oriente il quale, a partire da Alessandro, ha accettato "la legge storica dell'ellenismo" (Zabelios 1852, 43-44). Quanto al mito di Alessandro dice che ha proposto "il tipo ideale della nazionalità, del coraggio ... l'esempio della regalità suprema (=παμβασιλεία) e della sovranità greca" (*ivi*, 36).

22 Lettera di Oikonomos a K. Euthyvoulis, febbraio1853 (Matalas 2000, 152).

23 Allo stesso spirito di umanesimo cristiano si ispira un altro storico ionico dell'epoca, Ermanno Lunzi (Lunzi 1851, 7).

24 Zabelios prende in prestito da Hegel anche l'idea dell'universalità del messaggio cristiano che ha cancellato il rapporto privilegiato che il popolo ebraico aveva con Dio.

25 La Chiesa è definita come "la legge della comunione et l'uguaglianza politica, del buon ordine e dell'amore armonioso che, sotto forma teologica, fosse rivelata da uno spirito perfetto" (=ὁ ἐν τύποις θεολογικοῖς δια πνεύματος τελείου ἀποκεκαλυμμένος νόμος της συμπολιτείας και ἰσοπολιτείας των ἀνθρώπων, της καθολικής εὐταξίας, της παναρμονίου ἀγάπης) (Zabelios 1852, 116). L'idea che la Chiesa sia una istituzione democratica non è nuova. La ritroviamo in vari movimenti medievali, nel protestantesimo ecc. In Grecia compare in un libro del vescovo dell'Ungheria-Valachia Ignatios (*Apologia contro Neofutos Doukas*, citato da Matalas 2000, 31). L'idea viene ripresa da Pharmakidis: all'inizio la Chiesa era democratica ma è caduta presto sotto la tirannia del Patriarcato ([Pharmakidis] 1852, 176); "Dopo la morte dei discepoli democratici di Cristo l'equilibrio politico fu mantenuto in molte chiese [...] Ma alla fine è venuta la gerarchia episcopale con i Papi e i Patriarchi e la Chiesa da democratica è diventata aristocratica". Zabelios, al contrario sostiene che la Chiesa ha sempre conservato il suo carattere democratico.

26 Zabelios erroneamente pensa che si tratti della cancellazione della servitù. In effetti si tratta di una legge imperiale che proibisce la circoncisione dei servi.

27 Al contrario di Paparigopoulos, il quale, identificando nazione e impero bizantino, pensa che l'Iconoclastia preannunci la Riforma protestante e paragona il suo ispiratore Leone III a Martin Lutero.

28 Per uno studio comparativo delle concezioni di Paparigopoulos e di Zabelios sullo scisma si veda Gounaridis 2007.

29 Il "molto ortodosso" K. Oikonomou viene citato nel cap. 41 intitolato "Costantinopoli diventa sede del Patriarcato" (Zabelios 1852, 206).
L'uso della parola "diplomazia" in senso peggiorativo che rimanda a una cospirazione occidentale contro la Grecia è caratteristica dei milieu russofili dell'epoca.

30 Su Fallmerayer si veda il bel libro di Scopetea (1999) dove l'autrice dimostra che l'obiettivo di Fallmerayer non era altro che mettere in guardia la corte di Vienna sui pericoli dell'espansionismo russo, e sull'eventualità che in Grecia esso trovasse sostenitori.

31 Sul pregiudizio del bulgaro, contadino "non educato" e "barbaro", opposto al greco, mercante e proprietario si veda Matalas 2000, 36-38. Si veda anche il bel libro di Andreas Liberatos (2009).

32 Negli *Studi Bizantini*, pubblicati cinque anni dopo, l'autore insiste molto meno su questo elemento.
33 L'introduzione dei *Canti* fu una sorpresa anche per chi conosceva Zabelios. Il poeta Dionigi Sololomos si chiedeva: "Cosa succede con Spiros? Ha voluto vestire Hegel con vestiti cristiani?".
34 Anche G. Athanassiou condivide in qualche modo questa concezione della nazione. Egli chiede la liberazione di Kairis nel nome della libertà di coscienza ma nello stesso tempo auspica che i cattolici greci si convertano nell'Ortodossia (Athanassiou 1840, 45-46).
35 Certo lo stato greco ha dovuto compiere uno sforzo importante, soprattutto tramite le scuole, per assimilare le popolazioni ortodosse ma non grecofone (Kitromilides 1997).
36 In termini più astratti si direbbe che la nazione non è un dato naturale ma un programma.
37 Zabelios è consapevole che nell'Europa occidentale la religione era già un affare privato. Egli scrive: "questa differenza sostanziale tra la religione nazionale e la religione individuale che contraddistingue l'ortodossia e l'ellenismo dagli altri membri dell'Europa, deve essere anche essa attribuita a tale legge suprema alla quale abbiamo accennato tante volte vale a dire l'isonomia istintiva" (Zabelios 1852, 145).
38 Un altro tentativo di sintesi tra "lo spirito dell'Oriente" e "quello dell'Occidente", ma molto meno riuscito, fu quello di Marco Renieris (Renieris 1853).
39 L'ellenismo è ostile all'individuo. "L'individuo", scrive Zabelios, "per potente che sia non può, in Grecia, soggiogare o sminuire l'entità nazionale a meno di opporsi alla legge inviolabile dell'isonomia, la legge dell'esistenza nazionale" (Zabelios 1852, 148). In un altro luogo del suo testo, lì dove spiega perché i latini hanno fallito nell'introdurre il feudalesimo in Grecia, egli spiega: "Nell'ellenismo, la nazione, la quale è un insieme di lumi, di tradizioni, di memorie indelebili [...] procede dal generale al particolare. Nel barbarismo al contrario, e nell'occidentalismo il quale l'ha accolto, l'io individuale è il punto di partenza, quello che mette in movimento ogni azione sociale: [l'individuo] è tutto". Di conseguenza, il feudalesimo, che è un rapporto tra una persona e un'altra, non ha potuto penetrare in una società, come quella greca, fondata sul primato della collettività e sull'uguaglianza (*ivi*, p. 446).
40 L'isonomia, a dispetto del suo nome, non si limita all'uguaglianza davanti alla legge. In quanto inclinazione nazionale è un concetto molto più largo: "l'isonomia è un'inclinazione istintiva verso la cancellazione di ogni ineguaglianza sociale" (Zabelios 1852, 32). Il suo campo d'applicazione non è soltanto la politica o la religione ma anche la filosofia, le scienze, la poesia, le arti, i mestieri, il commercio; essa agisce in favore "dell'elevazione graduale delle classi inferiori per mezzo dell'aumento e della distribuzione delle ricchezze" (*ivi*, p. 32). Sull'isonomia quale concetto fondamentale del pensiero zabeliano si veda Messimeris 1997.

Bibliografia

Anagnostopoulou S.
1998 *Asia minore XIXe sec.-1919. Le comunità greco-ortodosse. Dal millet dei Romani alla nazione greca* (=Μικρά Ασία, 19ος-1919. Οι ελληνορθόδοξες κοινότητες. Από το Μιλλέτ των Ρωμιών στο Ελληνικό Έθνος) 2a ed., Atene.

Argyropoulou R.
2001 *Les intellectuels grecs à la recherche de Byzance (1860-1912)*, Athens.

Athanassou G.
1840 *Le accuse contro Kairis ovvero la predicazione della verità* (Τα κατά Καΐρην ήτοι κήρυγμα αληθείας), Atene.

Avlami Ch. (ed.)
2000 *L'antiquité grecque au XIXe siècle. Un exemplum contesté?*, Paris, L'Harmattan.

Dimaras K.Th.
1986 *K. Paparrigopoulos* (Κ. Παπαρρηγόπουλος), Atene.

Droysen G.
1828 *Geschichte Alexanders des Grossen*, vol. 1, Geschicte des Hellenismus, Hamburg.

Foucault M.
1997 *Il faut défendre la société*, Paris, Gallimard-Seuil.

Gazi E.
2000 *Scientific National History. The Greek Case in Comparative Perspective (1850-1920)*, Frankfurt, Peter Lang.

Gounaridis P.
2007 *Zabelios e Paparigopoulos sul scisma di Fotio* (=”Ζαμπέλιος και Παπαρηγόπουλος για τα φώτειο σχίσμα”), in “Ta Istorika” (=Τα Ιστορικά), n. 46, 28-46.

Kitromilides P.
1996 *Lumi Neo-ellenici* (=Νεοελληνικός Διαφωτισμός), Atene.
1997 *“Communità imaginarie e le origini della questione nazonale nei Balcan”* (=“Νοερές κοινότητες και οι απαρχές του εθνικού ζητήματος στα Βαλκάνια”), in Veremis.

Korais A.
1803 *Mémoire sur l’État actuel de la civilisation dans la Grèce Lu à la Société des Observateurs de l’homme le 16 Nivôse*, anno XI.

Koubourlis I.
2005 *La formazione della storia nazionale greca. Il contributo di Spyridon Zabelios*, Atene.

Laiou A., Tomadakis N. (eds.)
1980 *Charanis Studies. Essays in honor of Peter Charanis*, New Brunswick, Rutgers University Press.

Liakos A.
1983 *La rifrazione delle idee rivoluzionari nello spazio greco* “(= Η διάθλαση των επαναστατικών ιδέων στον ελληνικό χώρο 1830-1850), in “Ta Istorika” (Τα Ιστορικά), n. 1, 121-144.

Liberatos A.
2009 *Economia, politica e coscienza nazionale. La formazione dei partiti nazionali nel Plovdiv del XIX sec.*(Οικονομία, Πολιτική και εθνική συνείδηση. Η διαμόρφωση των εθνικών κομμάτων στη Φιλιππούπολη του 19ου αιώνα), Iraklion.

Lunzi E.
1851 *Il futuro della nazione greca estratto dal passato* (=Το μέλλον του ἑλληνικού ἔθνους ἐκ του παρεθλθόντος ἐξαγόμενον), Zante.

Masson-Vincourt M-P.
1997 *P. Calligas (1814-1896) et la fondation de l’État grec*, Paris, L’Harmattan.

Matalas P.
2022 *Nazione e Ortodossia. Le avventure di un rapporto. Dallo scisma “greco” a quello bulgaro* (=Έθνος και Ορθοδοξία. Οι περιπέτειες μιάς σχέσης. Από το “ελλαδικό» στο βουλγαρικό σχίσμα), Irakleion.

Mavromoustakou I.
2003 *Lo stato greco 1833-1871. Istituzioni politiche et organizazzione amministrativa* (=Το ελληνικό κράτος 1833-1871. Πολιτικοί θεσμοί και διοικητική οργάνωση), in Panagiotopoulos.

Messimeris St.
1997 *Sp. Zabelios e la “bella individualità” di Hegel* (= “Ο Σπ. Ζαμπέλιος και η ‘ωραία ατομικότης’ του Hegel”), in “Ta Istorika” (Τα Ιστορικά), n. 26, 29-52.

Michalopoulos F.
1950 “Spiridion Zabelios” [= “Σπυρίδων Ζαμπέλιος (1815-1881)” Rivista anglo-ellenica (=Αγγλοελληνική Επιθεώρηση), 5 (Nov.-Dic. 1950), no. 2, 33-45 και no. 3, 109-119 e 128.

Nikolaidis Th.
2004 *La questione delle due nazioni nelle storiografia francese. Da François Hotman fino a Augustin Thierry* (= “Το ζήτημα των δύο εθνών στην γαλλική ιστοριογραφία. Από τον Φρ. Οτμάν στον Αυγ. Τιερρύ”, in “Ta Istorika” (Τα Ιστορικά), n. 39 , 401-434; n. 40, 157-178.

Oikonomos K.
1844 *Sopra i Settanta traduttori dell’Antico Testamento* [=Περί των Ο’έρμηνευτών της Παλαιάς Θείας Διαθήκης, v. 1), Atene

Panagiotopoulos V. (ed.)
2003 *Storia dell’ellenismo moderno v. 4 Lo stato greco 1830-1871. Il focolaio nazionale e l’ellenismo dell’impero ottomano* (=Ιστορία

του νέου Ελληνισμού 1770-2000, v. 4, Το ελληνικό κράτος, 1833-1871. Η εθνική εστία και ο Ελληνισμός της Οθωμανικής αυτοκρατορίας) Atene.

Politis A.
1998 *From Christian Roman emperors to the glorious Greek ancestors*, in Ricks, Magdalino.

[Pharmakidis Th.]
1852 *Il Tomo conciliare ovvero della Verità* (=Ὁ Συνοδικός Τόμος ἢ περί Ἀληθείας), Atene.

Renieris M.
1853 *"Le dualisme grec" in Le Spectateur de l'Orient*, I, 2 (1853), pp. 33-49.

Ricks D., Magdalino P. (eds.)
1998 *Byzantium and the modern Greek Identity*, Aldershot, Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Rizo-Neroulos I.
1827 *Cours de littérature grecque moderne*, Genève, A. Cherbuliez.

Scopetea E.
1999 *Fallmerayer, artifice del metuus hostilis* (=Φαλλμεραϊερ, τεχνάσματα του αντίπαλου δέους), Atene.

Sigalas N.
2000 *Hellénistes, hellénisme et idéologie nationale*, in Avlami.
2001 *Ellenismo ed ellenizzazione. La formazione della nozione neo-greca di "ellenismo"* [="Ελληνισμός και Εξελληνισμός. Ο σχηματισμός της νεοελληνικής έννοιας 'ελληνισμός'", in "Ta Istorika" (=Τα Ιστορικά), n. 34, 3-70.

Veremis Th. (ed.)
1997 *Identità nazionale e nazionalismo nella Grecia moderna* (=Εθνική ταυτότητα κι Εθνικισμός στην νεώτερη Ελλάδα), Atene.

Zabelios Sp.
1852 *Canti popolari della Grecia* (=σματα Δημοτικά της 'Ελλάδος), Corfù.
1857 *Studi bizantini* (=Βυζαντινά Μελετήματα), Atene.

Zakynthinos D.
1980 "Two historical parallels: the Greek nation under Roman and Turkish rule", in Laiou-Tomadakis.

SCAFFALE

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

Michelangelo Borri commenta Johannes Dafinger, Moritz Florin (eds.), *A Transnational History of Right-Wing Terrorism. Political Violence and the Far Right in Eastern and Western Europe since 1900*, London, Routledge, 2022

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723i

Il volume curato da Johannes Dafinger e Moritz Florin raccoglie riflessioni e contributi sviluppati in occasione di un convegno internazionale tenutosi a Erlangen nel 2019. La conferenza, come pure il volume – edito da Routledge nella propria collana dedicata agli studi su fascismo e destre estreme –, era incentrata sulla storia transnazionale della violenza terroristica di estrema destra in Europa, in una prospettiva di lungo sguardo che parte dalle vicende del primo Novecento e si ricongiunge alla contemporaneità. Come anticipato dai curatori nella propria introduzione, il terrorismo di destra rappresenta un fenomeno a sé stante e dalla storia lunga, seppur strettamente legato al fascismo e a credenze ideologiche proprie dell'estremismo di destra.

Partendo da tali premesse, il volume si propone di porre in evidenza il carattere transnazionale del terrorismo di destra, inteso come tratto originario e distintivo del fenomeno: a dispetto delle sue manifestazioni regionali e nazionali, la pratica terroristica sarebbe inevitabilmente frutto della circolazione di assunti ideologici e della cooperazione tra attori diversi, su un piano internazionale. In tale ottica, anche i risultati di attacchi apparentemente circoscritti su un livello locale trascenderebbero spesso i confini nazionali, producendo un'eco in grado di raggiungere, influenzandoli, altri attori della destra estrema, assieme a conseguenze più o meno estese sul piano economico, politico e sociale.

La struttura del testo riflette l'impostazione di partenza e presenta una triplice ripartizione, con una scansione temporale che ripercorre interamente il Novecento.

La prima parte si concentra sulle origini del terrorismo di destra nei primi due decenni del secolo. Il saggio di Vitalij Fastovskij rintraccia nelle rivoluzioni russe del 1905 e 1917 uno dei contesti genetici del fenomeno, frutto di contatti tra gruppi diversi. I contributi di Béla Bodó e Roland Clark si concentrano prevalentemente sull'Europa centro-orientale: il primo con riferimento al caso dell'Ungheria della prima metà del Novecento; il secondo presentando l'ondata di violenza antisemita prodotta nel primo dopoguerra da movimenti universitari ultranazionalisti in Germania, Austria e Romania.

La comparazione dei tre casi di studio, commenta Felicitas Fischer von Weikersthal, pone in evidenza alcune caratteristiche chiave del fenomeno: un'origine non necessariamente riconducibile alla matrice fascista e, anzi, talvolta precedente la comparsa delle prime camicie nere nell'Europa postbellica; l'autopercezione dei terroristi non come antagonisti dello Stato, ma come suoi alleati, contro i "nemici" – veri o presunti – della comunità nazionale. L'analisi, infine, pone in evidenza il carattere multiforme della violenza estremista di destra, che si manifesta in Russia, Ungheria, Germania, Romania e Austria anche in forme diverse rispetto a quella terroristica, dai pogrom al vandalismo, fino ad azioni individuali e attacchi che, oggi, potremmo definire di tipo squadrista.

Nel periodo compreso tra le due guerre mondiali, la presenza di regimi fascisti in Italia, Germania e, poi, Spagna, avrebbe facilitato la nascita di vere e proprie reti terroriste. Questo, in sintesi estrema, quanto evidenziato da Ángel Alcalde in riferimento agli interventi della seconda sezione del volume, dedicata allo sviluppo delle pratiche terroristiche negli anni Trenta. I contributi di Magdalena Gibiec, Mario Jareb, Gayle Brunelle e Annette Finley-Croswhite pongono in evidenza il salto di qualità sperimentato dal terrorismo nero dopo la comparsa del fascismo, con un moltiplicarsi di sigle che, partendo

da aree geografiche circoscritte, arrivano a interessare l'intero continente europeo. In tale contesto, il terrorismo si dimostrò uno strumento fondamentale per innalzare il livello della violenza politica anche in quei paesi, come la Francia, dove la diffusione di organizzazioni paramilitari fasciste non aveva raggiunto livelli tali da minare la stabilità delle istituzioni. In tale fase, l'azione terroristica si indirizza inoltre verso bersagli di alto profilo, come regnanti, ministri o politici, producendo un'eco mediatica davvero internazionale, volta a raggiungere – e influenzare – un pubblico ben più ampio di quello rappresentato dalle singole comunità nazionali.

Tale analisi, avverte Alcade, non deve tuttavia produrre una completa sovrapposizione tra fascismo e terrorismo di destra: mentre le camicie nere europee miravano ancora, in questa fase, a imporre la propria autorità sugli Stati nazionali, il terrorismo trascendeva le frontiere politiche e i confini culturali, legandosi inscindibilmente alla mobilità di idee, pratiche e attori.

La terza e ultima sezione si presenta come la più ampia del volume. I contributi in essa raccolti – firmati da Daniel Koehler, Tobias Hof, Ina Fujdiak, Miroslav Mareš, Graham Macklin, Gideon Botsch e Fabian Virchow – analizzano alcuni aspetti più recenti del fenomeno: partendo dal riemergere del terrorismo di destra nell'Europa del secondo dopoguerra, passando per l'evoluzione conosciuta negli anni della Guerra fredda – spesso, sotto le insegne dell'anticomunismo –, per arrivare, infine, alle sfide poste dalla contemporaneità. Immancabile, in tal contesto, almeno un riferimento al caso italiano, che Hof sceglie di presentare attraverso un'analisi dei riferimenti culturali della gioventù neofascista degli anni Settanta, con particolare attenzione alle filosofie paneuropee di Julius Evola e all'influenza esercitata rispettivamente – in una dimensione di scambi internazionali – dalla Nouvelle Droite francese e dall'opera di John Ronald Tolkien.

Poteva forse inserirsi nella sezione una riflessione complessiva sul ruolo di contrasto al terrorismo giocato dalle istituzioni. In verità, i contributi evidenziano la disponibilità dell'autorità costituita a tollerare la violenza nera nell'Europa di inizio Novecento. Come, pure, l'uso strumentale fatto del terrorismo dagli Stati fascisti degli anni Trenta, per destabilizzare i governi liberali europei. Fino alla collaborazione tra gruppi terroristici e alcuni ambienti governativi nel contesto della Guerra fredda. Tuttavia, sarebbe stato interessante includere nella riflessione anche le risposte elaborate dalle istituzioni statali di fronte alla minaccia terrorista – se e quando riconosciuta come tale, come osservato da Botsch –, sia per quanto riguarda le singole realtà nazionali che, pure, sul piano di una cooperazione internazionale.

Anche alla luce dell'ampiezza e complessità dei temi affrontati – in una prospettiva che abbraccia un secolo e un intero continente –, il volume si presenta in definitiva solido e di indubbio interesse, rappresentando un riferimento imprescindibile per contributi che vogliano indagare nuovi aspetti della violenza politica e del terrorismo di matrice estremista, non solo di destra, in una dimensione transnazionale e propriamente europea.

Michelangelo Borri
E-mail: michelangeloborri92@gmail.com

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

Alberto Malfitano commenta Giulia Albanese (a cura di), *Il "Correre della Sera" e la marcia su Roma*, Milano, Fondazione Corriere della Sera, 2022

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723l

Sotto la guida di Luigi Albertini il "Corriere della Sera" divenne il quotidiano più influente dell'Italia di inizio Novecento. Albertini, direttore dal 1900 al 1925, seppe renderlo non solo il più venduto, scalzando il primato del più progressista "Secolo" nel 1904, ma ne fece anche un organo talmente autorevole da permettergli di influire pesantemente sulle principali vicende della storia italiana di quello scorcio di secolo; in fondo, l'episodio di Albertini come unico civile presente presso il Comando supremo al fianco di Luigi Cadorna, nell'ottobre 1917, quando il generale dovette affrontare le notizie disastrose provenienti dal fronte dopo lo sfondamento di Caporetto, ne dimostra l'importanza e il ruolo svolto nei frangenti più importanti, e in tal caso drammatici, della storia d'Italia.
L'ascesa del quotidiano milanese in autorevolezza e influenze era in realtà iniziata già una decina di anni dopo la sua fondazione allorché, a metà anni Ottanta del XIX secolo, i capitali di Benigno Crespi avevano dato modo al fondatore e primo direttore, Eugenio Torelli Viollier, di investire su mezzi moderni e nuove penne che permisero un'ascesa costante delle copie vendute. Già negli anni Novanta il giornale era uno dei più diffusi d'Italia, ma è indubbio che la nomina di Albertini, a scapito di Luigi Oliva, che aveva appoggiato la violenta repressione di fine secolo contro i moti popolari, aveva avuto l'effetto, sotto la sua sapiente guida e ulteriori investimenti, di fare del "Corriere" il primo quotidiano per vendite e un attore politico di primo piano, fiero nell'avversione ai metodi di governo di Giovanni Giolitti e schierato a favore dell'intervento nella Grande guerra nel 1914-15.
Proprio l'appoggio al fronte che voleva l'entrata in guerra è uno degli elementi messi in luce dalla ricca introduzione di Giulia Albanese al volume edito dalla Fondazione Corriere della Sera e che arricchisce la collana de *Le carte del Corriere*. Per spiegare il rapporto tra il quotidiano e il fascismo rampante vengono qui considerati diversi elementi, tra i quali appunto l'interventismo di Albertini, che impedì a Mussolini di utilizzarlo per screditare il "Corriere", come invece accadeva contro tutti coloro, dai liberali giolittiani ai socialisti, che si erano schierati contro l'entrata in guerra e che obbligò quindi a un rapporto più complesso, in cui il futuro duce dimostrò di saper giocare sapientemente le sue carte con Albertini. Come numerose ricerche sulla storia della stampa italiana hanno dimostrato, il direttore aveva guardato con favore agli esordi violenti delle camicie nere in chiave antisocialista, ma come affrontò il periodo chiave che portò al potere Mussolini, tra l'estate e l'autunno del 1922?
Il volume risponde a questa domanda sulla base di una ricca messe di documenti suddivisi in tre sezioni curate con attenzione da Andrea Moroni, archivista della Fondazione RCS: in tal maniera si ha la possibilità di apprezzare la posizione del giornale a partire dall'agosto di quell'anno quando, dopo il fallimento dello sciopero legalitario indetto dall'Alleanza del lavoro contro le violenze squadriste, cominciò a farsi chiara la volontà di un colpo di mano da parte di Mussolini; vi sono poi gli articoli scelti per descrivere la posizione del "Corriere" nei giorni decisivi prima e dopo la marcia su Roma, ricchi di editoriali così come di pezzi di cronaca, altrettanto importanti se si considera che Albertini, dopo l'affronto mussoliniano di impedire l'uscita del numero del 29 ottobre, decise per alcuni giorni di pubblicare la cronaca delle violenze squadriste in corso. Il divieto di uscita, comunicato ad Albertini dal prefetto, fu un messaggio drammaticamente chiaro per il direttore, che fino a pochi giorni prima aveva auspicato una legalizzazione del

fascismo con l'inserimento in un governo di coalizione e la salvaguardia, almeno formale, delle libertà statutarie. Come la curatrice mette bene in luce, il segno distintivo della linea di Albertini fu in quelle settimane l'ambiguità nei confronti delle camicie nere, di cui non si tacevano le violenze, ma sempre con la speranza che si potesse tornare nell'alveo della legalità, avendo come faro lo Statuto albertino. Era questa una linea tradizionale del quotidiano, ma che in quel frangente eccezionale di sfida mortale alle istituzioni liberali dimostrava l'incapacità di effettuare una analisi corretta della potenzialità eversiva del fascismo nei confronti dello Stato.

Il volume è opportunamente arricchito da brani del diario e del carteggio di Albertini, utili per meglio comprendere i tormenti e le contraddizioni del suo agire in quei drammatici momenti. Una in particolare colpisce per la lucida accusa rivolta dall'autore ad Albertini come a buona parte della stampa italiana dell'epoca e a quella classe liberale che aveva pensato di poter venire a patti con il fascismo. È la lettera che Giuseppe Prezzolini inviò al direttore, con parole chiare di rimprovero, e che lamentava che "troppe volte avete fatto l'apologia del bastone e dei denti aguzzi de fascisti, per potervi oggi lagnare di quello che non è, in somma, che la loro logica conclusione, si noti bene, da molto tempo preannunziata dal fascismo". Per Prezzolini probabilmente ormai tutto il fascismo era inarrestabile, Albertini invece continuò ad appellarsi al rispetto dello Statuto e della legalità, ligio alla tradizione del "Corriere" di affidarsi alla superiorità delle leggi, fondamento della convivenza civile, sopra ogni considerazione politica, ma senza rendersi conto che tentennamenti e contraddizioni avevano ormai consegnato l'Italia nella mani di Mussolini.

Alberto Malfitano
E-mail: alberto.malfitano@unibo.it

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

Dario Marino commenta Ferdinando Petruccelli della Gattina, *Il sorbetto della Regina*, Porfidio Editore, Moliterno (PZ) 2022, pp. 263

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723m

Nel corso dell'Ottocento, il romanzo storico, quale componimento misto di storia e d'invenzione, si affermò in tutta Europa come un genere molto collaudato e familiare anche al pubblico meno colto. D'altra parte, un'epoca affetta da sorta di moderna "malattia storica", avrebbe scritto Nietzsche attribuendo un'ipertrofia del senso storico alla cultura del suo tempo, era avida di narrazioni sul tempo passato, creatrici di miti di grande potenza simbolica. Si trattava di orientarsi in un mondo attraversato da profondi cambiamenti, nel quale la bussola della storia, con le sue affabulazioni più o meno verosimili, legittimava nuovi valori e illuminava il presente, giacché la strada delle "magnifiche sorti e progressive" di quel secolo era pur sempre lastricata da fratture ed incertezze tipiche di una società in piena trasformazione. Non è un caso che queste narrazioni si concentrassero soprattutto sugli avvenimenti considerati fondamentali nel passaggio dal vecchio al nuovo: in Italia, a partire dal medio/tardo Ottocento, questo significava ripensare l'ultradecennale lotta per la libertà inaugurata dall'età delle rivoluzioni e l'accidentato cammino verso l'unificazione. Da allora, la narrativa di tradizione meridionale, con alcuni celebri esempi, non ha mai smesso di interrogarsi sul conflitto politico nel Mezzogiorno preunitario e il consequenziale coinvolgimento del Sud nella rivoluzione nazionale.

Tra i romanzi meno noti di questo genere, risalta *Il sorbetto della regina* di Ferdinando Petruccelli della Gattina, patriota di lunga data e deputato del Regno d'Italia, nonché prolifico e brillante pubblicista di fama europea. Questo romanzo vedeva la luce nel 1872, a dieci anni dalla pubblicazione del pamphlet *I moribondi di Palazzo Carignano*, una sarcastica e moderna galleria di ritratti dei rappresentanti del primo parlamento italiano, che divenne subito un best seller e avrebbe tramandato il nome del giornalista lucano ben oltre il suo tempo. *Il sorbetto della regina*, invece, è un affresco della Napoli borbonica, durante il lungo regno di Ferdinando II, tracciato a partire dalle vicende di Bruto, un giovane studente di medicina che arriva nella capitale dalla lontana provincia di Basilicata. Una storia ricca di riferimenti autobiografici, ma più in generale feconda di richiami alle esperienze di una generazione di patrioti e intellettuali meridionali che si formò negli anni della Restaurazione. Nonostante un discreto successo di pubblico nell'Italia di fine Ottocento, il romanzo fu messo nel dimenticatoio all'inizio del nuovo secolo e la netta stroncatura da parte di Benedetto Croce, che giudicò l'opera come un cumulo di "scempiaggini senza disegno e senza stile", valse solo ad attestarne l'oblio dei decenni successivi. Senza dubbio, la prosa prolissa del romanzo e la sua trama sovraccarica di intrecci esercitano un debole richiamo sul gusto letterario moderno. Tuttavia, a distanza di più di centocinquanta anni, *Il sorbetto della regina* sorprende per la capacità di produrre un ragionamento storico sull'Ottocento meridionale, perché nella finzione letteraria non vi è solo la rappresentazione di una realtà, ma anche il tentativo di spiegarla con un grado di intelligibilità che le scienze sociali conseguono solo di rado e con un certo sforzo immaginativo. La narrazione dà colore alla tela della ricostruzione storica offrendo le dimensioni più seducenti di quel mondo così distante dal nostro, a partire dai sentimenti, gli atteggiamenti e le percezioni di coloro che vissero quell'epoca.

Sono molti i temi storici illuminati dalle vicende dei personaggi di questo romanzo che, con una loro interna coerenza di attitudini, psicologia e credenze, contribuiscono ad una maggiore comprensione del contesto politico e sociale nel Regno delle Due Sicilie durante la Restaurazione. Innanzitutto, il mondo

degli studenti universitari nella capitale. Fino al secolo successivo, la Federico II sarebbe rimasta l'unica università del Mezzogiorno continentale. Le traversie del protagonista del romanzo, Bruto, alle prese con una realtà così diversa dalla quiete del suo paese d'origine, immerso nella rumorosa moltitudine di gente e tipi umani che affollavano i vicoli del centro antico di Napoli, rappresentavano un'esperienza comune ai giovani della borghesia e del notabilato di provincia che, proprio nella società partenopea, iniziavano l'apprendistato alle "battaglie della vita" (p. 32). Per questa generazione di studenti provinciali che, durante la Restaurazione, animeranno l'opposizione al neo-assolutismo borbonico e diverranno classe dirigente nell'Italia unita, Napoli significava la scoperta della politica. Va da sé che questa rivelazione si accompagnava alla dura circostanza di fare esperienza diretta del regime di polizia che preservava l'antico mondo del trono e dell'altare dal libero pensiero e dal contagio rivoluzionario: "la carta di soggiorno, il certificato di aver assiduamente assistito la Congregazione, il biglietto di confessione, le informazioni che il commissario di polizia di tanto in tanto veniva a cercare dai professori, erano tante catene – senza contar le spie – che tenevano lo studente in una camera oscura" (p. 33). In un regno i cui confini apparivano "come le molle di una camiciola di forza" (p. 34), alcune figure, con il loro patrimonio di idee ed esperienze alternative allo spirito del borbonismo politico, testimoniavano la possibilità di futuro diverso per Napoli. Nel cuore di Bruto questa speranza era impersonificata dal maestro di scuola del suo paese, Pietro Colini, soprannominato "sergente Sacco-e-Fuoco", un ex-gesuita che aveva servito l'esercito napoletano nel 1798, per poi arruolarsi nella Grande Armée, partecipando alle guerre del Consolato e dell'Impero. Al colonnello Colini, dopo il 1815, non venne riconosciuta pensione né il grado di sergente che si era guadagnato nell'esercito del re sotto il generale Mack. Invalido per le ferite riportate nella battaglia di Waterloo, Pietro Colini conduceva una modesta vita in provincia e non aveva mai voluto disfarsi della sua uniforme da sergente, in segno di protesta contro un regime che si era dimostrato tutt'altro che paterno nei suoi confronti. All'anziano e dignitoso maestro, con il suo bagaglio di "idee morali, piene di buon senso e senza pregiudizi" (p. 157) è assegnata la funzione di modello positivo del romanzo, spiccando tra i tanti personaggi minori, poveri di spirito e carattere, che danno trama alla narrazione. D'altra parte, i veterani delle guerre napoleoniche, con le loro storie su luoghi lontani e tempi gloriosi, sono un elemento ricorrente nell'immaginario del Mezzogiorno preunitario (compresa l'autobiografia di Carmine Crocco), a dimostrazione che gli anni napoleonici avevano sedimentato un potente patrimonio simbolico nella vita della società meridionale.

Tra i numerosi spaccati di quel mondo, denso di inquietudini e speranze che emergono dal romanzo, un ultimo elemento chiarisce meglio la realtà storica dell'Ottocento meridionale. La ribellione di Bruto contro un regime politico e un sistema di credenze consolidato non inizia da letture, percorsi ideologici o considerazioni razionali. La sua consapevolezza politica principia da ragioni prima di tutto esistenziali, di profonda avversione verso la polizia: "sentiva che questa forza misteriosa si volgeva sempre contro tutto ciò che avesse l'impronta d'una individualità" (p. 88). È il "germe del coraggio morale" (p. 89) a sostenere le sue scelte di vita. La penna di Ferdinando Petruccelli della Gattina, attraverso alcuni personaggi della trama, rimanda più volte ad una sorta di dimensione esistenziale del liberalismo. Un richiamo affine alle riflessioni del grande filosofo liberale Benjamin Constant, secondo il quale la libertà dei moderni, prima ancora che politica ed economica, è soprattutto un problema esistenziale: l'affermazione di tutte le forma di autonomia individuale negate dalle società tradizionali, l'intenso desiderio di scegliere il proprio stile di vita.

Dario Marino
E-mail: damarino@unisa.it

Storia e Futuro
RIVISTA DI STORIA E STORIOGRAFIA ON LINE
n. 57 giugno 2023

Federico Chiaricati commenta Matteo Pretelli, Francesco Fusi, *Soldati e patrie. I combattenti alleati di origine italiana nella Seconda guerra mondiale*, il Mulino, Bologna 2023, pp. 597

DOI: 10.30682/sef5723n

Nel volume di Pretelli e Fusi si intersecano due elementi di importanza centrale nella formazione delle identità transnazionali del XX secolo, cioè guerre e migrazioni. Il tema dei combattenti di origine italiana nell'esercito alleato della Seconda guerra mondiale riassume infatti un processo di costruzione individuale e collettiva di una generazione che fino a quel momento era stata spesso definita in maniera dispregiativa *hyphenated*, in particolare negli Stati Uniti. La partecipazione al conflitto, invece, fu un elemento di rivendicazione della propria americanità o alterità rispetto alle origini della propria famiglia e allo stesso tempo uno strumento per reclamare un posto in quella che sarà successivamente definita la *Greatest Generation*.

Se fino al 1940 le comunità etniche di origine italiana avevano intrattenuto rapporti ambigui con il fascismo, lo scoppio della guerra avrebbe imposto alle seconde generazioni, quelle cresciute proprio tra anni Venti e Trenta, di scegliere per quale patria combattere. Durante la Prima guerra mondiale, infatti, il comune nemico rappresentato dagli imperi centrali aveva facilitato la negoziazione tra identità etnica e americanismo al 100%. In occasione del primo conflitto mondiale i soldati americani di origine italiana, vestiti con le uniformi statunitensi si sentirono per la prima volta chiamare "Americani", in particolare in Francia, e sebbene la comunità etnica fosse ancora considerata *undesirable* poté godere di un clima meno pesante rispetto a quella tedesca. L'ingresso degli eserciti alleati nella Seconda guerra mondiale contro le forze dell'Asse si apriva invece con un rapporto problematico tra le varie comunità etniche e il fascismo che per più di un decennio aveva prodotto numerosi sforzi in una diplomazia culturale o parallela che viaggiava spesso sui binari della propaganda e che negli obiettivi della dirigenza fascista doveva essere il vettore per l'espansione dell'influenza politica e commerciale dell'Italia all'estero. Il clima di generale esaltazione per la costruzione dell'Impero con l'invasione dell'Etiopia si dimostrò comunque di breve durata. L'arruolamento di numerosi giovani di origine italiana nell'esercito alleato (includendo in questo non solo gli italo-americani ma anche italo-britannici, italo-canadesi, italo-australiani e italo-brasiliani) dimostrò infatti come la fedeltà al fascismo fosse molto superficiale e prevalesse maggiormente un legame sentimentale e non politico con la terra dei propri genitori, nella quale continuavano a vivere parenti molto vicini, come nonni, zii o cugini. In un primo momento fu però proprio questa ambiguità a rendere le reclute di origine italiana non totalmente affidabili agli occhi dei vertici dei governi alleati. A queste diffidenze si dovevano poi aggiungere le immagini stereotipizzate della condizione razziale degli italiani, considerati ad esempio nel contesto americano come degli *in-between*, e spesso definiti *not black, nor white*. L'effemminatezza, l'arretratezza culturale e la poca propensione alla disciplina, quindi, furono visti come difetti che impedivano un corretto reclutamento dei cittadini di origine italiana. Questo, agli occhi di coloro che volevano arruolarsi, diventava invece lo stimolo per rivendicare la propria mascolinità e dimostrare di saper combattere come i modelli "guerrieri" bianchi angloamericani.

È nella ricostruzione di storie personali e collettive che il volume mette in evidenza come il ritorno nella terra di origine, spesso più che di ritorno si trattava di una vera e propria prima visita, sollevò interrogativi tra i giovani soldati e comportamenti tra i più disparati. Se alcuni tentarono, alle volte con successo, di andare a trovare i propri parenti o compaesani per (ri)scoprire le proprie radici, altri si recarono nei ter-

ritori di origine anche con un senso di rivincita, mostrando che i figli di coloro partiti decenni prima ora potevano ritornare da liberatori e divenire punti di riferimento della comunità locale. A questo c'era da aggiungere quello che anche nel volume viene definito turismo di "guerra". Per lungo tempo, infatti, l'Italia era stata narrata sia a livello pubblico sia privato, prevalentemente in famiglia, come un luogo pieno di bellezze artistiche e architettoniche. Spesso il piccolo negozio di quartiere aveva appeso alle pareti immagini di chiese, piazze o palazzi che ritraevano il paese da cui proveniva la famiglia proprietaria dell'attività economica e che spesso condivideva le stesse origini di coloro che si recavano nella *grosseria* per i propri acquisti. A queste dinamiche contribuirono poi le pubblicazioni ufficiali del governo americano, con delle vere e proprie guide al "Belpaese".

Allo stesso tempo, la negoziazione tra la lingua parlata normalmente, come l'inglese, e quella dei propri genitori, prevalentemente il dialetto, fu spesso una strategia per intrattenere rapporti amichevoli con le popolazioni e allo stesso tempo sapersene distaccare rivendicando la propria identità di membri di un esercito vittorioso non solo da un punto di vista militare ma anche economico, sociale e culturale. La capacità di parlare dialetto o italiano fu comunque sfruttata come strategia per fare in modo che la lingua della nazione nemica diventasse invece strumento per ricomporre quel legame tra due comunità, quella d'origine e quella della diaspora, che si era spezzato con il deflagrare del conflitto mondiale. Questa abilità, inoltre, di mantenere entrambe le identità fu utilizzata dalle autorità alleate che impiegarono spesso soldati di origine italiana nelle fila dell'Office of Strategic Services e nell'Allied Military Government. È in questo contesto che la condanna del fascismo e di Mussolini, responsabile della guerra al pari di Hitler, insieme alla necessità di creare un legame tra italiani e italoamericani, alimentarono quel processo di deresponsabilizzazione degli italiani a discapito del "cattivo" tedesco, unico colpevole della guerra mondiale.

Di notevole interesse nel volume sono i successivi processi di costruzione della memoria di questi soldati e l'impatto che la guerra ebbe nelle vite di molti di loro. Se alcuni decisero di tornare ripetutamente in Italia, dopo aver riallacciato i contatti con parenti, amici o compaesani, spesso legandosi sentimentalmente a donne del paese d'origine, altri rifiutarono completamente di fare ritorno nella terra dei genitori o nella quale essi stessi erano nati, considerando ormai del tutto recisi i legami o le radici con la penisola. Emergono poi le differenti dinamiche pubbliche della memoria nei vari paesi, in particolare le difficoltà da parte del Brasile, che doveva fare i conti con la complessa eredità della dittatura, che rendeva più spinoso il rapporto con una memoria legata a membri dell'esercito.

In questo volume, in conclusione, la traiettoria dei processi migratori e lo sviluppo dell'identità di una seconda generazione si mescolano con i processi traumatici ma analogamente transnazionali di un conflitto complesso come la Seconda guerra mondiale dove furono sfidate ripetutamente identità individuali e collettive. In questo senso giocarono anche un ruolo importante le categorie di razza, di classe e di genere, oltre che ovviamente quelle generazionali. Da questa esperienza si delinearono poi, più o meno facilmente, processi di costruzione della memoria e di presa di coscienza della propria identità che avrebbero caratterizzato le successive evoluzioni delle identità etniche delle comunità della diaspora italiana.

Federico Chiaricati
E-mail: federico.chiaricati@gmail.com